AGENCY OF AGRICULTURE FOOD AND MARKETS

April 22, 2025

CURRENT RIGHT TO FARM PROTECTION

Attachment A

Broad Overview:

- 1) Solid: Statutory Findings and Purpose, Definitions
- 2) Weak: Statutory Nuisance Protection
 - a) Only a rebuttable presumption
 - b) Farmers have the burden of proof, and must prove their affirmative defense by demonstrating compliance with many ambiguous factors
 - c) Even if the farmer proves the defense, Plaintiff can overcome it
 - d) Results in circular and complicated litigation with many questions of "fact"—which is expensive, time consuming, and promotes uncertainty
- 3) Farm's compliance standard is not defined, so farmers do not know how to comply, and individual neighbors/courts determine the law through court actions/decisions instead of by the legislature establishing an appropriate compliance standard
- 4) Applies to common law private nuisance claims—not applicable to nuisances impacting public health

The Vermont Statutes Online

The Statutes below include the actions of the 2024 session of the General Assembly.

NOTE: The Vermont Statutes Online is an unofficial copy of the Vermont Statutes Annotated that is provided as a convenience.

Title 12: Court Procedure

Chapter 195: Nuisance Suits Against Agricultural Activities

§ 5751. Legislative findings and purpose

The General Assembly finds that agricultural production is a major contributor to the State's economy; that agricultural lands constitute unique and irreplaceable resources of statewide importance; that the continuation of existing and the initiation of new agricultural activities preserve the landscape and environmental resources of the State, contribute to the increase of tourism, and further the economic welfare and self-sufficiency of the people of the State; and that the encouragement, development, improvement, and preservation of agriculture will result in a general benefit to the health and welfare of the people of the State. In order for the agricultural industry to survive in this State, farms will likely change, adopt new technologies, and diversify into new products, which for some farms will mean increasing in size. The General Assembly finds that agricultural activities are potentially subject to lawsuits based on the theory of nuisance, and that these suits encourage and could force the premature removal of the farmlands and other farm resources from agricultural use. It is the purpose of this chapter to protect reasonable agricultural activities conducted on the farm from nuisance lawsuits. (Added 1981, No. 68, eff. May 1, 1981; amended 2003, No. 149 (Adj. Sess.), § 12, eff. June 3, 2004.)

§ 5752. Definitions

For the purpose of this chapter, "agricultural activity" means, but is not limited to:

- (1) the cultivation or other use of land for producing food, fiber, Christmas trees, maple sap, or horticultural and orchard crops; the raising, feeding, or management of domestic animals as defined in 6 V.S.A. § 1151 or bees; the operation of greenhouses; the production of maple syrup; the on-site storage, preparation, and sale of agricultural products principally produced on the farm; and the on-site production of fuel or power from agricultural products or wastes principally produced on the farm;
- (2) the preparation, tilling, fertilization, planting, protection, irrigation, and harvesting of crops; the composting of material principally produced by the farm or to be used at least in part on the farm; the ditching and subsurface drainage of farm fields and the construction of

farm ponds; the handling of livestock wastes and by-products; and the on-site storage and application of agricultural inputs, including lime, fertilizer, and pesticides;

- (3) "farming" as defined in 10 V.S.A. § 6001; and
- (4) "agricultural activities" as defined in 6 V.S.A. § 4802. (Added 1981, No. 68, eff. May 1, 1981; amended 2003, No. 149 (Adj. Sess.), § 12, eff. June 3, 2004; 2021, No. 162 (Adj. Sess.), § 12, eff. June 1, 2022.)

§ 5753. Agricultural activities; protection from nuisance lawsuits

- (a)(1) Agricultural activities shall be entitled to a rebuttable presumption that the activity does not constitute a nuisance if the agricultural activity meets all of the following conditions:
- (A) it is conducted in conformity with federal, State, and local laws and regulations (including required agricultural practices);
 - (B) it is consistent with good agricultural practices;
 - (C) it is established prior to surrounding nonagricultural activities; and
- (D) it has not significantly changed since the commencement of the prior surrounding nonagricultural activity.
- (2) The presumption that the agricultural activity does not constitute a nuisance may be rebutted by a showing that the activity has a substantial adverse effect on health, safety, or welfare, or has a noxious and significant interference with the use and enjoyment of the neighboring property.
- (b) Nothing in this section shall be construed to limit the authority of State or local boards of health to abate nuisances affecting the public health. (Added 1981, No. 68, eff. May 1, 1981; amended 2003, No. 149 (Adj. Sess.), § 12, eff. June 3, 2004.)

§ 5754. Severability

If any provision of this chapter is held invalid, the invalidity does not affect other provisions of this chapter that can be given effect without the invalid provision, and for this purpose, the provisions of this chapter are severable. (Added 2003, No. 149 (Adj. Sess.), § 12, eff. June 3, 2004.)

S.45 AS PASSED BY SENATE (25-5)

Attachment B

Broad Overview of Senate's Proposed Changes:

- Establishes a cognizable compliance standard (farms must follow water quality and pesticide requirements, and practices consistent with proper and accepted customs and standards followed by similar operators in Vermont)
- 2) Provides Plaintiff a "negligent operation" carveout—meaning Plaintiff may still prevail if a farm is compliant but the method of compliance does not conform to standard of ordinary care
- 3) Shifts the burden of proof to Plaintiff—which is standard. (Instead of requiring farmers to broadly prove they did everything right, Plaintiff must prove the farmer is doing something wrong.)
- 4) Expands the nuisance protection to include Trespass
- 5) Effectuates the existing statutory "purpose" language by allowing farms to adapt and change
- 6) Requires Plaintiff to attempt to mediate before filing suit
- 7) Silent on public nuisance

Position:

AAFM supports

21

1	S.45
2	An act relating to protection from nuisance suits for agricultural activities
3	It is hereby enacted by the General Assembly of the State of Vermont:
4	Sec. 1. 12 V.S.A. chapter 195 is amended to read:
5	CHAPTER 195. NUISANCE SUITS AGAINST AGRICULTURAL
6	ACTIVITIES
7	§ 5751. LEGISLATIVE FINDINGS AND PURPOSE
8	The General Assembly finds that agricultural production is a major
9	contributor to the State's economy; that agricultural lands constitute unique
10	and irreplaceable resources of statewide importance; that the continuation of
11	existing and the initiation of new agricultural activities preserve the landscape
12	and environmental resources of the State, contribute to the increase of tourism
13	and further the economic welfare and self-sufficiency of the people of the
14	State; and that the encouragement, development, improvement, and
15	preservation of agriculture will result in a general benefit to the health and
16	welfare of the people of the State. In order for the agricultural industry to
17	survive in this State, farms will likely change, adopt new technologies, and
18	diversify into new products, which for some farms will mean increasing in
19	size. The General Assembly finds that agricultural activities are potentially
20	subject to lawsuits based on the theory of nuisance, and that these suits

encourage and could force the premature removal of the farmlands and other

1	farm resources from agricultural use. It is the purpose of this chapter to protect
2	reasonable agricultural activities conducted on the farm from nuisance
3	lawsuits.
4	§ 5752. DEFINITIONS
5	For the purpose of As used in this chapter;
6	(1) "agricultural activity" means, but is not limited to:
7	(1)(A) the cultivation or other use of land for producing food, fiber,
8	Christmas trees, maple sap, or horticultural and orchard crops; the raising,
9	feeding, or management of domestic animals as defined in 6 V.S.A. § 1151 or
10	bees; the operation of greenhouses; the production of maple syrup; the on-site
11	storage, preparation, and sale of agricultural products principally produced on
12	the farm; and the on-site production of fuel or power from agricultural
13	products or wastes principally produced on the farm;
14	(2)(B) the preparation, tilling, fertilization, planting, protection,
15	irrigation, and harvesting of crops; the composting of material principally
16	produced by the farm or to be used at least in part on the farm; the ditching and
17	subsurface drainage of farm fields and the construction of farm ponds; the
18	handling of livestock wastes and by-products; and the on-site storage and
19	application of agricultural inputs, including lime, fertilizer, and pesticides;
20	(3)(C) "farming" as defined in 10 V.S.A. § 6001; and
21	(4)(D) "agricultural activities" as defined in 6 V.S.A. § 4802.

1	(2) "Generally accepted agricultural practices" mean:
2	(A) the requirements of 6 V.S.A. chapter 215, including permit
3	requirements or requirements of the Required Agricultural Practices;
4	(B) the requirements of the Agency of Agriculture, Food and
5	Markets' Vermont Rule for Control of Pesticides; and
6	(C) practices conducted in a manner consistent with proper and
7	accepted customs and standards followed by similar operators of agricultural
8	activities in the State.
9	§ 5753. AGRICULTURAL ACTIVITIES; PROTECTION FROM
10	NUISANCE LAWSUITS
11	(a)(1) Agricultural activities shall be entitled to a rebuttable presumption
12	that the activity does not constitute a nuisance if the agricultural activity meets
13	all of the following conditions:
14	(A) it is conducted in conformity with federal, State, and local laws
15	and regulations (including required agricultural practices);
16	(B) it is consistent with good agricultural practices;
17	(C) it is established prior to surrounding nonagricultural activities;
18	and
19	(D) it has not significantly changed since the commencement of the
20	prior surrounding nonagricultural activity.

21

under section 5753 of this title due to:

1	(2) The presumption that the agricultural activity does not constitute a
2	nuisance may be rebutted by a showing that the activity has a substantial
3	adverse effect on health, safety, or welfare, or has a noxious and significant
4	interference with the use and enjoyment of the neighboring property No
5	agricultural activity shall be or become a nuisance or trespass when the activity
6	is conducted in accordance with generally accepted agricultural practices.
7	(b) Nothing in this section shall be construed to limit the authority of State
8	or local boards of health to abate nuisances affecting the public health A
9	plaintiff alleging that an agricultural activity is a nuisance or trespass shall
10	have the burden of proving by a preponderance of the evidence that the
11	agricultural activity is not conducted in accordance with generally accepted
12	agricultural practice.
13	(c) The nuisance and trespass protection for an agricultural activity
14	provided for under subsection (a) of this section shall not apply whenever a
15	nuisance or trespass violation results from the negligent operation of an
16	agricultural activity.
17	§ 5754. <u>LIBERAL CONSTRUCTION</u> ; SEVERABILITY
18	(a) This chapter is remedial in nature and shall be liberally construed to
19	effectuate its purposes.
20	(b) An agricultural activity shall not lose the nuisance or trespass protection

1	(1) a change of ownership or a cessation of operation, in whole or in
2	part, of not more than five years;
3	(2) a change of crops produced; or
4	(3) a change of a farming method or conversion of farming practices or
5	agricultural activities to other farming methods, practices, or agricultural
6	activities on a farm.
7	(c) If any provision of this chapter is held invalid, the invalidity does not
8	affect other provisions of this chapter that can be given effect without the
9	invalid provision, and for this purpose, the provisions of this chapter are
10	severable.
11	§ 5755. REQUIRED MEDIATION PRIOR TO SUIT
12	(a) A person shall not bring a court action based on a claim of nuisance or
13	trespass arising from an agricultural activity unless the person and the operator
14	of the agricultural activity, at least once, attempt to resolve through mediation
15	the issue or dispute that the person has concerning operation of the agricultural
16	activity. The mediation shall be conducted according to the provisions of the
17	Uniform Mediation Act set forth in 12 V.S.A. chapter 194.
18	(b) The parties to the mediation may agree upon the use of a mediator to
19	assist in the resolution of the agreed upon issue or dispute, and the parties shall
20	share the cost of the mediator. If the parties to the mediation are unable to
21	resolve the relevant issue or dispute through mediation, the parties may agree

1	to submit the issue or dispute to binding arbitration pursuant to 12 V.S.A.
2	chapter 192 and shall share the cost of the arbitration.
3	(c) A person bringing a court action based on a claim of nuisance or
4	trespass arising from an agricultural activity shall provide the court with a
5	sworn statement of an attempt to resolve the issue or dispute through
6	mediation.
7	Sec. 2. EFFECTIVE DATE
8	This act shall take effect on July 1, 2025.

DRAFT NO. 2.1 BEFORE THE HOUSE JUDICIARY COMMITTEE

Attachment C

Broad Overview of Proposed Changes to the Senate bill:

- 1) Removes Trespass protection
- 2) Defines Nuisance to include some claims that may also lie in Trespass, but excludes water claims from protection
 - a) Contemplates providing limited water protection for 25-year/24-hour flood events or equivalent storms with a 4% annual probability
- 3) Adopts the existing circular standard that allows Plaintiff to overcome nuisance protection by showing a substantial adverse effect on <u>public</u> health and safety
- 4) Adds CAFO compliance requirement
- 5) Adds "good standing" requirement for farms to benefit from nuisance protection

Position:

AAFM supports, but:

- a) AAFM prefers to retain Trespass protection—especially for those activities properly conducted on farms' own land
- b) AAFM believes the additional nuisance "water" language is unnecessary and confusing—particularly if trespass protection is not included and "water" is not included in the nuisance definition
- c) AAFM does not believe the defined trespass protection is likely to result in constitutional "takings," but any potential infirmity can be cured by adding a carveout rather than abandoning the perfectly viable protection
- d) AAFM opposes Plaintiff's ability to overcome <u>private</u> nuisance protection by showing an adverse impact on <u>public</u> health and safety, including because the protection does not cover public nuisances

TO THE	HOUSE	OF REPRI	FSFNTA	TIVES

- The Committee on Judiciary to which was referred Senate Bill No. 45 entitled "An act relating to protection from nuisance suits for agricultural activities" respectfully reports that it has considered the same and recommends that the House propose to the Senate that bill be amended by striking out all after the enacting clause and inserting in lieu thereof the following:
- 7 Sec. 1. 12 V.S.A. chapter 195 is amended to read:
- 8 CHAPTER 195. NUISANCE SUITS AGAINST AGRICULTURAL

9 ACTIVITIES

§ 5751. LEGISLATIVE FINDINGS AND PURPOSE

The General Assembly finds that agricultural production is a major contributor to the State's economy; that agricultural lands constitute unique and irreplaceable resources of statewide importance; that the continuation of existing and the initiation of new agricultural activities preserve the landscape and environmental resources of the State, contribute to the increase of tourism, and further the economic welfare and self-sufficiency of the people of the State; and that the encouragement, development, improvement, and preservation of agriculture will result in a general benefit to the health and welfare of the people of the State. In order for the agricultural industry to survive in this State, farms will likely change, adopt new technologies, and diversify into new products, which for some farms will mean increasing in

1	size. The General Assembly finds that agricultural activities are potentially
2	subject to lawsuits based on the theory of nuisance, and that these suits
3	encourage and could force the premature removal of the farmlands and other
4	farm resources from agricultural use. It is the purpose of this chapter to protect
5	reasonable agricultural activities conducted on the farm from nuisance
6	lawsuits.
7	§ 5752. DEFINITIONS
8	For the purpose of As used in this chapter;
9	(1) "agricultural Agricultural activity" means, but is not limited to:
10	(1)(A) the cultivation or other use of land for producing food, fiber,
11	Christmas trees, maple sap, or horticultural and orchard crops; the raising,
12	feeding, or management of domestic animals as defined in 6 V.S.A. § 1151 or
13	bees; the operation of greenhouses; the production of maple syrup; the on-site
14	storage, preparation, and sale of agricultural products principally produced on
15	the farm; and the on-site production of fuel or power from agricultural
16	products or wastes principally produced on the farm;
17	(2)(B) the preparation, tilling, fertilization, planting, protection,
18	irrigation, and harvesting of crops; the composting of material principally
19	produced by the farm or to be used at least in part on the farm; the ditching and
20	subsurface drainage of farm fields and the construction of farm ponds; the

1	handling of livestock wastes and by-products; and the on-site storage and
2	application of agricultural inputs, including lime, fertilizer, and pesticides;
3	(3)(C) "farming" as defined in 10 V.S.A. § 6001; and
4	(4)(D) "agricultural activities" as defined in 6 V.S.A. § 4802.
5	(2) "Generally accepted agricultural practices" mean:
6	(A) the requirements of 6 V.S.A. chapter 215, including permit
7	requirements or requirements of the Required Agricultural Practices, where
8	applicable;
9	(B) the requirements of an active Concentrated Animal Feeding
10	Operation permit issued under 10 V.S.A. chapter 47, where applicable;
11	(C) the requirements of the Agency of Agriculture, Food and
12	Markets' Vermont Rule for Control of Pesticides; and
13	(D) practices conducted in a manner consistent with proper and
14	accepted customs and standards followed by similar operators of agricultural
15	activities in the State.
16	(3) "Good standing with the State" means a person conducting an
17	agricultural activity that is the basis of a nuisance claim does not have an
18	active, unresolved enforcement violation stemming from the agricultural
19	activity at issue that has reached a final order with the Secretary of Natural
20	Resources or the Secretary of Agriculture, Food and Markets.

1	(4) "Nuisance" means any interference with reasonable use and
2	enjoyment of land, including interference from smoke, odors, particulate
3	matter, dust, noise, or vibration. "Nuisance," as used in this chapter, includes
4	all claims that meet the requirements of this definition regardless of whether a
5	complainant designates a claim as brought in nuisance, negligence, trespass, or
6	any other area of law or equity.
7	Alternative 1 (5) "25-year, 24-hour rainfall event" means a
8	precipitation event with a probable recurrence of once in 25 years as defined
9	by the National Weather Service [in Technical Paper No. 40, "Rainfall
10	Frequency Atlas of the United States," May, 1961] or an equivalent federal,
11	regional, or State rainfall probability.
12	Alternative 2 (5) "Annual exceedance probability" means the
13	likelihood, expressed as a percentage, that a flood of a certain size or larger
14	will occur in any given year as determined by the U.S. Geological Survey, the
15	National Weather Service, or other relevant federal, regional, or State entity.
16	§ 5753. AGRICULTURAL ACTIVITIES; PROTECTION FROM
17	NUISANCE LAWSUITS
18	(a)(1) Agricultural activities shall be entitled to a rebuttable presumption
19	that the activity does not constitute a nuisance if the agricultural activity meets
20	all of the following conditions:

1	(A) it is conducted in conformity with federal, State, and local laws
2	and regulations (including required agricultural practices);
3	(B) it is consistent with good agricultural practices;
4	(C) it is established prior to surrounding nonagricultural activities;
5	and
6	(D) it has not significantly changed since the commencement of the
7	prior surrounding nonagricultural activity.
8	(2) The presumption that the agricultural activity does not constitute a
9	nuisance may be rebutted by a showing that the activity has a substantial
10	adverse effect on health, safety, or welfare, or has a noxious and significant
11	interference with the use and enjoyment of the neighboring property No
12	agricultural activity shall be or become a nuisance when the activity is
13	conducted in accordance with generally accepted agricultural practices.
14	(b)(1) Nothing in this section shall be construed to limit the authority of
15	State or local boards of health to abate nuisances affecting the public health. In
16	order to assert nuisance protection under this chapter, a person conducting an
17	agricultural activity shall demonstrate that the person is in good standing with
18	the State. A person may demonstrate good standing by providing letters of
19	good standing to a court from the Secretary of Agriculture, Food and Markets,
20	the Secretary of Natural Resources, or both secretaries, as relevant to the
21	nuisance claim.

1	(2) A plaintiff alleging that an agricultural activity is a nuisance shall
2	have the burden of proving by a preponderance of the evidence that:
3	(A) the agricultural activity at issue is not entitled to the nuisance
4	protection provided for under subsection (a) of this section because the
5	agricultural activity is not conducted in accordance with generally accepted
6	agricultural practice; and
7	(B) if the plaintiff proves the agricultural activity is not entitled to
8	nuisance protection under subsection (a) of this section, the required elements
9	of their nuisance claim.
10	(c) The nuisance protection for an agricultural activity provided for under
11	subsection (a) of this section shall not apply whenever:
12	(1) a nuisance violation results from the negligent operation of an
13	agricultural activity; or
14	(2) the agricultural activity has a substantial adverse effect on public
15	health and safety.
16	(d) The nuisance protection provided for under subsection (a) of this
17	section shall not affect the right of any person to recover for any injuries or
18	damages sustained by the person due to an agricultural activity:
19	(1) polluting waters of the State or groundwater; or

1	Alternative 1 (2) causing runoff to or flooding of the person's land
2	unless the runoff or flooding was caused by a 25-year, 24-hour or larger
3	rainfall event.
4	Alternative 2 (2) causing runoff to or flooding of the person's land
5	unless the runoff or flooding was caused by a flood event with an annual
6	exceedance probability of four percent or lower.
7	(e) This chapter shall not restrict or impede the authority of the State to
8	protect the public health, safety, environment, or welfare.
9	§ 5754. <u>LIBERAL CONSTRUCTION</u> ; SEVERABILITY
10	(a) This chapter is remedial in nature and shall be liberally construed to
11	effectuate its purposes.
12	(b) An agricultural activity shall not lose the nuisance protection under
13	section 5753 of this title due to:
14	(1) a change of ownership or a cessation of operation, in whole or in
15	part, of not more than five years;
16	(2) a change of crops produced; or
17	(3) a change of a farming method or conversion of farming practices or
18	agricultural activities to other farming methods, practices, or agricultural
19	activities on a farm.
20	(c) If any provision of this chapter is held invalid, the invalidity does not
21	affect other provisions of this chapter that can be given effect without the

1	invalid provision, and for this purpose, the provisions of this chapter are
2	severable.
3	§ 5754a. REQUIRED MEDIATION PRIOR TO SUIT
4	(a) A person shall not bring a court action based on a claim of nuisance
5	arising from an agricultural activity unless the person and the operator of the
6	agricultural activity, at least once, attempt to resolve through mediation the
7	issue or dispute that the person has concerning operation of the agricultural
8	activity. The mediation shall be conducted according to the provisions of the
9	Uniform Mediation Act set forth in chapter 194 of this title.
10	(b) The parties to the mediation may agree upon the use of a mediator to
11	assist in the resolution of the agreed upon issue or dispute, and the parties shall
12	share the cost of the mediator equally or according to an agreement between
13	the parties. If the parties to the mediation are unable to resolve the relevant
14	issue or dispute through mediation, the parties may agree to submit the issue or
15	dispute to binding arbitration pursuant to chapter 192 of this title and shall
16	share the cost of the arbitration.
17	(c) A person bringing a court action based on a claim of nuisance arising
18	from an agricultural activity shall provide the court with a sworn statement of
19	an attempt to resolve the issue or dispute through mediation.
20	Sec. 2. EFFECTIVE DATE
21	This act shall take effect on July 1, 2025.

(Draft No. $2.1 - S.45$)	
4/9/2025 - MOG - 8:59	AM

Page 9 of 9

1		
2		
3		
4		
5	(Committee vote:)	
6		
7		Representative
8		FOR THE COMMITTEE

		*	