

State of Vermont Department of Labor 5 Green Mountain Drive P.O. Box 488 Montpelier, VT 05601 labor.vermont.gov

[telephone] [fax] 802-828-4301 802-828-4046

$\mathbf{M} \mathbf{E} \, \mathbf{M} \, \mathbf{O} \, \mathbf{R} \, \mathbf{A} \, \mathbf{N} \, \mathbf{D} \, \mathbf{U} \, \mathbf{M}$

TO:	House Committee on Commerce and Ecoomic Development
	House Committee on Education
	Senate Committee on Economic Development, House and General Affairs
	Senate Committee on Education
FROM:	Vermont Department of Labor
DATE:	January 19, 2024
SUBJECT:	Report on Recommended Changes to Apprenticeship Language in Act 55
	of 2023

Section 2 of Act 55 of 2023 requires the Department of Labor (Department) to submit a written report "identifying the work completed with the Office of Racial Equity, including any recommended changes to the apprenticeship program and any suggestions for legislative action."

During the 2023 legislative session, testimony in the House Committee on Appropriations and the House Committee on Education raised some concerns about youth apprenticeship, a new concept introduced in the Act, and the potential impacts of youth apprenticeship on the education system. Though the Act does not formally require the Department to report back on these concerns, the Department committed to reviewing the provisions on youth apprenticeship with education partners and return with recommended changes. In that vein, this memorandum includes recommended improvements to the language in the youth apprenticeship section. Since the passage of Act 55, the Federal Office of Apprenticeship has released a 779 page "Notice of Proposed Rulemaking" (NPR) that would update the Federal regulations governing the National Apprenticeship System. While we expect the regulations that were presented in the NPR to change, we are proposing to modify dates for the strategic plan, required in Act 55, to create alignment with what is proposed in the new rules. The proposed dates in the NPR are unlikely to change.



RECOMMENDED CHANGES TO EQUITY LANGUAGE AND PROVISIONS

Between July 1, 2023, and January 13, 2024, the Department of Labor and the Office of Racial Equity met multiple times to review and discuss the language in the Act. The Department appreciates the time both Xusana Davis and Jay Greene spent reviewing the language of the law and commenting on and making suggestions to improve and clarify its equity provisions.

The table below provides a high-level overview of recommended changes to the law – including the specific section, the original text, the proposed text to replace the original text, and the rationale used to make the recommendation.

Section	Text Review	Rationale
§ 1111. DEFINITIONS (22) Nontraditional	<i>Original:</i> "Nontraditional apprenticeship population" means a group of	Adding further clarification that "nontraditional population" is referring to people who are
apprenticeship population	individuals, such as individuals from the same gender, race, or ethnicity, the members of which comprise fewer than 25 percent of the program participants in an apprenticeable	historically excluded from certain occupations or from access to apprenticeships.
	 occupation. Change: "Nontraditional population" means 	
	a group of individuals that have been historically excluded from various occupations, such as individuals	
	from the same gender, race, or ethnicity the members of which comprise fewer than 25 percent of the program participants in an	
§ 1111. DEFINITIONS	apprenticeable occupation. <i>Original:</i>	Add a benchmark year to the
S IIII. DEI INITIONS	"Nontraditional apprenticeship industry or occupation" refers to an	definition to assist with measuring progress.



(23) Nontraditional apprenticeship industry or occupation § 1111. DEFINITIONS (33) Underserved	industry sector or occupation that represents fewer than 10 percent of apprenticeable occupations or the programs under the national apprenticeship system. Change: "Nontraditional apprenticeship industry or occupation" refers to an industry sector or occupation that represents fewer than 10 percent of apprenticeable occupations or the programs as of 2023 under the national apprenticeship system. <i>Original:</i> "Underserved communities" means	Removed "communities" reference to older age and former
communities	the populations sharing a particular characteristic, as well as geographic communities, who have been systematically denied a full opportunity to participate in aspects of economic, social, and civic life. This term includes individuals who belong to communities of color, such as Black and African American, Hispanic and Latino, Native American, Alaskan Native and Indigenous, Asian American, Native Hawaiian and Pacific Islander, Middle Eastern, and North African persons. It also includes individuals who belong to communities that face discrimination based on sex, sexual orientation, and gender identity, including lesbian, gay, bisexual, transgender, queer, gender non-	incarceration to clarify. ORE was concerned that the broad use "rural areas" limits the ability to define specific populations that face systemic barriers to accessing apprenticeship programs. ORE suggested adding additional clarifying language like "lacking access to public transportation" to highlight a specific barrier for people who live in rural areas, and "lack of access to high-speed internet" to highlight a barrier to different types of work, and parts of some registered apprenticeship program's related instruction. Research revealed that the definition of "persistent" poverty requires a year of year (or period



conforming, and nonbinary (LGBTQ+ persons); persons who face discrimination based on pregnancy or pregnancy-related conditions; parents; and caregivers. It also includes individuals who belong to communities that face discrimination based on their religion and disability; first-generation professionals or first generation college students; individuals with limited English proficiency; immigrants; individuals who belong to communities that may face employment barriers based on older age or former incarceration; persons who live in rural areas; veterans and military spouses; and persons otherwise adversely affected by persistent poverty, discrimination, or inequality. Individuals may belong to more than one underserved community and face intersecting barriers. Change: "Underserved communities" means

"Underserved communities" means the populations sharing a particular characteristic, as well as geographic communities, who have been systematically denied a full opportunity to participate in aspects of economic, social, and civic life. This term includes individuals who ... may face employment barriers based on older age or former incarceration; persons who live in over period) analysis. U. S. Census analysis comparing 1989 to 2019 revealed there are no communities in "persistent" poverty in Vermont, which makes making the term irrelevant to any work the Department would perform.

Persistent Poverty: Identifying Areas With Long-Term High Poverty (census.gov)

ORE also raised the question of how statute defines rurality or even a rural area.

Each Department or Agency, or even specific programs may have slightly different ways of defining rurality or rural areas.

The Department does not believe these topics should be defined in just the apprenticeship section of the law. The State should have a broader discussion about how to define these terms that would provide a consistent approach to understanding poverty and underserved communities.

The Department may adopt a definition using rule-making authority provided under Act 55. We will need to modify apprentice registration forms and our data systems in order to collect the voluntary demographic



	rural areas and, for example, may	information in this definition and
	1 5	others.
	lack access to transportation options,	others.
	or to high-speed internet, Veterans	
	and military spouses; and persons	
	otherwise adversely affected by	
	poverty, discrimination, or	
	inequality.	
§ 1113 VERMONT	Original:	ORE did not review or make
REGISTERED	(e) Strategic planning and	recommendations related to the
APPRENTICESHIP	reporting. The Vermont Registered	strategic plan. The Department is
PROGRAM	Apprenticeship Program shall:	recommending changing the
(e) Strategic planning	(1) develop and disseminate a	language so that the strategic plan
and reporting	strategic plan once every five years,	timeline aligns with a Notice of
und reporting	beginning on July 1, 2024;	Proposed Rulemaking from the
	(2) prepare and submit to the	federal Office of Apprenticeship.
	Vermont General Assembly an	While those proposed rules may
	annual report on the status of the	change, the requirement for a
	Vermont Registered Apprenticeship	strategic plan, and the timing of
	Program on or before December 1 of	submission of that plan to the
	each year that includes:	Office of Apprenticeship is unlikely
	(A) general program statistics,	to change. Our suggested change
	including a list of programs by	would help to clarify a need for an
	county;	implementation plan for what was
	(B) an analysis of apprentices in	passed in Act 55 and would assist
	the program disaggregated by age,	the Department to focus on
	race, sex, gender identity, New	implementation and laying the
	American status, birthplace, Veteran	groundwork for further expansion
	status, disability, industry, and	of the program.
	education status, including	
	participation in career and technical	In the "analysis of apprentices"
	education;	section:
		ORE and the Department
	(C) nontraditional occupations	discussed the use of both sex and
	by gender and race;	gender. We should keep both and
		will need to update our data
		system and forms to collect both,
L		system and forms to concer bour,



Change: (e) Strategic planning and reporting. The Vermont Registered Apprenticeship Program shall: (1) develop and disseminate a strategic plan once every four years, beginning July 1, 2026, with an interim plan covering two years, beginning on July 1, 2024 that addresses how the program will implement statutory requirements of 21 V. S. A. chapter 13; (2) prepare and submit to the Vermont General Assembly an annual report on the status of the Vermont Registered Apprenticeship Program on or before December 1 of each year that includes: 	which will be voluntary disclosures. ORE recommends using a term other than "new American status" as it is not well defined, and its use does not help us understand the needs of the population. ORE recommends and the Department agrees that this should be changed to "language access needs," which is expansive and includes people who were born deaf or who communicate using sign language in addition to those who speak a language other than English as their primary language and who may have barriers due to that fact.
Vermont General Assembly an annual report on the status of the Vermont Registered Apprenticeship Program on or before December 1 of each year that includes:	deaf or who communicate using sign language in addition to those who speak a language other than English as their primary language and who may have barriers due to



§ 1114. VERMONT	Original:	ORE recommends, and the
APPRENTICESHIP	The Board shall:	Department supports, adding two
ADVISORY BOARD		
		_
ADVISORY BOARD (c) Duties Page 17	 Receive and review reports from the Department regarding provisional and registered apprenticeship programs, including programs under development and program deregistration proceedings. Advise the Department on the creation of new apprenticeable occupations. Advise the Commissioner on requests for ratio variances. Advise the Department on policies and procedures developed by the Department and on adoption of rules. Provide technical guidance for identifying and promoting best practices in operating apprenticeship programs. Create and convene working groups that are tasked with specific activities related to improving the quality, safety, diversity, and alignment of apprenticeship programs. Working group membership is not limited to appointed members of the board and shall be selected and serve at the discretion of the Chair. Change: Add: Make any recommendations 	additional requirements for the apprenticeship advisory board. ORE developed and made the Equity Impact Assessment Tool available for agencies, department, boards and other parts of state government: ORE - Equity Impact Assessment Tool
	with an equity lens to ensure the	



	registered apprenticeship program addresses barriers to participation	
	 and completion for underserved populations. (8) Strengthen relationships with community partners that serve underserved populations and historically marginalized communities who have not previously accessed apprenticeship programs or who face systemic 	
	barriers to participation as evidenced by a disproportionate lack of participation in apprenticeship programs.	
§ 1119. APPRENTICES REGISTERED; AGREEMENT	Original: (c) An apprenticeship agreement shall contain: (1) the names and signatures of the apprentice, the program sponsor or employer, and of a parent or guardian of the apprentice if the apprentice is a minor; (2) the date of birth and Social Security number of the apprentice; Change: (c) An apprenticeship agreement shall contain: (1) Optional fields for: (A) the Social Security Number of the	ORE recommends, and the Department agrees, that this section should be reorganized to add clarification about which fields on the agreement are required and which are optional. We recommend creating a sub- bullet for "optional fields" and a sub-bullet for "required fields," and further clarifying that the Social Security Number (SSN) and demographic characteristics are optional. From an equity standpoint, we do not want to exclude people without an SSN from apprenticeships due to listing providing SSN as a requirement under statute.
	(B) demographic characteristics(2) Required fields for:	Requiring an SSN will disproportionately affect people



apprentice, the program sponsor or employer, and of a parent or	depending on immigration status, and some people may prefer not to share their SSN with the
apprentice is a minor; (2) the date of birth of the apprentice; (xx) to conform to the federal Equal Employment Opportunity Act of 1972, 42 United States Code, Chapter 21, subchapter VI, for affirmative action compliance in apprenticeship programs, and for compliance with reporting and analysis of the Vermont Registered Apprenticeship program, the voluntary disclosure of the apprentice's race, color, national origin, place of birth, sex, gender,	apprenticeship program. Federal law requires that the person be legally authorized to work in the US - something the employer would check (I-9) before they employ the person as an apprentice. We should specify that here or make reference to any apprenticeship program requirements that may be adopted by the Federal government. Adding those subsections will mean the numbering in the rest of the section will need to be addressed. Other items that we
language spoken, genetic information, Veteran status, and disability status (xx) a statement that the apprentice will be accorded equal opportunity in all phases of apprenticeship employment and training, without discrimination because of race, color, national origin, place of birth, sex, gender, sexual orientation, age, primary language spoken, genetic information, Veteran status, and disability status.	recommend changing have "xx" next to them until their new number is determined. The Department recommends adding "and for compliance with reporting and analysis of the Vermont Registered Apprenticeship program" to current numbered item "12," And further aligning the demographic characteristics listed in currently numbered items "10" and "12" with other sections of the law.



§ 1125. CAREER PATHWAY ALIGNMENT WITH APPRENTICESHIP PROGRAMS

Original: (3) The Program shall provide necessary technical assistance, training, and support to sponsors to promote the adoption of preapprenticeship programs for individuals with disabilities, refugees, individuals for whom English is not the primary spoken language, adults with limited literacy and numeracy skills or who do not have a high school diploma or equivalent, and other groups who are excluded from access to highwage careers and participation in the registered apprenticeship system because they do not meet the minimum qualifications established in standards of apprenticeship.

Change:

3) The Program shall provide necessary technical assistance, training, and support to sponsors to promote the adoption of preapprenticeship programs for individuals with disabilities, refugees, individuals with language access needs, adults with limited literacy and numeracy skills or who do not have a high school diploma or equivalent, and other groups who are excluded from access to careers with wages above the median in the state and participation in the registered apprenticeship system ORE recommended that "high wage careers" be better described. The Department agrees and proposes to replace "high wage careers" with "access to careers with wages above the median in the state." The median wage is a common reference point in labor market information and in our reporting to the Federal government. The VDOL/McClure Foundation report "Vermont's most promising jobs" uses the state median wage (\$22.55/hr.) as a reference point for the jobs presented in the report.

ORE did not recommend that we change "individuals for whom English is not the primary spoken language," however, for the sake of consistency across chapter 13, the Department is suggesting it be changed to "individuals with language access needs."



because they do not meet the	
minimum qualifications established	
in standards of apprenticeship.	

UPDATE REGARDING YOUTH APPRENTICESHIP

When this section was included in Act 55, it was in whole, borrowed from language in the National Apprenticeship Act.¹ Since the passage of Act 55, the Apprenticeship Director has participated in national events on the topic of youth apprenticeship and has discussed the model with several other state directors in states that have a youth apprenticeship program.

Between July and November 2023, the Apprenticeship Director and the Director of Workforce Development met with the Office of Apprenticeship's technical assistance provider, American Institutes for Research (AIR), to help the Department plan and convene a stakeholder meeting to hear various perspectives on the program, as written in Act 55.

On November 7, 2023, the Department convened 18 stakeholders in a three-hour session where we explored youth apprenticeship in Act 55, heard from states like Maryland and North Carolina who are leaders in youth apprenticeship, and discussed concerns and opportunities in Act 55. The partners in the session included the Agency of Education (with subject matter experts on flexible pathways, work-based learning, CTE, and AEL), HireAbility, representatives from high schools and CTE centers, and sponsors of registered apprenticeship programs.

The primary concern of stakeholders was understanding how all of the partners would work together, how to raise interest in schools and employers, and in creating several working examples before rolling out the program state-wide. The consensus of the stakeholders was for the Department to create several 1-year pilot programs around the state to learn what is needed for programs to be implemented and scaled-up. For instance, those needs are different in rural versus urban areas, the needs vary by different occupational areas (e.g., electrical vs. nursing vs. wastewater treatment specialist), and even within the different structures of CTE programs (e.g., part- vs full-day).

Pilots would allow multiple versions of a youth apprenticeship program to happen while the process is being developed and revised, so that we could collaboratively create a standard program structure built around the CTE system's structure in Vermont. The Department, with input from Apprenticeship Advisory Board, which has specialized membership, would create

¹ See 21 V.S.A. § 1124.

policies and guidance, and develop training to support school staff and administrators in safely and successfully administering youth apprenticeship programs across the state in two years.

Section	Text Review	Rationale
§ 1124. YOUTH	Original:	ORE reviewed the language in (a)
APPRENTICESHIP	(a) A youth apprenticeship	and raised a concern that the
PROGRAMS	program is one that prepares a	language excluded home study
	youth apprentice for acceptance	students, which can be a population
	into an apprenticeship program	of students in need of additional
	and is designed for youth	consideration. More expansive
	apprentices who start the	language would be to address those
	program while still enrolled in	who have not completed secondary
	high school.	school and who are enrolled in a state
	(b) A youth apprenticeship	approved educational program (e.g.,
	program may be registered by	public or private high school, CTE,
	the Department after submitting	home school, Community High
	the following information:	School, High School Completion
	(1) a written plan that	Program). By way of the definition of
	articulates the work processes	a youth apprentice, this section only
	and how a youth apprentice will	addresses 16- and 17-year-olds.
	receive supervised work	The Department agrees with this
	experience and on-the-job	change, and, at least for the next few
	training or training in an	years, recommends further defining
	experiential setting;	eligibility to be those students who
	(2) how time spent by a	are enrolled in CTE programs.
	youth apprentice in each major	F - O
	work process will be spent or	
	that specifies how competencies	The remaining changes are made at
	or proficiencies are aligned	the Department's recommendations
	between their high school	to clarify roles and processes,
	education and the youth	encourage collaboration and
	apprenticeship program, and	partnership between sending schools
	that states which graduation	and CTE centers, and to ensure that,
	requirements will be met;	to the extent the youth apprenticeship
		program is a career preparation



(3) a description of the	program, the Department's array of
mentoring that will be provided	funding resources could be used to
to the youth apprentice;	support the program.
(4) a description or timeline	The Department is also
explaining the periodic reviews	recommending adding requirements
and evaluations of the youth	for programs to provide assurances
apprentice's performance on the	that the partners in the program are
job and in related technical	aware of labor laws that would apply
instruction;	to the program.
(5) a process for	
maintaining appropriate	
progress records, including the	
reviews and evaluations;	
(6) a description of related	
classroom-based instruction,	
which may be fulfilled through	
dual or concurrent enrollment in	
secondary or post-secondary	
courses;	
(7) whether and how the	
program is aligned with high	
school diploma requirements	
and career clusters;	
(8) whether the program	
meets the related technical	
instruction requirements for an	
apprenticeship program;	
(9) if a program includes	
paid work, a progressively	
increasing, clearly defined	
schedule of wages to be paid to	
the youth apprentice as skills are	
mastered;	
(10) how the program	
prepares the youth apprentice	
for placement in further	
r	



education, employment, or an	
apprenticeship program; and	
(11) the terms by which the	
program grants advanced	
standing or credit to individuals	
applying for the youth	
apprenticeship with	
demonstrated competency or	
acquired experience, training, or	
skills.	
Change:	
(a) A youth apprenticeship	
program is one that prepares a	
youth apprentice for acceptance	
into an apprenticeship program	
and is designed for youth	
apprentices who have not	
completed secondary education,	
but whom are in educational	
programs approved by the	
Agency of Education, and who	
are enrolled in a CTE program at	
a regional CTE center.	
(b) A youth apprenticeship	
program may be registered by	
the Department after a regional	
CTE center submits the	
following information, which	
shall be developed in	
partnership with apprenticeship	
sponsors for specific	
occupational areas and sending	
high schools:	
(1) a written plan that	
articulates the work processes	



and how a youth apprentice will	
receive supervised work	
experience and on-the-job	
training or training in an	
experiential setting;	
(2) how time spent by a	
youth apprentice in each major	
work process will be spent or	
that specifies how competencies	
or proficiencies are aligned	
between their high school	
education and the youth	
apprenticeship program, and	
that states which graduation	
requirements will be met;	
(3) a description of the	
mentoring that will be provided	
to the youth apprentice;	
(4) a description or timeline	
explaining the periodic reviews	
and evaluations of the youth	
apprentice's performance on the	
job and in related technical	
, instruction;	
(5) a process for	
maintaining appropriate	
progress records, including the	
reviews and evaluations;	
(6) a description of related	
classroom-based instruction,	
which may be fulfilled through	
dual or concurrent enrollment in	
secondary or post-secondary	
courses;	
(7) whether and how the	
program is aligned with high	



school diploma requirements	
and career clusters;	
(8) whether the program	
meets the related technical	
instruction requirements for an	
apprenticeship program;	
(9) if a program includes	
paid work during or outside the	
school year and outside the	
school day, a progressively	
increasing, clearly defined	
schedule of wages to be paid to	
the youth apprentice as skills are	
mastered;	
(10) how the program	
prepares the youth apprentice	
for placement in further	
education, employment, or a	
registered apprenticeship	
program;	
(11) a statement of advanced	
standing that specifies the terms	
by which participating	
employers in the program will	
grant advanced standing or	
credit to students who are	
interested in transferring to full	
apprenticeship registration upon	
completion of the youth	
apprenticeship program;	
ADD:	
(12) an accounting of costs	
for the program, covered by the	
participating partners, grants, or	
other sources of funds; and,	



(13) assurances that school	
staff, employer partners, and	
others involved in the program	
are aware of protections	
provided to youth in child labor	
law, wage and hour laws, the	
provisions of youth	
apprenticeship in this chapter,	
and any implementing	
regulations developed by the	
Department.	

End of Report

