Justice Reinvestment Initiative in Vermont

Presentation to the Vermont Legislature

Results of the Racial Equity in Sentencing Analysis

January 6, 2022

Sara Bastomski, Research Manager
David D’Amora, Senior Policy Advisor
Madeleine Dardeau, Senior Policy Analyst
Angela Gunter, Senior Research Associate
Lorretta Sackey, Policy Analyst
We are a national nonprofit, nonpartisan organization that combines the power of a membership association, serving state officials in all three branches of government, with policy and research expertise to develop strategies that increase public safety and strengthen communities.

How We Work

• We bring people together
• We drive the criminal justice field forward with original research
• We build momentum for policy change
• We provide expert assistance

Our Goals

• Break the cycle of incarceration
• Advance health, opportunity, and equity
• Use data to improve safety and justice
A data-driven approach to improve public safety, reduce corrections and related criminal justice spending, and reinvest savings in strategies that can decrease crime and reduce recidivism.

The Justice Reinvestment Initiative is supported by funding from the U.S. Department of Justice’s Bureau of Justice Assistance (BJA) and The Pew Charitable Trusts.
Overview

1. Introduction
2. Analytic Approach
3. Results
4. Policy Recommendations
5. Next Steps
National research indicates that while racial disparities in incarceration have declined since 2000, they remain a persistent and pervasive feature of the U.S. criminal justice system.

Nationally, Black people are 5 times more likely to be incarcerated in state prison than White people.

Nationally, Black people are 7 times more likely to be incarcerated in federal prison than White people.

Incarceration for drug offenses is one area in which disparities are particularly pronounced nationally.

Though rates of drug use and sales are similar for Black and White people, Black people are arrested 3–4 times more frequently than White people for drug offenses.

Nationally, Black people are up to 9 times more likely to be incarcerated in state prison for drug offenses, relative to White people.

National research shows that differences in sentencing outcomes are one important driver of such disparities.

A large body of work documents that Black defendants, on average, are more likely to receive harsher sentences, *relative to comparable White defendants*.

While this difference varies by type of crime and jurisdiction, it is typically found to be statistically significant.

As shown in past CSG Justice Center analysis, Black people are disproportionately represented in all corrections populations in Vermont.

Vermont DOC Snapshot Populations by Type and Race, FY2019

- **Detained**
  - Black: 14%, (65) 1,150
  - White: 6%, (49) 353

- **Sentenced**
  - Black: 9%, (113) 1,110
  - White: 5%, (65) 788

- **Parole**
  - Black: 6%, (49) 1,319
  - White: 14%, (65) 3,595

- **Furlough**
  - Black: 3%, (140) 1,319
  - White: 9%, (113) 1,319

- **Probation**
  - Black: 3%, (140) 3,595
  - White: 5%, (113) 3,595

Prior to August 2020, DOC did not collect data on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race; as a result, this snapshot may underrepresent the proportion of the Vermont corrections population that would identify as Hispanic.

*In 2019, Black people accounted for about 1.4 percent of Vermont’s general population.*

CSG Justice Center analysis of data from the Vermont Department of Corrections; U.S. Census Bureau, Annual Estimates of the Resident Population by Sex, Age, Race, and Hispanic Origin, April 1, 2010 to July 1, 2019.
Specifically, Black people are over 6 times more likely to be incarcerated in Vermont, relative to White people.

Vermont DOC Snapshot Populations by Type and Race, FY2019

- Detained: 14%, (65) Black, 9%, (113) White
- Incarceration: 1,150 total, 353 Black, 807 White
- Sentenced: 9%, (113) Black, 6%, (75) White
- Parole: 5%, (75) Black, 6%, (131) White
- Furlough: 3%, (40) Black, 3%, (140) White
- Probation: 3%, (140) Black, 3%, (865) White

Prior to August 2020, DOC did not collect data on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race; as a result, this snapshot may underrepresent the proportion of the Vermont corrections population that would identify as Hispanic.

*In 2019, Black people accounted for about 1.4 percent of Vermont’s general population.
Black people are also disproportionately incarcerated for drug offenses relative to Vermont’s total sentenced population.

Vermont DOC Sentenced Incarceration Snapshot Population by Offense Type for Black Vermonters and Non-Vermonters FY2019

- **Total Sentenced Population (1,318)**
  - 72%

- **Black Vermont Residents (89)**
  - 75%
  - Violent: 10%
  - Property: 9%
  - Motor Vehicle: 5%
  - Drug: 4%
  - Other/Unknown: 1%

- **Black Non-Vermont Residents (21)**
  - 67%
  - Violent: 19%
  - Property: 5%
  - Motor Vehicle: 5%
  - Drug: 5%
  - Other/Unknown: 5%
Stakeholder engagement throughout Justice Reinvestment II also highlighted the need for a more in-depth analysis of racial disparities in Vermont.

• For example, stakeholders have frequently reported to CSG staff a perception that any racial disparities in Vermont’s criminal justice system - particularly for drug offenses – are due to crimes committed by people from out-of-state.

• As such, any identified racial disparities do not reflect the unequal treatment of Vermonters by the state’s criminal justice system.
Racial disparities in the criminal justice system compound at each decision-making point and are driven by a number of system factors.

- Statutes
- Policies and Practices
- Implicit and Explicit Bias
- Use of Discretion


This analysis strategically focuses on disparities in sentencing that can be addressed by policy and practice changes within the criminal justice system.

Specifically, it examines three key decision-making points in the Vermont court system.

- **Analysis question 1:** Are there racial disproportionalities in the volume of felony and misdemeanor cases filed?
- **Analysis question 2:** Are there racial disparities in conviction across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?
- **Analysis question 3:** Are there racial disparities in incarceration sentences across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?
The primary data source for this analysis is the Vermont Judiciary, with additional information from the Department of Public Safety.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source</th>
<th>Judicial System (Criminal Division)</th>
<th>Department of Public Safety</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Timeframe</td>
<td>2014–2019</td>
<td>Lifetime records</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective</td>
<td>Examine case processing and sentencing outcomes by race (including conviction, incarceration, and incarceration length)</td>
<td>Develop criminal history measure for sentencing analysis.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It is important to note that this analysis focuses on disparities at sentencing between **Black and White** defendants only.

This is the result of two primary limitations:

**Sample Size**
- The methods used in this analysis require a minimum sample size. Other racial and ethnic groups in the initial dataset did not contain enough individuals for an appropriate sample size.

**Data Availability**
- The Vermont Judiciary does not receive data from law enforcement on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race. Prior to August 2020, DOC also did not collect data on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race. As a result, the data used for this analysis likely underrepresents the proportion of people who would identify as Hispanic, which limits any conclusions regarding Hispanic disparities in Vermont’s criminal justice system.
The analytic sample includes 79,570 individual cases of which 6 percent are Black and 94 percent are White.

**Defendant Characteristics (N = 79,570)**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>White</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Race</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>94%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Female</td>
<td>28%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Male</td>
<td>72%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residence at Case Filing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vermont</td>
<td>91%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out-of-State</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average Age at Case Filing</td>
<td>34.4 years</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CSG Justice Center staff used two quantitative methods to examine racial disparities in sentencing in Vermont.

**Relative rate index**
- Method used to examine whether different groups experience an outcome at similar rates
- Often used to compare justice system trends (e.g., incarceration rates)

**Regression analysis**
- Statistical method for examining the relationship of one variable to another and assessing group differences
- Helps determine what factors do or do not play a role in any observed differences
Overview

1. Introduction
2. Analytic Approach
3. Results
4. Policy Recommendations
5. Next Steps
Relative Rate Index Results

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disproportionalities in the volume of felony and misdemeanor cases filed?

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disparities in conviction across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disparities in incarceration sentences across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?
A relative rate index (RRI) compares events or outcomes between groups.

By using RRI, we can calculate the rate at which Black people are represented at a point in the justice system and then compare that rate to White people at the same point.

In 2019, Black people are 3.5x more likely to be defendants in misdemeanor cases than White people.

An RRI over “1” indicates disproportionality.
In Vermont, Black people are disproportionately represented as defendants in misdemeanor cases relative to White people.

These results are not adjusted for additional case or defendant characteristics. 

*CSG Justice Center analysis of Vermont’s Judiciary disposition data*
Similarly, Black people are disproportionately represented as defendants in felony cases relative to White people.

These results are not adjusted for additional case or defendant characteristics.

N = 16,960
Specifically, Black people were over 14 times more likely than White people to be defendants in a felony drug case each year.

These results are not adjusted for additional case or defendant characteristics.

N = 16,960

CSG Justice Center analysis of Vermont’s Judiciary disposition data
Regression Results

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disproportionalities in the volume of felony and misdemeanor cases filed?

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disparities in conviction across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disparities in incarceration sentences across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?
Regression analysis makes it possible to compare outcomes between two groups, after accounting for group differences.

By using regression, we can account for key observable differences—such as type of offense and Vermont residential status—to make an “apples to apples” comparison between Black and White defendants.

Before regression

After regression

Results expressed as percentage points
Using regression, this analysis examined three case processing outcomes.

Likelihood of conviction
- Alternatives include case dismissal or acquittal

Likelihood of “straight” incarceration (if convicted)
- Alternatives include sentences to probation, pre-approved furlough, a split sentence, or a suspended or deferred sentence

Length of incarceration (if sentenced to incarceration)
- Outcome examined in cases for which a minimum and maximum sentence were available.
The regression analysis controls for important case and defendant characteristics.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Characteristics</th>
<th>Defendant Characteristics</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Offense type/severity</td>
<td>Race</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(For most severe offense filed)</td>
<td>Sex</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total charges filed</td>
<td>Age</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Disposition year</td>
<td>Vermont resident or out-of-state resident (At case filing)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>County</td>
<td>Criminal history*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*In addition to the main analysis results presented, we ran a secondary set of analyses that restricted the data to Vermont residents only and accounted for all control variables listed here as well as defendants’ in-state criminal history. Criminal history information was analyzed for Vermont residents only and therefore could not be accounted for in the main analysis, which includes data from both Vermont residents and out-of-state people. Results from secondary analyses will be available in our accompanying report.
To provide rigorous results, CSG Justice Center staff completed two complementary sets of regression analyses.

This presentation focuses on the primary results of the analysis. Secondary results are shown only when they were substantively different from those in the primary analyses.

**Primary Results**
- ✓ Vermont and out-of-state residents
- ✓ Accounts for all control variables, except for criminal history

**Secondary Results**
- ✓ Vermont residents only
- ✓ Accounts for all control variables and in-state criminal history

*Comprehensive results from secondary analyses will be available in our accompanying report.*
CSG Justice Center staff examined outcomes across 10 offense categories; however, this presentation only presents offenses where a statistically significant Black-White difference was identified.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Offense Category</th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Person</td>
<td>Felony Person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Property</td>
<td>Felony Property</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Drug</td>
<td>Felony Drug</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Motor Vehicle</td>
<td>Felony Motor Vehicle</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Public Order</td>
<td>Felony Public Order</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Misdemeanor and felony weapons cases were excluded because there were too few cases to analyze.*
Results of conviction analysis indicate that this particular decision-making point is not a major driver of Black-White incarceration disparities.

These results are adjusted for the case and defendant characteristics summarized earlier and are statistically significant.

N=79,514

CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.

Results here are mixed: Black people are more likely to face conviction for misdemeanor drug offenses, but less likely to face conviction for four other offense categories.

These results do not substantively change when the analysis is restricted to Vermont residents only and accounts for criminal history.
Analysis question: Are there racial disproportionalities in the volume of felony and misdemeanor cases filed?

Analysis question: Are there racial disparities in conviction across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?

Analysis question: Are there racial disparities in incarceration sentences across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?
After adjusting for key characteristics, Black people are more likely to face incarceration for certain felony offenses.

Probability of Incarceration by Offense Type and Race 2014–2019

These results do not substantively change when the analysis is restricted to Vermont residents only and accounts for criminal history.

*These results are adjusted for the case and defendant characteristics summarized earlier and are statistically significant.

N=49,594
CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.
In particular, Black people are more likely to be incarcerated for felony drug and property offenses.

N=49,594
CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.

These results do not substantively change when the analysis is restricted to Vermont residents only and accounts for criminal history.
For felony drug cases in which a Black defendant is sentenced to incarceration, the most common top filed charge is cocaine possession or sales.

**Most Common Felony Drug Offenses, by Defendant Race**
For Cases Resulting in Incarceration (N=565)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>White Defendants (N=436)</th>
<th>Freq. (Pct.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Heroin—possession 200 mgm or more</td>
<td>63 (15%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroin—sale less than 200 mgm</td>
<td>52 (12%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroin—sale or delivery 200 mgm or more</td>
<td>46 (11%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cocaine—possession 2.5 gm or more</td>
<td>31 (7%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cocaine—sale less than 2.5 gm</td>
<td>30 (7%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Black Defendants (N=129)</th>
<th>Freq. (Pct.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cocaine—possession 2.5 gm or more</td>
<td>30 (24%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cocaine—sale less than 2.5 gm</td>
<td>21 (16%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroin—trafficking</td>
<td>17 (13%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroin—sale less than 200 mgm</td>
<td>16 (12%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Heroin—possession 1 gm or more</td>
<td>7 (5%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.
Regression Results

**Case Inflow**

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disproportionailities in the volume of felony and misdemeanor cases filed?

**Conviction**

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disparities in conviction across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?

**Incarceration Sentence Length**

**Analysis question:** Are there racial disparities in incarceration sentences across offense types, after accounting for key case and defendant characteristics, including Vermont residency and criminal history?
After examining the 10 offense categories detailed above, we did not find any consistent, statistically significant Black-White differences in incarceration sentence length.

These results are restricted to Vermont residents only and are adjusted for case and defendant characteristics summarized, as well as criminal history.

Minimum Incarceration Sentence Length in Days for Felony Property Offenses by Race Adjusted for Criminal History, 2014—2019

N=10,062 Source: CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.
Analysis results indicate that there are observable and substantively important Black/White disparities in contact with criminal courts and sentencing outcomes in Vermont.

Overrepresentation in criminal cases:
• Results show that Black people in Vermont, on average, are overrepresented in criminal court cases. In 2019, Black people in Vermont were 3.5 times more likely to be defendants in a misdemeanor case and 5.9 times more likely to be defendants in a felony case.

Conviction:
• Results of conviction analysis indicate that this particular decision-making point is not a major driver of Black-White incarceration disparities.
Analysis results indicate that there are observable and substantively important Black/White disparities in contact with criminal courts and sentencing outcomes in Vermont.

**Incarceration (In/Out Decision)**
- Results show that on average, Black people are more likely to face incarceration for four offense categories. The disparity for felony drug and property cases is particularly pronounced: Black people are 18 percentage points more likely to face incarceration in such cases, relative to White people.

**Incarceration (Sentence Length)**
- There was no evidence that suggests there is a Black/White disparity in minimum incarceration sentence length imposed, in Vermont.
These results provide key insights that Vermonter can use to adjust criminal justice policies and practices to improve racial disparities.

In Vermont, Black people are 6 times more likely to be incarcerated, relative to White people.

Disparities are present in the cases coming to Vermont courts: annually, Black people are over 14 times more likely to be a defendant in a felony drug case and over 7 times more likely to be a defendant in a person case, relative to White people.

Once before the court, Black people are not more likely to be convicted, for most offenses, or sentenced to longer incarceration terms for any offense. Importantly, however, there are statistically significant racial disparities in who receives an incarceration sentence, particularly for felony property and drug offenses.

These results do not change when we examine only Vermont residents and account for criminal history, indicating that racial disparities at sentencing exist independent of these two factors.
Overview

1. Introduction
2. Analytic Approach
3. Results
4. Policy Recommendations
5. Next Steps
Informed by the results of this analysis, Vermont can enact targeted reforms that address the cumulative impact of racial disparities at sentencing.

The following recommendations address disparities at sentencing identified in this analysis by focusing on criminal justice system factors that can be changed within the system itself.
Recommendation: Apply a race equity lens to the reclassification of drug offenses.

Key Vermont Findings:

- In 2019, Black people were over 14 times more likely than White people to be defendants in a felony drug case each year.
- After adjusting for case and defendant characteristics, Black defendants are more likely to be incarcerated for a felony drug offense than White defendants.
- This finding mirrors national trends indicating that despite similar rates of drug use and sales for Black and White people, Black people are more likely to be arrested and incarcerated for drug offenses.

Recommendation:

Vermont is currently considering a classification structure for drug offenses. The state should utilize the results of this analysis to apply a racial equity lens to the classification process for drug offenses by

- Reclassifying lower-to-mid level felony drug possession offenses to misdemeanors; and
- Reevaluating the threshold of the highest level of possession and sales to better reflect significant amounts of drugs intended for distribution.
Several states have reclassified drug possession from a felony to a misdemeanor.

Five states have reclassified all possession offenses to a misdemeanor—regardless of amount—up to the third conviction. Two of these states have seen significant reductions in racial disparity.

In California, Proposition 47 (2014) implemented changes to felony sentencing laws, which included the reclassification of drug offenses. It has contributed to substantial reductions in racial disparities in arrests, jail bookings, and incarceration.

Oregon reclassified drug possession from a felony to a misdemeanor in House Bill 2355 (2017). Since this law’s implementation, there has been a 61 percent decrease in racial and ethnic disparities in felony convictions.

In Vermont, statutory sentencing guidance seems to have ensured that there are no racial disparities in misdemeanor or felony probation term lengths.

The Council of State Governments Justice Center analysis of disposition data from the Vermont Judiciary. 28 V.S.A. § 205.

The Council of State Governments Justice Center | 45
**Recommendation:** Establish non-binding sentencing guidance or presumptive probation for certain drug and property offenses.

**Key Vermont Findings:**
- Black defendants are more likely to be incarcerated for certain felony offenses, including property or drug offenses.
- Non-binding statutory sentencing guidance seems to have ensured that there are no racial disparities in misdemeanor or felony probation term lengths in Vermont. This is in-line with research indicating that sentencing guidelines reduce racial disparities by providing structure to inform judicial discretion.

**Recommendation:**
To address racial disparities in incarceration for felony drug and property offenses for similarly situated defendants, Vermont should pursue either non-binding sentencing guidance or presumptive probation for certain offenses to inform discretion related to incarceration decisions.

In addition to statutory changes, there are other ways Vermont could begin to understand and address racial disparities at sentencing.

**Recommendation:** Identify racial disparities in diversion and pretrial services.
- Studies have found that Black, Indigenous, and People of Color (BIPOC) are often less likely to receive diversion than White people.
- Vermont should require the collection and reporting of race and ethnicity data in the Attorney General’s Pretrial Services and Court Diversion Report, as well as in any other statewide diversion programs, for the purpose of identifying and addressing disparities in program access and use by county.

**Recommendation:** Develop internal guidance to increase consistency in charging and plea-bargaining decisions within state’s attorneys’ offices.
- Ninety-nine percent of cases in Vermont are resolved through the plea-bargaining process.
- State’s attorneys should explore the use of internal guidance to increase consistency in charging and plea-bargaining decisions. Guidance should focus on when and what to charge, particularly for drug-related cases, as well as provide a framework for guiding discretion during the plea-bargaining process.
- To monitor implementation of internal guidance, offices should regularly collect and examine charging and plea-bargaining data as well as consider establishing a process for internal review prior to charging.
Vermont faces ongoing challenges related to the collection, analysis, and use of racial disparity data.

Data-related recommendations include:

• Expand availability of Hispanic ethnicity data to law enforcement and the courts.
• Invest in staffing and system improvements necessary to increase future data collection and analysis capacity.
• Collect and analyze sentencing data statewide, as well as by judicial district.
• Identify opportunities to publish racial disparity data, including an annual report to benchmark and monitor progress.
• Engage impacted communities in the collection of quantitative and qualitative data, as well as the development and implementation of racial disparity related policy changes.
• Use data and community engagement to inform judicial training to support consistent decision making.
These recommendations are strategic, data-driven ways Vermont can begin to create a more equitable criminal justice system.

However, the sentencing disparities identified in this analysis are only one driver of racial disparities in incarceration in Vermont.

Two additional efforts will help Vermont address disparities at other points in the system:

1. The Office of Racial Justice Statistics proposed by the Racial Disparities in the Criminal and Juvenile Justice System Advisory Panel (RDAP)

2. The Vermont Justice Reinvestment Initiative: Reducing Violent Crime by Improving Justice System Performance project through the Department of Public Safety, Vermont Network Against Domestic and Sexual Violence, and CSG Justice Center
Thank You!

Join our distribution list to receive updates and announcements:

https://csgjusticecenter.org/resources/newsletters/

For more information, please contact Madeleine Dardeau mdardeau@csg.org or Lorretta Sackey at lsackey@csg.org

This project was supported by Grant No. 2015-ZB-BX-K002 awarded by the Bureau of Justice Assistance. The Bureau of Justice Assistance is a component of the Department of Justice’s Office of Justice Programs, which also includes the Bureau of Justice Statistics, the National Institute of Justice, the Office of Juvenile Justice and Delinquency Prevention, the Office for Victims of Crime, and the SMART Office. Points of view or opinions in this document are those of the author and do not necessarily represent the official position or policies of the U.S. Department of Justice.

© 2021 The Council of State Governments Justice Center

Cover photo credit: J. Stephen Conn
Additional Results
As shown in past CSG Justice Center analysis, Black people are disproportionately represented in all corrections populations, especially among people who are incarcerated.

Relative Rate Indices: Vermont DOC Snapshot Populations by Type and Race, FY2019

Prior to August 2020, DOC did not collect data on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race; as a result, this snapshot may underrepresent the proportion of the Vermont corrections population that would identify as Hispanic.
Of particular relevance to our new analysis, Black people are **6 times** more likely to be incarcerated in Vermont, relative to White people.

Prior to August 2020, DOC did not collect data on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race; as a result, this snapshot may underrepresent the proportion of the Vermont corrections population that would identify as Hispanic.
As shown in previous CSG Justice Center analysis, without controls for crimes or criminal history, Black people appear to receive incarceration for misdemeanors more often.

### Misdemeanor Case Dispositions By Race, FY2015–FY2019*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Incarceration</th>
<th>Split</th>
<th>Probation</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>37%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>27%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black</td>
<td>29%</td>
<td>1%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>38%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other</td>
<td>44%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>33%</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown</td>
<td>54%</td>
<td>0%</td>
<td>35%</td>
<td>11%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*The Vermont Judiciary does not collect data on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race; as a result, this snapshot may underrepresent the proportion of people who would identify as Hispanic.

Note that this analysis does not control for factors that might explain the sentencing pattern, such as the severity of the crimes or the criminal history of the people being sentenced.
Without controls for crimes or criminal history, Black people appear to receive incarceration for felonies more often.

Felony Case Dispositions by Race, FY2015–FY2019*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Race</th>
<th>Incarceration</th>
<th>Split</th>
<th>Probation</th>
<th>Other</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>White (5,695)</td>
<td>53%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>42%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black (414)</td>
<td>69%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>27%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other (99)</td>
<td>70%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unknown (321)</td>
<td>38%</td>
<td>3%</td>
<td>57%</td>
<td>1%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note that this analysis does not control for factors that might explain the sentencing pattern, such as the severity of the crimes or the criminal history of the people being sentenced.

*The Vermont Judiciary does not collect data on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race; as a result, this snapshot may underrepresent the proportion of people who would identify as Hispanic.

CSG Justice Center analysis of disposition data from the Vermont Judiciary.
There was no variation found in length of probation terms or minimum and maximum incarceration sentences by race.

- Statutory guidance seems to have ensured that there is no variation in average probation lengths for felony and misdemeanor offenses by race.

- Median lengths for felony incarceration sentences are also consistent across demographics.

- Note that this analysis did not control for factors such as the severity of the crimes or the criminal history of the people being sentenced.*

*In addition, the Vermont Judiciary does not collect data on Hispanic ethnicity separate from race; as a result, this snapshot may underrepresent the proportion of people who would identify as Hispanic.
For misdemeanor cases, average incarceration sentence lengths vary by type of offense.

These results are not adjusted for additional case or defendant characteristics.

Misdemeanor Cases: Median Minimum Incarceration Sentence Length (Days), By Race 2014-2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Black</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Person</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Property</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Drug</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Motor</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Public Order</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

N = 6,423
Source: CSG Justice Center analysis of Vermont Judiciary disposition data
Similarly, for felony cases, average minimum incarceration sentence lengths vary by type of offense.

These results are not adjusted for additional case or defendant characteristics.
For felony property cases in which a Black defendant is sentenced to incarceration, the most common filed charges are burglary and forgery.

### Most Common Felony Property Offenses, by Defendant Race

For Cases Resulting in Incarceration (N=1,120)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>White defendants (N=1,046)</th>
<th>Freq. (Pct.)</th>
<th>Black Defendants (N=74)</th>
<th>Freq. (Pct.)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Burglary</td>
<td>363 (35%)</td>
<td>Burglary</td>
<td>15 (20%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Grand larceny greater than $900</td>
<td>186 (18%)</td>
<td>Forgery-utter/publish an instrument</td>
<td>12 (16%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Buy, receive, sell, possess, conceal stolen property greater than $900</td>
<td>119 (11%)</td>
<td>Burglary into an occupied dwelling</td>
<td>9 (12%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Burglary into an occupied dwelling</td>
<td>114 (11%)</td>
<td>Larceny from a person</td>
<td>9 (12%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Forgery-utter/publish an instrument</td>
<td>105 (10%)</td>
<td>Buy, receive, sell, possess, conceal stolen property greater than $900</td>
<td>8 (11%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.
After adjusting for key characteristics, differences in the likelihood of conviction for Black versus White defendants vary by type of offense.

These results do not substantively change when the analysis is restricted to Vermont residents only and accounts for criminal history.

Relative Rate Indices: Probability of Conviction by Offense Type and Race
2014–2019

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Offense Type</th>
<th>Relative Rate Index (RRI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Property</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Drug</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Motor Vehicle</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Public Order</td>
<td>0.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felony Drug</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*These results are adjusted for the case and defendant characteristics summarized earlier and are statistically significant. Only statistically significant differences are displayed above.

N=79,514

CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.
However, Black people are more likely to face conviction for misdemeanor drug offenses.

Black people are **1.3 times** more likely to face conviction for misdemeanor drug offenses.

These results do **not** substantively change when the analysis is restricted to Vermont residents only and accounts for criminal history.

*These results are adjusted for the case and defendant characteristics summarized earlier and are statistically significant. Only statistically significant differences are displayed above.

N=79,514

CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.
After adjusting for key characteristics, Black people are more likely to face incarceration for one misdemeanor and three felony offenses.

These results do not substantively change when the analysis is restricted to Vermont residents only and accounts for criminal history.

*These results are adjusted for the case and defendant characteristics summarized earlier and are statistically significant.

N=49,594

CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.
In particular, Black people are more likely to be incarcerated for felony drug offenses.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Offense Type</th>
<th>Relative Rate Index (RRI)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Misdemeanor Person</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felony Property</td>
<td>1.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felony Drug</td>
<td>1.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Felony Public Order</td>
<td>1.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*These results are adjusted for the case and defendant characteristics summarized earlier and are statistically significant.

N=49,594
CSG Justice Center analysis of VT Judiciary disposition data.

Black people are \textbf{1.6} times more likely to be incarcerated for felony drug offenses. These results do not substantively change when the analysis is restricted to Vermont residents only and accounts for criminal history.