Keep menthol cigarettes in a flavored tobacco ban

Andrea Villanti, PhD, MPH
Vermont Center on Behavior and Health
University of Vermont
February 17, 2021
Andrea Villanti, PhD, MPH
Associate Professor
Vermont Center on Behavior and Health
Department of Psychiatry
Larner College of Medicine
University of Vermont

- Funding from NIH, FDA, and HRSA.
- No other financial relationships to disclose.
- No industry funding; no off-label medications use discussed
- The content is solely the responsibility of the authors and does not necessarily represent the official views of the National Institutes of Health or the Food and Drug Administration.

http://www.med.uvm.edu/behaviorandhealth/home
Key points re: menthol and flavored tobacco products

• Menthol cigarettes and flavored tobacco products facilitate youth initiation and progression to regular tobacco use.

• Menthol cigarettes impede adult smoking cessation.

• Banning menthol and flavors in tobacco/e-cigarette products would reduce the number of tobacco users and thereby benefit public health.
Flavors and tobacco initiation/progression

- Highest prevalence of current flavored tobacco/e-cigarette use in youth, followed by young adults
- Among new users, highest prevalence of first flavored tobacco/e-cigarette use in youth, followed by young adults
- First use of a flavored tobacco product associated with use a year later in all age groups
- First use of a menthol/mint cigarette or cigar associated with later use in youth and young adults
Prevalence of use of flavored tobacco use among current users - United States, 2013-2014

Figure 1. Prevalence of current flavored tobacco use in the full sample and among current tobacco users, by age; Population Assessment of Tobacco and Health, 2013–2014.¹

¹Percentages are weighted to represent the U.S. population.
Among new users, first use of flavored tobacco is higher among youth and young adults than adults.

First flavored tobacco use is associated with subsequent use in all age groups

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>First flavored use (Wave 1)</th>
<th>Youth (12-17)</th>
<th>Young adults (18-24)</th>
<th>Adults (25+)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cigarettes</td>
<td>p12m, p30d</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Menthol</td>
<td>p12m, p30d</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any cigars</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E-cigarettes</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hookah</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Any smokeless</td>
<td>p30d</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
<td>Current regular</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

First flavored tobacco use is associated with subsequent **DAILY** use of menthol cigarettes and flavored e-cigarettes.
Initiation and progression: Menthol/mint cigarettes AND cigars

• New use of menthol cigarettes was associated with greater past 12-month cigarette use in young adults
• New use of menthol/mint-flavored cigars was associated with greater past 30-day cigar use in youth and young adults compared to non-menthol use.

Do you think it should be illegal for all tobacco products to be sold in flavors such as menthol, clove, chocolate, candy, and fruit?

- **Yes**: 47%
- **No**: 27%
- **Don't know**: 25%

Wave 5, December 2020; n = 220 Vermont youth ages 12-17
Impact of flavored tobacco policies on tobacco use
Effect of FDA’s flavored cigarette ban on youth tobacco use (2009)

• Flavored cigarette ban, exempting menthol cigarettes
  – Reduced youth cigarette use overall
  – BUT increases in youth menthol cigarette use, cigar use, pipe use

“The results suggest the 2009 flavored cigarette ban did achieve its objective of reducing adolescent tobacco use, but effects were likely diminished by the continued availability of menthol cigarettes and other flavored tobacco products.”

Short-term effect of Ontario menthol cigarette ban on adult smoker behavior (2017)

- **Use non-menthol cigarettes only**: Expected reaction (60%) vs. Actual reaction at 1-month (50%)
- **Use alternative flavored tobacco products**: Expected reaction (20%) vs. Actual reaction at 1-month (30%)
- **Quit smoking**: Expected reaction (10%) vs. Actual reaction at 1-month (5%)
- **Use contraband menthol**: Expected reaction (5%) vs. Actual reaction at 1-month (10%)
- **Add menthol/other**: Expected reaction (3%) vs. Actual reaction at 1-month (8%)
- **Don't know**: Expected reaction (0%) vs. Actual reaction at 1-month (1%

Summary results of implemented and hypothetical menthol and flavor bans on sales and individual behavior

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Implemented Menthol Ban (Actual Effects)</th>
<th>Hypothetical Menthol Ban (Intended Effects)</th>
<th>Implemented Flavor Ban – Cigarettes Only</th>
<th>Implemented Flavor Ban – All Tobacco Products</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sales change (banned product)</td>
<td>~100% reduction</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>39% reduction in flavored cigar sales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales change (all tobacco products)</td>
<td>11% reduction</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>47% increase in cigar sales; 1400% increase in clove cigar sales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quit Attempt</td>
<td>29–63%</td>
<td>24–64%</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successful Quit</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switch to other tobacco product</td>
<td>28.2–76.1%</td>
<td>11–46%</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switch and attempt to quit</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>20–25%</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switch to e-cigarettes</td>
<td>29.1%</td>
<td>12–30%</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Find product regardless of ban</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>9–25%</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced Odds of Trying Any Tobacco Product</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced Odds of Trying Cigars</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Substitution of flavored/menthol products can reduce impact

- Flavored cigarette ban (exempting menthol cigarettes, other flavored tobacco products)
- Menthol cigarette ban (exempting other flavored tobacco products)

Greater use of menthol cigarettes, other flavored tobacco products
Greater use of other flavored tobacco products
Importance of including menthol cigarettes in a flavored tobacco ban
Prevalence of current smoking among adults in the US, 1965-2019

Current smoking prevalence among all U.S. Adults, 2019: 14.2%

Past 30-Day Cigarette Use Among Youth - MTF 1991-2019

2019: 3.7%

Estimated cigarette consumption in the U.S., 2000 - 2018

85% of the total decline in cigarette consumption attributed to non-menthol cigarettes

Past 30-day tobacco and e-cigarette use among high school students, NYTS 2016-2020

- Any tobacco/e-cigarette
- Any combusted tobacco
- E-cigarettes

Cigarette smoking is still a major problem

The burden of death and disease from tobacco use in the United States is overwhelmingly caused by cigarettes and other combusted tobacco products.

- Smoking accounts for 480,000 deaths annually in the U.S.
  - ~1,300 smoking-related deaths per day
- 5.6 million of today’s youth expected to die prematurely from smoking

Cigarette smoking is still a major problem

- Cigarettes have become more lethal over time.
  - More death and disease, despite lower per capita consumption and lower smoking prevalence
- Quitting cigarette smoking benefits smokers at any age.

Menthol choice is not FREEDOM

• More than half of adult cigarette smokers want to quit (55.1%).
  – Fewer than 1 in 10 succeed in quitting each year (7.5%).

• Menthol cigarette smokers are more likely to try to quit and less likely to succeed in quitting than non-menthol cigarette smokers.
  – This is particularly true for non-white menthol cigarette smokers.
Short-term effect of Ontario menthol cigarette ban on adult smoker behavior (2017)

Use non-menthol cigarettes only
Use alternative flavored tobacco products
Quit smoking
Use contraband menthol
Add menthol/other
Don't know

Expected reaction vs. Actual reaction at 1-month

Summary results of implemented and hypothetical menthol and flavor bans on sales and individual behavior

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Implemented Menthol Ban (Actual Effects)</th>
<th>Hypothetical Menthol Ban (Intended Effects)</th>
<th>Implemented Flavor Ban – Cigarettes Only</th>
<th>Implemented Flavor Ban – All Tobacco Products</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sales change (banned product)</td>
<td>~ 100% reduction</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>39% reduction in flavored cigar sales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sales change (all tobacco products)</td>
<td>11% reduction</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>47% increase in cigar sales; 1400% increase in clove cigar sales</td>
<td>27% reduction in all cigar sales</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quit Attempt</td>
<td>29–63%</td>
<td>24–64%</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Successful Quit</td>
<td>24%</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switch to other tobacco product</td>
<td>28.2–76.1%</td>
<td>11–46%</td>
<td>14%</td>
<td>0–11%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switch and attempt to quit</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>20–25%</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Switch to e-cigarettes</td>
<td>29.1%</td>
<td>12–30%</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Find product regardless of ban</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>9–25%</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced Odds of Trying Any Tobacco Product</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>6%</td>
<td>NA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduced Odds of Trying Cigars</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>NA</td>
<td>5%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tobacco sales during COVID

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>52 WEEKS ENDING 11/29/20</th>
<th>DOLLAR SALES 1-YEAR % CHANGE</th>
<th>UNIT SALES 1-YEAR % CHANGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cigarettes</td>
<td>1.4%</td>
<td>-4.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chewing tobacco/snuff</td>
<td>2.9%</td>
<td>-5.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Spitless tobacco</td>
<td>70.1%</td>
<td>71.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cigars</td>
<td>10.1%</td>
<td>6.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Electronic smoking devices</td>
<td>5.1%</td>
<td>15.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Smoking accessories</td>
<td>21.0%</td>
<td>15.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: IRI, a Chicago-based market research firm, Total U.S. Convenience stores, Dec. 17, 2020

https://cstoredecisions.com/2021/01/14/tobacco-tally/

https://tobaccocontrol.bmj.com/content/29/1/e145.full
Change in substance use since COVID

Percentage of Vermont youth and young adult past 30-day users reporting change in substance use since the start of the COVID-19 pandemic

Wave 4 (September 2020), Preliminary data
Research exemption: flavored tobacco

• Ongoing research on flavors in tobacco products at UVM.

• Consider including language in the bill to allow for continuation of scientific research to inform and evaluate future policy efforts.
Key points re: menthol and flavored tobacco products

• Menthol cigarettes and flavored tobacco products facilitate youth initiation and progression to regular tobacco use.

• Menthol cigarettes impede adult smoking cessation.

• Banning menthol and flavors in tobacco/e-cigarette products would reduce the number of tobacco users and thereby benefit public health.