

1 TO THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES:

2 The Committee on Judiciary to which was referred Senate Bill No. 3
3 entitled “An act relating to competency to stand trial and insanity as a defense”
4 respectfully reports that it has considered the same and recommends that the
5 House propose to the Senate that the bill be amended by striking out all after
6 the enacting clause and inserting in lieu thereof the following:

7 *** Competency to Stand Trial and Sanity at the Time of the Offense ***

8 Sec. 1. 13 V.S.A. § 4816 is amended to read:

9 § 4816. SCOPE OF EXAMINATION; REPORT; EVIDENCE

10 (a) Examinations provided for in section 4815 of this title shall have
11 reference to one or both of the following:

12 (1) ~~mental~~ Mental competency of the person examined to stand trial for
13 the alleged offense; ~~and~~.

14 (2) ~~sanity~~ Sanity of the person examined at the time of the alleged
15 offense.

16 (b) A competency evaluation for an individual thought to have a
17 developmental disability shall include a current evaluation by a psychologist
18 skilled in assessing individuals with developmental disabilities.

19 (c)(1) As soon as practicable after the examination has been completed, the
20 examining psychiatrist ~~or and~~, if applicable under subsection 4816(b) of this
21 title, the psychiatrist and the psychologist, shall prepare a report containing

1 findings in regard to ~~each of the applicable matters listed in~~ provisions of
2 subsection (a) of this section. The report shall be transmitted to the court
3 issuing the order for examination, and copies of the report sent to the State's
4 Attorney, ~~and, to the respondent,~~ to the respondent's attorney if the respondent
5 is represented by counsel, to the Commissioner of Mental Health, and, if
6 applicable, to the Department of Disabilities, Aging, and Independent Living.

7 (2) If the psychiatrist and, if applicable, the psychologist has been asked
8 to provide opinions as to If the court orders examination of both the person's
9 competency to stand trial and the person's sanity at the time of the alleged
10 offense, those opinions shall be presented in separate reports and addressed
11 separately by the court. In such cases, the examination of the person's sanity
12 shall only be undertaken if the psychiatrist ~~and or,~~ if applicable ~~under~~
13 subsection 4816(b) of this title, the psychiatrist ~~and~~ the psychologist, ~~is are~~
14 able to form the opinion that the person is competent to stand trial, unless the
15 defendant requests that the examinations occur concurrently. If the evaluation
16 of the defendant's sanity at the time of the alleged offense does not occur until
17 the defendant is deemed competent to stand trial, ~~provided that~~ the psychiatrist
18 ~~and or,~~ if applicable ~~under~~ subsection 4816(b) of this title, the psychiatrist ~~and~~
19 the psychologist, shall ~~make a reasonable effort to~~ collect and preserve any
20 evidence necessary to form an opinion as to sanity if the person regains
21 competence.

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21

* * *

Sec. 2. 13 V.S.A. § 4820 is amended to read:

§ 4820. HEARING REGARDING COMMITMENT

(a) When a person charged on information, complaint, or indictment with a criminal offense:

(1) Is reported by the examining psychiatrist following examination pursuant to sections 4814–4816 of this title to have been insane at the time of the alleged offense.

(2) Is found upon hearing pursuant to section 4817 of this title to be incompetent to stand trial due to a mental disease or mental defect.

(3) Is not indicted upon hearing by grand jury by reason of insanity at the time of the alleged offense, duly certified to the court.

(4) Upon trial by court or jury is acquitted by reason of insanity at the time of the alleged offense; the court before which such person is tried or is to be tried for such offense, shall hold a hearing for the purpose of determining whether such person should be committed to the custody of the Commissioner of Mental Health. Such person may be confined in jail or some other suitable place by order of the court pending hearing for a period not exceeding 15 days.

(b) When a person is found to be incompetent to stand trial, has not been indicted by reason of insanity for the alleged offense, or has been acquitted by reason of insanity at the time of the alleged offense, the person shall be entitled

1 to have counsel appointed from Vermont Legal Aid to represent the person.
2 The Department of Mental Health and, if applicable, the Department of
3 Disabilities, Aging, and Independent Living, shall be entitled to appear and call
4 witnesses at the proceeding.

5 Sec. 3. 13 V.S.A. § 4822 is amended to read:

6 § 4822. FINDINGS AND ORDER; PERSONS WITH A MENTAL ILLNESS

7 (a) If the court finds that the person is a person in need of treatment or a
8 patient in need of further treatment as defined in 18 V.S.A. § 7101, the court
9 shall issue an order of commitment directed to the Commissioner of Mental
10 Health that shall admit the person to the care and custody of the Department of
11 Mental Health for an indeterminate period. In any case involving personal
12 injury or threat of personal injury, the committing court may issue an order
13 requiring a court hearing before a person committed under this section may be
14 discharged from custody.

15 (b) An order of commitment issued pursuant to this section shall have the
16 same force and effect as an order issued under 18 V.S.A. §§ 7611–7622, and a
17 person committed under this order shall have the same status and the same
18 rights, including the right to receive care and treatment, to be examined and
19 discharged, and to apply for and obtain judicial review of his or her case, as a
20 person ordered committed under 18 V.S.A. §§ 7611–7622.

1 (c)(1) Notwithstanding the provisions of subsection (b) of this section, at
2 least 10 days prior to the proposed discharge of any person committed under
3 this section, the Commissioner of Mental Health shall give notice of the
4 discharge to the committing court and State’s Attorney of the county where the
5 prosecution originated. In all cases requiring a hearing prior to discharge of a
6 person found incompetent to stand trial under section 4817 of this title, the
7 hearing shall be conducted by the committing court issuing the order under that
8 section. In all other cases, when the committing court orders a hearing under
9 subsection (a) of this section or when, in the discretion of the Commissioner of
10 Mental Health, a hearing should be held prior to the discharge, the hearing
11 shall be held in the Family Division of the Superior Court to determine if the
12 committed person is no longer a person in need of treatment or a patient in
13 need of further treatment as set forth in subsection (a) of this section. Notice
14 of the hearing shall be given to the Commissioner, the State’s Attorney of the
15 county where the prosecution originated, the committed person, and the
16 person’s attorney. Prior to the hearing, the State’s Attorney may enter an
17 appearance in the proceedings and may request examination of the patient by
18 an independent psychiatrist, who may testify at the hearing.

19 (2)(A) This subdivision (2) shall apply when a person is committed to
20 the care and custody of the Commissioner of Mental Health under this section
21 after having been found:

1 (i) not guilty by reason of insanity; or

2 (ii) incompetent to stand trial, provided that the person’s criminal
3 case has not been dismissed.

4 (B)(i) When a person has been committed under this section, the
5 Commissioner shall provide notice to the State’s Attorney of the county where
6 the prosecution originated or to the Office of the Attorney General if that office
7 prosecuted the case:

8 (I) at least 10 days prior to discharging the person from:

9 (aa) the care and custody of the Commissioner; or

10 (bb) a hospital or a secure residential recovery facility to the
11 community on an order of nonhospitalization pursuant to 18 V.S.A. § 7618;

12 (II) at least 10 days prior to the expiration of a commitment
13 order issued under this section if the Commissioner does not seek continued
14 treatment; or

15 (III) any time that the person elopes from the custody of the
16 Commissioner.

17 (ii) When the State’s Attorney or Attorney General receives notice
18 under subdivision (i) of this subdivision (B), the Office shall provide notice of
19 the action to any victim of the offense for which the person has been charged
20 who has not opted out of receiving notice.

1 (iii) As used in this subdivision (B), “victim” has the same
2 meaning as in section 5301 of this title.

3 * * *

4 Sec. 4. Vermont Rule of Criminal Procedure 16.1 is amended to read:

5 RULE 16.1. DISCLOSURE TO THE PROSECUTION

6 (a) The Person of the Defendant.

7 (1) Notwithstanding the initiation of judicial proceedings, and subject to
8 constitutional limitations, upon motion and notice a judicial officer may
9 require the defendant to:

10 * * *

11 (H) provide specimens of ~~his~~ the defendant’s handwriting; ~~and~~

12 (I) submit to a reasonable physical or medical inspection of ~~his~~ the
13 defendant’s body or, if notice is given by the defendant that sanity is in issue or
14 that expert testimony will be offered as provided in Rule 12.1, to a reasonable
15 mental examination by a psychiatrist or other expert; and

16 (J) submit to a reasonable mental examination by a psychiatrist or
17 other expert when a court ordered examiner pursuant to 13 V.S.A. § 4814(a)(2)
18 or (4) reports that a defendant is not competent to stand trial.

19 * * *

20 *** Reports and Studies ***

21 Sec. 5. CORRECTIONS; ASSESSMENT OF MENTAL HEALTH

1 SERVICES

2 (a) On or before January 1, 2022, the Departments of Corrections and of
3 Mental Health shall jointly submit an inventory and evaluation of the mental
4 health services provided by the entity with whom the Department of
5 Corrections contracts for health care services to the House Committees on
6 Corrections and Institutions, on Health Care, and on Judiciary and to the
7 Senate Committees on Health and Welfare and on Judiciary.

8 (b) The evaluation shall include:

9 (1) a comparison as to how the type, frequency, and timeliness of
10 mental health services provided in a correctional setting differ from those
11 services available in the community, recognizing that comparison to
12 currently available community services does not necessarily establish the
13 standard of care for best practices;

14 (2) a comparison as to how the type, frequency, and timeliness of mental
15 health services differ among Vermont correctional settings, including between
16 men and women’s facilities, and from those mental health services provided to
17 individuals under the care and custody of the Department of Corrections
18 incarcerated in an out-of-state correctional facility;

19 (3) an assessment as to how the use of a for-profit entity with whom the
20 Department of Corrections contracts for health care services affects costs or
21 quality of care in correctional settings;

1 (4) an assessment as to whether the Department of Mental Health should
2 provide oversight authority for mental health services provided by the entity
3 with whom the Department of Corrections contracts for health care services;
4 and

5 (5) information as to how the memorandum of understanding executed
6 by the Departments of Corrections and of Mental Health impacts the mental
7 health services provided by the entity with whom the Department of
8 Corrections contracts for health care services and whether it is adequately
9 addressing needs of those individuals with severe illness or in need of inpatient
10 care.

11 (c) In conducting the work required by this section, the Departments of
12 Corrections and of Mental Health shall ensure that social and racial equity
13 issues are considered, including issues related to transgender and gender non-
14 conforming persons.

15 Sec. 6. FORENSIC CARE WORKING GROUP

16 (a) On or before August 1, 2021, the Department of Mental Health shall
17 convene a working group of interested stakeholders to provide
18 recommendations necessary to carry out the provisions in subsections (b) and
19 (c) of this section, including as appropriate:

20 (1) a representative from the Department of Corrections;

- 1 (2) a representative from the Department of Disabilities, Aging, and
2 Independent Living;
- 3 (3) the Chief Superior Judge;
- 4 (4) a representative from the Department of State’s Attorneys and
5 Sheriffs;
- 6 (5) a representative from the Office of the Attorney General;
- 7 (6) a representative from the Office of the Defender General;
- 8 (7) the Director of Health Care Reform or designee;
- 9 (8) a representative appointed by Vermont Care Partners;
- 10 (9) a representative appointed by Vermont Legal Aid’s Mental Health
11 Project;
- 12 (10) a representative appointed by the Vermont Medical Society;
- 13 (11) three crime victims representatives, appointed by the Vermont
14 Center for Crime Victim Services;
- 15 (12) the Mental Health Care Ombudsman established pursuant to
16 18 V.S.A. § 7259 or designee;
- 17 (13) a representative of the designated hospitals, appointed by the
18 Vermont Association of Hospitals and Health Care Systems;
- 19 (14) three individuals with lived experience of mental illness, at least one
20 of whom has lived experience of the criminal justice system or the civil
21 commitment system, or both, appointed by Vermont Psychiatric Survivors;

1 (15) a representative appointed by the Vermont Developmental
2 Disabilities Council; and

3 (16) any other interested party permitted by the Commissioner of
4 Mental Health.

5 (b)(1) On or before February 1, 2022, the Department of Mental Health
6 shall submit a preliminary report to the House Committees on Corrections and
7 Institutions, on Health Care, and on Judiciary and to the Senate Committees on
8 Health and Welfare and on Judiciary addressing:

9 (A) any gaps in the current mental health and criminal justice system
10 structure;

11 (B) opportunities to:

12 (i) improve public safety and address the treatment needs for
13 individuals incompetent to stand trial or who are adjudicated not guilty by
14 reason of insanity; and

15 (ii) consider the importance of victims' rights in the forensic care
16 process;

17 (C) competency restoration models used in other states, including
18 both:

19 (i) models that do not rely on involuntary medication to restore
20 competency; and

21 (ii) how cases where competency is not restored are addressed;

1 (D) models used in other states to determine public safety risks and
2 the means used to address such risks, including guilty but mentally ill verdicts
3 in criminal cases;

4 (E) due process requirements for defendants held without
5 adjudication of a crime and presumed innocent;

6 (F) processes regarding other mental conditions affecting competence
7 or sanity, including intellectual disabilities, traumatic brain injury, and
8 dementia;

9 (G) models for forensic treatment, including inpatient treatment,
10 community-based treatment, or other treatment models; and

11 (H) any additional recommendations to address the gaps in the
12 current mental health and criminal justice system structure and opportunities to
13 improve public safety and address the treatment needs for individuals
14 incompetent to stand trial or who are adjudicated not guilty by reason of
15 insanity.

16 (2) Based on the recommendations in the preliminary report submitted
17 to the General Assembly pursuant to subdivision (1) of this subsection, the
18 Department shall submit a second preliminary report to the Joint Legislative
19 Justice Oversight Committee on or before July 1, 2022 as to whether or not a
20 forensic treatment facility is needed in Vermont.

1 (3) On or before January 1, 2023, the Department shall submit a final
2 report to the House Committees on Corrections and Institutions, on Health
3 Care, and on Judiciary and to the Senate Committees on Health and Welfare
4 and on Judiciary that refines and finalizes the recommendations made pursuant
5 to subdivisions (1) and (2) of this subsection, including addressing the size,
6 scope, and fiscal impact of any forensic treatment facility if one is
7 recommended in subdivision (2).

8 (c) On or before February 1, 2022, the Department of Mental Health shall
9 submit a report to the House Committees on Corrections and Institutions, on
10 Health Care, and on Judiciary and to the Senate Committees on Health and
11 Welfare and on Judiciary that assesses the necessity of notification to the
12 prosecutor upon becoming aware that individuals on orders of
13 nonhospitalization pursuant to 18 V.S.A. § 7618 are not complying with the
14 order or that the alternative treatment is not adequate to meet the individual's
15 treatment needs, including any recommendations:

16 (1) necessary to clarify the process;

17 (2) addressing what facts and circumstances should trigger the
18 Commissioner's duty to notify the prosecutor; and

19 (3) addressing steps that the prosecutor should take after receiving the
20 notification.

1 (d)(1) In conducting the work required by this section, including
2 evaluations for forensic treatment facility models pursuant to subdivision
3 (b)(2) of this section, the working group shall ensure:

4 (A) that social and racial equity issues are considered, including
5 issues related to transgender and gender non-conforming persons; and

6 (B) consistency with the General Assembly’s policy in 18 V.S.A.
7 § 7629(c) of working “toward a mental health system that does not require
8 coercion or the use of involuntary medication.”

9 (2) These considerations shall be reflected in the final report submitted
10 pursuant to subdivision (b)(3) of this section and the report submitted pursuant
11 to subsection (c) of this section.

12 (e) The Department shall access regional or national expertise to present
13 models to the working group for review, including any model recommended
14 by members of the working group.

15 (f) The final report submitted pursuant to subdivision (b)(3) of this section
16 and the report submitted pursuant to subsection (c) of this section shall include
17 proposed draft legislation addressing any identified needed changes to statute.

18 (g) Members of the working group who are neither State employees nor
19 otherwise paid to participate in the working group in their professional
20 capacity shall be entitled to per diem compensation and reimbursement of
21 expenses for attending meetings as permitted under 32 V.S.A. § 1010.

1

2

3

4 (Committee vote: _____)

5

6

Representative _____

7

FOR THE COMMITTEE