

# H.640: VEGI Information Disclosure

Graham Campbell  
Senior Fiscal Analyst  
Joint Fiscal Office  
February 12, 2020

# Good Jobs First: Show Us the Subsidized Jobs

- A 2014 analysis conducted by Good Jobs First
- A comprehensive study evaluating economic development incentives in every state.
  - 246 subsidy programs in 50 states plus DC
  - \$12 billion worth of subsidies
- Graded programs on a number of different disclosure criteria:
  - Disclosure criteria
    - Subsidy value, award status, job outcomes, wage outcomes, project information and company information
  - Accessibility criteria
    - Downloadability, years of data, ease of access

# Vermont

- Scored 5<sup>th</sup> overall with an average score of 43 out of 100.

<i>Rank</i>	<i>State</i>	<i>Average</i>
1	Illinois	65
2	Michigan	58
3	North Carolina	48
4	Wisconsin	46
5	Vermont	43
6	Maryland	42
7	Texas	40
8 (tie)	New York	38
8 (tie)	Oregon	38
10 (tie)	Louisiana	36
10 (tie)	Washington	36
12	Kentucky	35
13	Indiana	34
14 (tie)	Connecticut	33
14 (tie)	Missouri	33
16	Florida	32
17	Wyoming	29
18	Virginia	28
19	Iowa	27
20	Pennsylvania	25

# Vermont-Specific Program Scores

<b>Show Us the Subsidized Jobs: Scoring Details for VERMONT Programs</b>		<i>Maximum possible score for category</i>	Economic Development Authority loans	Vermont Employment Growth Incentive (VEGI)	Vermont Training Program	Workforce Education & Training Fund
<i>Score criteria</i>						
Subsidy Value	BOTH amount approved AND actual amount disbursed/claimed (15) -	15	10	10	10	15
	Either amount approved OR actual amount disbursed/claimed (10) -or-					
	Performance-based with actual amount disbursed/claimed (15)					
Status of Award	Indication or whether award is completed, active, terminated (5)	15	0	15	10	5
	Disclosure of whether enforcement action taken (5)					
	Disclosure of amount clawed back or recalibrated or rescinded (5)					
Jobs Reporting	Number of jobs or training slots promised/projected ONLY (5) -or-	20	5	0	15	20
	Actual number of jobs created/retained or trainings ONLY (15) -or-					
	BOTH promised/projected and actual (20)					
Wages Reporting	Wage rates/payroll promised/projected only (10) -or-	20	0	0	15	18
	Actual wage rates/payroll only (15) -or-					
	Both promised and actual (18) -or-					
	Either promised and actual with wage disaggregation (20)					
Project Information	Location with street address (10)	15	0	0	0	0
	Indication whether the project is a relocation (3)					
	Project documents OR total subsidy package data (2)					
Company Information	DUNS or FEIN (2)	5	0	0	0	0
	NAICS (1)					
	Parent company (2)					
User Features	Ease of access (3)	10	6	8	6	3
	Multiple years of data (3)					
	Downloadable (2)					
	Part of or linked to a wider government transparency site (2)					
<i>Total before penalty</i>		100	21	33	56	61
<i>Penalty points (see reasoning on following page)</i>			0	0	0	0
<b>TOTAL PROGRAM SCORE</b>			<b>21</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>56</b>	<b>61</b>

# Current VEGI Annual Report

- Information that is currently not available:
  - How much an awardee earned in incentive in any given year
  - The payroll or capital investment requirements per awardee
  - Average wages of the new jobs created by awardee
  - The number of jobs created by awardee
  - Progress towards the payroll or capital expenditure targets in any given year

TABLE 1A

**Applications Approved and Active**

Company Name	Date Initial Application Considered	Date Final Application Considered <sup>2</sup>	Authorization Period	Status	Date of Status Change	Term Reason <sup>3</sup>	Incentive Earned Yes/No	Incentive Considered	Minimum Net Revenue Benefit	Ed Tax Stabiliz <sup>4</sup>	Green <sup>5</sup>	Labor Market Areas (LMA) <sup>6</sup>	Look Back Waiver (LBW) <sup>7</sup>
NuHarbor Security	4/26/18	N/A	2019–2023	Active-Initial		—	N	\$202,644	\$147,232				
GLAVEL	4/26/18	N/A	2019–2023	Active-Initial		—	N	\$313,556	\$56,372		•		
Twincraft	6/28/18	N/A	2019–2023	Active-Initial		—	N	\$180,746	\$239,956				
DSD International	12/14/17	N/A	2019–2023	Active-Initial		—	N	\$63,215	\$33,518				
Culturemade (Project Xanadu)	12/14/17	N/A	2019–2023	Active-Initial		—	N	\$1,377,752	\$-			•	
Long Falls Paperboard	N/A	12/14/18	2018–2022	Active-Final		—	N	\$1,148,098	\$-			•	
Greensea Systems, Inc.	7/26/18	12/14/18	2018–2022	Active-Final		—	N	\$103,505	\$51,957				
Gordini USA	3/29/18	12/14/18	2018–2022	Active-Final		—	N	\$228,922	\$288,073				
Inntopia	2/22/18	12/14/18	2018–2022	Active-Final		—	N	\$221,168	\$678,749				
MSI	12/14/17	12/14/18	2018–2022	Active-Final		—	N	\$928,824	\$-			•	
Bedford	12/14/17	12/14/18	2018–2022	Active-Final		—	N	\$1,422,679	\$914,521				
LED Dynamics, Inc./Green Mtn. Econom. Devel. Corp.	10/26/17	12/14/18	2018–2022	Active-Final		—	N	\$614,917	\$-		•	•	
Winooski, LLC/DealerPolicy, LLC	8/31/17	12/14/17	2017–2021	Active-Final		—	N	\$92,529	\$45,881				
Lawson's Finest Liquids	2/23/17	12/14/17	2017–2021	Active-Final		—	N	\$1,420,630	\$-			•	

# What do other states do?

- From the GJF report:
  - Information on job numbers by awardee
    - 42 job programs in 26 states provided only projected jobs data by applicant
    - 18 job programs in 12 states provided only actual jobs created.
    - 41 programs in 24 states provided both.
    - Wisconsin, Illinois, Connecticut, Michigan and New York all lead in this area.
  - Wage and Payroll data by awardee
    - 25 programs in 15 states provide only projected payroll data
    - 7 programs in 6 states provide actual wage data
    - 15 programs in 9 states provide both.
    - Average wage rates are provided by 47 programs
      - States include Illinois, Louisiana, Kentucky, Florida, Indiana, North Carolina and Texas.