

Sunset Advisory Commission: Board and Commission Review

Travel Information Council

Created in Title 10, Chapter 21 (10 VSA § 484).

1. Meets as needed, roughly every quarter. Agendas and minutes found on the AOT web site.
2. TIC has seven members. Under § 484(c), ACCD Secretary, or designees serves as chair, Governor appoints other six members to staggered three-year terms, including one for AOT. Non-State Members are paid per diem and expenses. The members are as follows:
 - John Kessler, Chair (ACCD Secretary's designee)
 - Noah Fishman (Restaurants) term expires 2/28/2019
 - Francis Heald (Recreation) term expires 2/29/2020
 - Elizabeth Kennett (Agriculture) term expires 2/29/2020
 - Jacqueline Dement (AOT representative) term expires 2/28/2019
 - Lisa Lang (Lodging) term expires 2/29/2020
3. Administer State's sign laws.
4. Services still needed to achieve legislative purpose of providing safe and effective guidance to travelers and to prevent the indiscriminate use of outdoor advertising.
5. Council performs well. Very few complaints or controversies arise due to its administration of Vermont's sign laws.
6. A legislative review and update of Chapter 21 would have the greatest impact on the Council's ability to effectively and efficiently perform its duties.
7. The Council's duties have a limited degree of overlap with State Land Use Permits (Act 250).
8. The Council's enabling statutes in Chapter 21 are in need of a thorough review and update.
9. AOT staffs and funds the operations of the Council.
10. The Council prepares reports and studies on an as-needed basis when required by the Vermont General Assembly.

Travel and Recreation Council

Created in 10 VSA § 652.

1. The TRC generally meets bi-monthly on the third Thursday. Agenda and minutes are posted on the Department of Tourism and Marketing web site.
2. The TRC consists of 15 members, of which five are state agency or department heads, or their designees. The other ten members are private sector members appointed by the Governor for staggered three-year terms. (See attachment with list of names).
3. The purpose of the TRC is to advise the ACCD Secretary on state travel and recreation policy, state travel and recreation programs, and other programs of the Department of Tourism and Marketing.

4. The tourism industry is the largest portion of the Vermont economy and receiving broad-based private sector advice and collaborative recommendations from other state agencies informs and enhances the ACCD Secretary's overall efforts to promote Vermont as a place to visit, or even work, live, and raise a family.
5. The TRC has performed well over the years, particularly by providing the ACCD Secretary with the detailed knowledge of tourism industry professionals to help the State maintain the most current and accurate perspective on the status of private sector tourism issues throughout the state.
6. No clear alternative to the TRC is imagined at this time.
7. The TRC's focus has some overlap with other boards and commissions whose purposes are to develop, maintain or improve various aspects of the quality of life in Vermont that attract tourists to the state, such as the recently formed Vermont Outdoor Recreation Economic Collaborative. Unlike the TRC, however, VOREC and other recreation organizations form around single or narrower slices of Vermont's tourism economy, such as skiing, mountain biking, or snowmobiling rather than the *overall* tourism and recreation economy.
8. The TRC's enabling statutes are broad enough to allow it to adapt in a timely fashion to respond to or anticipate needs and issues in Vermont's tourism economy.
9. For FY '18, the TRC has paid \$1,850 in per diem, \$1,401.85 in travel in-state and meals to non-state employees, for a total of \$3,255.85.
10. No annual report is required.

Development Cabinet

Created in 3 VSA § 2293.

The Governor, or designee, chairs the Development Cabinet, consisting of the Secretaries of the Agencies of Administration, of Agriculture, Food and Markets, of Commerce and Community Development, of Education, of Natural Resources, and of Transportation. While an Interagency Work Group is called for economic development planning efforts and provided administrative support by ACCD. The limited nature of the Development Cabinet is described in § 2293 as an information gathering and coordinating cabinet with no additional enforcement powers.

The Development Cabinet meets on an as-needed basis and fulfills an advisory function for the Governor, particularly on longer range economic development planning and inter-agency coordination to implement policy initiatives. However, the Governor at any time may convene a meeting of select cabinet members to focus attention and enhance coordination on extraordinary economic development projects, as well as provide regular updates to the State's long-term economic development planning.

Recommendation: Ending the statutory Development Cabinet would not alter the Governor's ability to achieve the same objectives independently.

Commission on International Trade and Sovereignty

Created in 3 VSA § 23.

The Commission consists of a mix of designated State officials, legislators, and non-state members for a total of ten, with only member appointed directly to the Commission by the Governor – a representative of the Vermont Chamber of Commerce. No terms are specified for the members. The Commission has not been active in the past three or more years.

The Commission was intended to provide a mechanism for the State to receive comments from citizens and legislators on trade agreements between the federal government and a foreign country and then make policy recommendations to the Governor, Vermont's congressional delegation, or to the United States trade Representative. Administrative support is provided by ACCD, Legislative Council, and the Joint Fiscal Office.

Recommendation: Ending the Commission would not have any impact, as it has not met in over three years and citizens and legislators wishing to comment on federal trade agreements will continue to have the other avenues available to them that have been employed in place of the Commission.

Film and New Media Advisory Board

Created in 3 VSA § 2471d to advise the ACCD Secretary on promoting Vermont as a location for commercial film and television production and facilitating the participation of local individuals and companies in such productions. Primary function is to recommend strategies that would link Vermonters employed in film and new media to economic opportunities in their trades in Vermont.

ACCD has not established this Advisory Board, but rather has dedicated staff to working with members of film and new media to achieve its purpose.

Vermont Economic Progress Council

Created in 32 VSA § 3325.

1. VEPC meets on the last Thursday of the month. Agendas and minutes are available on VEPC's page of the ACCD web site.
2. VEPC has eleven voting members – nine appointed by the Governor and one member each appointed by the Vermont House and Vermont Senate:
 - Mark Nicholson – 3/31/21
 - John Davis – 3/31/19
 - Betsy Gentile – 3/31/21
 - Michael Keane – 3/31/21
 - Jean O'Sullivan – at will of Speaker, Commerce & Economic Development
 - Patricia Horn – 3/31/21
 - Emma Marvin – 3/31/19
 - Stephan Morse – 3/31/19
 - Senate Rep (vacant) – at will of Senate, Committee on Committees
 - Rachel Smith – 3/31/21
 - Thad Richardson – 3/31/19

3. VEPC is charged with generating new net revenue by encouraging businesses to make capital investments, create new jobs and add new payroll. VEPC also administers the Tax increment Finance program for the State, enabling municipal development of infrastructure to support new economic activity that would not otherwise occur.
4. VEPC's purpose is still needed. Without VEPC, Vermont would see less new economic development and the new revenue it generates.
5. VEPC members are knowledgeable and experienced business and financial professionals who consistently attend meetings well-prepared and ready to engage in substantive discussion.
6. The statutes governing VEPC have been reviewed and amended almost every year since it was designed 20 years ago to administer economic development incentives. While there may be some minor revisions that could affect VEPC's efficiency and effectiveness, VEPC already functions at a very high level.
7. Rather than overlap, VEPC complements the other economic development support mechanisms in the State.
8. VEPC's enabling and governing laws have been updated regularly and, therefore, continue to support VEPC's successful fulfillment of its purpose.
9. Fiscal expenditures for FY '18 were \$234,008
10. VEPC is required to prepare annual reports and works with the Department of Taxes on substantial parts of those.

Vermont Sustainable Jobs Fund Board of Directors

Created in 10 VSA § 328(c).

1. VSJF's Board of Directors meet 4 times per year. The VSJF is a 501c3 Non-Profit Organization, as determined by the IRS. As of 2016, it is no longer considered an component unit of the State of Vermont. Given that it is not a state entity it does not publish its agendas or minutes of meetings, although, as with any non-profit organization, these documents are available upon request.
NOTE: Additional details are provided in the attached response from Ellen Kahler, executive director of VSJF.
2. Independent Board of Director terms are for 3 years for a maximum of 3 terms. They are appointed by the current sitting Board of Directors as vacancies or term dates occur. The Governor's appointee serves at his/her discretion. The Secretaries of the Agency of Commerce & Community Development (or designee) and Agency of Agriculture, Food & Markets (or designee) serve based on statute. This is important as it provides good connectivity between the organization and these State Agency partners. No board members receive a per diem for their service.
NOTE: List of Board Members and term expirations on attached document supplied by VSJF.
3. The Vermont Sustainable Jobs Fund (VSJF) is a nonprofit organization committed to nurturing the sustainable development of Vermont's economy. VSJF provides business assistance, value chain facilitation, network development, and strategic

planning in agriculture and food system, forest product, waste management, renewable energy, and environmental technology sectors. Located in Montpelier, Vermont, VSJF was created by the Vermont Legislature in 1995 to partner with state government, private sector businesses, and nonprofits to build a thriving economic, social, and ecological future for Vermont. Learn more at www.vsjf.org.

4. Yes, this organization is still needed. VSJF has 10 full-time staff, a fully engaged board and a \$1.88 million budget, of which that State of Vermont contributes about 25 percent and the rest is raised by the Executive Director from foundation and federal grants, fees for service and sponsorships. This is a very cost-effective program given what the VSJF delivers to the state of Vermont in comparison to State General Fund dollars committed.
5. The VSJF is executing on its mission/purpose very effectively, with many benefits flowing to the State of Vermont (e.g., increased wages from business clients provided direct technical assistance, 7,700 net new jobs created and 800 net new establishments created between 2009-2017 in agriculture and food systems alone). See the VSJF Annual Reports for verification.
6. Because the VSJF operates outside of state government, but maintains strong ties with 11 state agencies and departments through its various work, it is able to be very nimble and responsive regarding the programs and services offered within its designated market sectors. Various state agencies or legislative committees often request the VSJF to take specific projects because of its effectiveness and high quality work.
7. No.
8. Yes. The AAFM and ACCD must be neutral and serve all stakeholders in the Vermont economy, whereas the VSJF was established to work in five specific economic sectors (agriculture and food, forest products, renewable energy, green technology and waste reduction). The VSJF was established to do forward moving, proactive market/industry development work and assist businesses in these sectors to take advantage of emerging market opportunities.
9. VSJF FY19 Budget vs FY18 Budget
FY19 Budget -- \$1,883,079 (Personnel - \$796,680)
FY18 Actual -- \$1,603,860 (Personnel - \$752,010)

NOTE: Additional budget detail supplied on the attached document from VSJF.

10. By statute, VSJF is required to provide two annual reports to the Vermont Legislature and Governor -- one by January 31 for the VSJF as an organization (§ 329) and one by January 15 for the Vermont Farm to Plate Investment Program (§ 330).

Annual Reports for the VSJF can be found at: <http://www.vsjf.org/impact/> (scroll to bottom of page). Annual Reports for the Vermont Farm to Plate Investment Program can be found at: <http://www.vtfarmtoplate.com/getting-to-2020> (scroll to bottom of page).

TRC Appointments - 2018

TRC members (10 V.S.A. § 652):

Travel and recreation council; membership

(a) A travel and recreation council is created. It shall comprise the following members:

(1) the secretary of the agency of commerce and community development (Heather Pelham),

(2) the secretary of the agency of natural resources, or his or her designee (Craig Whipple),

(3) the secretary of the agency of transportation, or his or her designee Brent Curtis),

(4) the secretary of agriculture, food and markets, or his or her designee (Lauren Masseria),

(5) the commissioner of tourism and marketing (Wendy), and

(6) ten members from the private sector appointed by the governor.

Currently these ten members are:

Brian Cain	6/30/2019
Matthew Crawford	6/30/2018
Wilfredo Docto	6/30/2019
Matt Harrington	6/30/2021
Paula Maynard	6/30/2021
Ronda Burns	6/30/2020
Molly Mahar	6/30/2021
Amy Morrison	6/30/2019
Victoria Tebbetts	6/30/2020
Steve Wright	6/30/2019

Vermont Sustainable Jobs Fund (VSJF)

VSA 10. § 326 - § 330

VSA 10. § 328 Creation of the sustainable jobs fund program

1. In general, how often does the board and commission meet. Provide specific information on how often the board or commission has met in the past two fiscal years. Provide information on where agendas and minutes of meetings can be found.

VSJF's Board of Directors meet 4 times per year. The VSJF is a 501c3 Non-Profit Organization, as determined by the IRS. As of 2016, it is no longer considered an component unit of the State of Vermont. Given that it is not a state entity it does not publish its agendas or minutes of meetings, although, as with any non-profit organization, these documents are available upon request.

2. Provide the names of members of the board or commission, their term length and expiration, their appointing authority, and the amount of any per diem they receive.

Independent Board of Director terms are for 3 years for a maximum of 3 terms. They are appointed by the current sitting Board of Directors as vacancies or term dates occur. The Governor's appointee serves at his/her discretion. The Secretaries of the Agency of Commerce & Community Development (or designee) and Agency of Agriculture, Food & Markets (or designee) serve based on statute. This is important as it provides good connectivity between the organization and these State Agency partners. No board members receive a per diem for their service.

Term #1 start	Category of Director	Board Member	End of current term (June 30)
2013	Independent	Robin Scheu	2019
2014	Independent	Nick Richardson	2020
2014	Independent	Allison Hooper	2020
2015	Independent	Will Stevens	2021
2015	Independent	Andrea Cohen	2021
2016	Independent	Nate Hausman	2021
2016	Independent	Sara Gilbert	2019
2016	Independent	Shelly Severinghaus	2019
2011	Governor's Appointee	Bill Murray	2017
N/A	Secretary of Commerce designee	Ted Brady	statutory
N/A	Secretary of Agriculture	Anson Tebbetts	statutory

3. Provide an overview of the board or commission's purpose.

The Vermont Sustainable Jobs Fund (VSJF) is a nonprofit organization committed to nurturing the sustainable development of Vermont's economy. VSJF provides business assistance, value chain facilitation, network development, and strategic planning in agriculture and food system, forest product, waste management, renewable energy, and environmental technology sectors. Located in Montpelier, Vermont, VSJF was created by the Vermont Legislature in 1995 to partner with state government, private sector businesses, and nonprofits to build a thriving economic, social, and ecological future for Vermont. Learn more at www.vsjf.org.

4. Is that purpose still needed? What harm would come if the board or commission no longer fulfilled that purpose?

Yes – this organization is still needed (we have 10 FT staff), a fully engaged board and a \$1.88million budget, of which that State of Vermont contributes about ¼ and the rest is raised by the Executive Director from foundation and federal grants, fees for service and sponsorships. This is a VERY cost effective program given what the VSJF delivers to the state of Vermont in comparison to State GF dollars committed.

5. How well is the board or commission performing in executing that purpose? What evidence can you provide to substantiate that performance?

The VSJF is executing on its mission/purpose really well, with many benefits flowing to the State of Vermont (e.g., increased wages from business clients we provide direct technical assistance to, 7,700 net new jobs created and 800 net new establishments created between 2009-2017 in ag and food systems alone). See our Annual Reports for verification.

6. If the purpose is still needed, can State government be more effective and efficient if the purpose was executed in a different manner?

Because the VSJF operates outside of state government, but maintains strong ties with 11 state agencies and departments through its various work, we are able to be very nimble and responsive re: the programs and services we offer within our designated market sectors. Various state agencies or Legislative committees often request the VSJF to take specific projects because of our effectiveness and high quality work.

7. Do any of your board or commission's functions overlap or duplicate those of another state board or commission or federal or state agency?

No.

8. Does the board or commission's enabling law continue to correctly reflect the purpose and activities of the board or commission?

Yes. The VAAF and ACCD needs to be 'agnostic' so to speak and serve all stakeholders in the Vermont economy, whereas the VSJF was established to work in 5 specific economic sectors

(ag and food, forest products, renewable energy, green technology and waste reduction). The VSJF was established to do forward moving, proactive market/industry development work and assist businesses in these sectors to take advantage of emerging market opportunities.

9. Provide a list of the board and commission's last fiscal year expenditures including staffing costs. How are these funded?

VSJF FY19 Budget vs FY18 Budget

	FY19 Budget	FY18 Actual
Budget Expenses By Program		
Admin / Operations	\$310,162	\$304,605
Flexible Capital Fund	\$105,484	\$103,975
Fiscal Sponsorship	\$3,052	\$10,776
Forest Products	\$235,265	\$264,153
Farm to Plate Investment Program	\$695,479	\$542,912
Business Assistance/Climate Economy	\$533,637	\$377,439
	\$1,883,079	\$1,603,860
Budget by Expense Category		
Personnel	\$796,680	\$752,010
Occupancy	\$47,010	\$43,399
Operations	\$271,303	\$281,314
Grantmaking	\$230,837	\$75,938
Professional	\$537,249	\$451,205
	\$1,883,079	\$1,603,866
Budget Revenue Sources		
Grants (foundation, state, federal)	1,313,977	\$1,082,000
Contributions	239,784	\$6,209
Interest Income	5,000	\$1,549
Program Service Fees	312,019	\$498,466
Special Events	27,875	\$34,202
	\$1,898,655	\$1,622,426

10. Is the board or commission required by law to prepare any reports or studies for the Legislature, the Governor or any state agency or officer? If so, have those reports or studies been produced? Does the board or commission have ongoing reporting obligations?

By statute, VSJF is required to provide 2 annual reports to the Vermont Legislature and Governor -- one by January 31 for the VSJF as an organization (§ 329) and one by January 15 for the Vermont Farm to Plate Investment Program (§ 330).

Annual Reports for the VSJF can be found here: <http://www.vsjf.org/impact/> (scroll to bottom of page). Annual Reports for the Vermont Farm to Plate Investment Program can be found here: <http://www.vtfarmtoplate.com/getting-to-2020> (scroll to bottom of page)