



**Vermont Child Poverty Council
Annual Progress Report
December 2016**

Representative Diane Lanpher, Co-Chair
Representative Jill Krowinski, Co-Chair
Senator Claire Ayer
Senator John F. Campbell
Senator Ann Cummings
Representative David Sharpe
Secretary Hal Cohen, Agency of Human Services
Carlen Finn, Voices for Vermont's Children
Deputy Secretary Amy Fowler, Agency of Education
Jeff Francis, Vermont Superintendents' Association
Dr. Breena Holmes, Department of Health
Karen Lafayette, Vermont Low Income Advocacy Council
Jean Murray, Vermont Legal Aid
Commissioner Annie Noonan, Department of Labor
Commissioner Ken Schatz, Department for Children and Families

Prepared by:

Catherine M. McLinn, Esq.
Office of Legislative Council
115 State Street - State House
Montpelier, VT 05633-5301
802-828-2231
kmclinn@leg.state.vt.us

Table of Contents

I. Statutory Authority and Responsibilities of the Vermont Child Poverty Council.....	1
II. Summary of Council Activities	1
III. Council Findings and Recommendations.....	2
IV. Appendices	7
A. Appendix 1. 2007 Acts and Resolves No. 68.....	7
B. Appendix 2. 2014 Acts and Resolves No. 104.....	9
C. Appendix 3. 2016 Witness List	11

I. Statutory Authority and Responsibilities of the Vermont Child Poverty Council

The Vermont Child Poverty Council (Council) was established in 2007 “to examine child poverty in Vermont and to make recommendations to the Governor and General Assembly on methods of improving the financial stability and well-being of children.” (See Appendix 1: 2007 Acts and Resolves No. 68.) The General Assembly amended the charge of the Council most recently during the 2014 legislative session, expanding the Council’s membership to include the Secretary of Human Services and extending the Council’s ability to meet during the legislative session. (See Appendix 2: 2014 Acts and Resolves No. 104.)

The General Assembly created the Council in recognition that Vermont faced a growing problem with regard to children living in poverty. Vermont has addressed the importance of individual responsibility through welfare reform, among other policies, but it has not fully addressed the societal structures and economic forces that create and perpetuate poverty. The Council’s task is, in part, to take a comprehensive look at these structural issues to determine what Vermont can do to alleviate financial pressures on families and how to create an environment in which families can succeed.

The Council comprises legislators, advocates, and other stakeholders. The enabling legislation as amended requires that the Council include “the following members or their designees: (A) the President Pro Tempore of the Senate; (B) the Speaker of the House of Representatives; (C) the Chair of the Senate Committee on Health and Welfare; (D) the Chair of the House Committee on Human Services; (E) the Chair of the Senate Committee on Education; (F) the Chair of the House Committee on Education; (G) the Commissioners for Children and Families; of Health; and of Labor; and the Secretaries of Human Services and of Education; and (H) one representative each from Voices for Vermont’s Children, the Vermont Low Income Advocacy Council, Vermont Legal Aid, and the Vermont Superintendents’ Association.”¹ The Council must report annually “on yearly progress toward benchmarks, updates to [its ten-year plan to reduce the number of Vermont’s children living in poverty by 50 percent], and recommendations for budgetary and policy changes in order to accomplish the goals of [Act 68].”² The Council will cease to exist on June 30, 2018.

II. Summary of Council Activities

After the conclusion of the legislative session in May, the Council reconvened on July 30, 2016. The Council met a total of six times during the General Assembly’s adjournment.

The Council reviewed its 2015 Annual Progress Report (2015 report), which contained recommendations concerning the Council’s legislative priorities for assisting children living in

¹ 2007 Acts and Resolves No. 68, Sec. 1, as amended.

² *Id.*

poverty.³ The Council considered each recommendation in the 2015 report to identify whether legislative action was taken or whether progress was otherwise achieved.⁴ The Council heard testimony from a diverse array of stakeholders on a number of issues within its jurisdiction, such as child care, education, housing and homelessness, economic empowerment, substance abuse, and mental health. It also discussed additional actions that the General Assembly and Governor might take in the future to address the Council's unmet goals.

The Council diverged from the subcommittee structure it had used to organize its work in previous years. Instead, the full Council was present at each meeting regardless of the topic covered or a particular member's subject matter expertise. The Council chose to reorganize itself this way in recognition of the importance and interdisciplinary nature of the topics covered. The majority of the meetings held by the Council this year were organized by topic. The topics addressed at the Council's meetings included child care, education, housing, economic supports, substance abuse, mental health, and financial literacy.

III. Council Findings and Recommendations

Drawing on the work of its members and the testimony of witnesses, the Council makes the recommendations below to the General Assembly. (See Appendix 3: 2016 Witness List.) The Council's recommendations are organized by category to reflect the topical meeting structure employed by the Council this year.

A. Child Care

On August 18, 2016, the Council heard testimony about the causes of and challenges resulting from insufficient child care offerings in the State. In its "Stalled at the Start" report, Let's Grow Kids estimated that 79 percent of Vermont's infants and toddlers who are likely to need care do not have access to high quality child care.⁵ A number of factors contribute to the low number of child care providers serving the State, including the often low wages earned by these workers. As

³ In its 2015 report, the Council as a whole made three recommendations; additional recommendations were endorsed by one or more of the Council's subcommittees. The 2015 report is available at <http://legislature.vermont.gov/assets/Legislative-Reports/GENERAL-311855-v1-2015-Vermont-Child-Poverty-Council-Report.pdf>.

⁴ A summary of legislative responses to the recommendations in the Council's 2015 report is available at <http://legislature.vermont.gov/assets/Documents/2016/WorkGroups/Vermont%20Child%20Poverty%20Council/Vermont%20Child%20Poverty%20Council%20Recommendations/W~Jennifer%20Carbee,%20Katie%20McLinn~Chart%20-%20Vermont%20Child%20Poverty%20Council%20-%20Legislative%20Update%20on%20Council's%202015%20Recommendations%20-%20Revised~6-30-2016.pdf>.

⁵ *Stalled at the Start*, Let's Grow Kids, available at <http://legislature.vermont.gov/assets/Documents/2016/WorkGroups/Vermont%20Child%20Poverty%20Council/Stalled%20at%20the%20Start/W~Robyn%20Freedner-Maguire,%20Jen%20Horwitz~Stalled%20at%20the%20Start%20-%20Vermont's%20Child%20Care%20Challenge%20-%20An%20Analysis%20of%20the%20Supply%20of%20and%20Demand%20for%20Regulated%20Infant%20and%20Toddler%20Care%20in%20Vermont~8-18-2016.pdf>.

a result of this shortage, many parents are not able to return to work or are forced to choose between work and less than optimal child care arrangements. An additional burden to parents trying to remain in the workforce is the steep cost of high quality child care, particularly for those families just above the subsidy threshold.

As a result, the Council recommends the following:

1. Committees of jurisdiction are encouraged to take testimony and craft legislative solutions to address the lack of accessibility and affordability in Vermont's child care system.
2. The Departments of Labor and for Children and Families are encouraged to work collaboratively to foster opportunities in which the child care workforce can both grow and enhance its quality of care.
3. The use and sharing of data regarding child care affordability and accessibility should be strategic to ensure that resources are utilized appropriately and that the needs of families are addressed.

B. Education

At its September 16, 2016 meeting, the Council heard testimony on the often disparate practices and outcomes Vermont students experience depending on their families' socioeconomic status. The topics covered by the Council ranged from chronic absenteeism to special education, yet the problem of students from low-income families being excluded or out-performed by their higher-income peers remained the same. However, not all of the testimony was dire. The Council was heartened to hear of the successes Head Start was achieving by using a two-generational approach to address the needs of families with low income. In addition to these topics, the Council also received a tutorial on federal education funding from the Vermont Agency of Education.

In light of the testimony it received, the Council makes the following recommendations:

1. The statutory tools available to address truancy are blunt instruments that often exacerbate the struggles of families with low income without achieving the intended goal of stabilizing school attendance. The committees of jurisdiction are encouraged to reconsider the criminal nature of truancy and the fine imposed on the parents of truant students in favor of diversion and other programs to address families' underlying needs.
2. The collection and use of longitudinal data is essential for tracking the progress of Vermont's students, and the Council looks forward to the Agency of Education's implementation of such a system over the course of the next two years. Once the system is functional, the Council recommends that the unit of analysis be at the supervisory union or school district level to reduce suppression of data from small schools.

3. The Council supports efforts within the public and private sectors to use a two-generational approach for the treatment of entire family units. It suggests that the Agencies of Human Services and of Education look toward this model to coordinate services that specifically address family trauma.
4. Schools and communities are encouraged to distribute resources equitably (versus equally) to ensure that students and families who need more services are able to access those services.
5. Legislative committees and the Agency of Education are encouraged to set policies at the State level that limit the use of exclusionary discipline, particularly with regard to students from low-income families and students with disabilities.

-OR-

Legislative committees and the Agency of Education are encouraged to continue and deepen commitments at the State level that encourage alternatives to exclusionary discipline, particularly with regard to students from low-income families and students with disabilities.

6. Studies have shown that students who do not participate in enrichment activities outside core school hours are more likely to fall behind their peers in terms of academic achievement; are more likely to engage in risky or dangerous behaviors; and are less likely to continue on to college. Data also show that affluent students more readily have access to expanded learning opportunities outside the classroom, whereas students from low-income families are significantly under-represented in afterschool programs in Vermont compared to national averages. (Fourteen percent of students in afterschool programs in Vermont qualify for free and reduced lunch rates compared to 45 percent nationally). The committees of jurisdiction should take testimony on the importance of afterschool programming in mitigating the achievement gap between students from low- and high-income families.

7. Lack of educational programming during the summer recess exacerbates the achievement gap between students from low-income families and their peers. The committees of jurisdiction are encouraged to take testimony on how students from families with low income are affected by the “summer slide” and on potential solutions to shrink the gap between socioeconomic classes.

8. The committees of jurisdiction are encouraged to examine how prevention initiatives could be successfully incentivized in the context of special education.

9. The Council believes that homeless teenagers can only succeed in school if their housing needs are addressed first. It recommends that the committees of jurisdiction bring housing and education advocates together to work collaboratively on this challenge.

10. Committees of jurisdiction **should** monitor the **implementation and** impact of Act 166, an act relating to providing access to publicly funded prekindergarten education, on Vermont’s Head

Start programs to ensure that early childhood education does not become segregated based on family income.⁶

-OR-

Committees of jurisdiction are encouraged to monitor and evaluate the implementation of Act 166, an act relating to providing access to publicly funded prekindergarten education, with a specific focus on the efficacy of joint agency administration, the effects of the law and assurances that early childhood education is not becoming segregated based on family income.

Areas of analysis could include the integration of Head Start in the pre-kindergarten education delivery system in order to ensure that children are not receiving pre-kindergarten services in socioeconomically segregated environments, as well as the implications of a ten-hour service model for families that cannot afford additional early childhood services.

11. Committees of jurisdiction, relying on the expertise of the Agency of Education and Department for Children and Families, are encouraged to explore policies that will ensure successful public/private partnerships for the delivery of prekindergarten education.

C. Housing

On October 20, 2016, the Council focused its attention on housing and homelessness in Vermont. At the meeting, the Vermont Affordable Housing Coalition testified that in order to afford a two-bedroom apartment in Vermont, a renter must earn \$43,947.00 annually, which constitutes an hourly wage of \$21.13 for a full-time job. This amounts to a shortfall of \$9.34 per hour between Vermont's estimated mean renter wage and the cost of a two-bedroom apartment.

At the conclusion of the hearing, the Council made the following recommendations:

1. Housing must be addressed prior to placing a person in an employment or educational setting. The Council recommends that the committees of jurisdiction review the approach taken in Utah, in which the state purchased low-income housing units and served as the landlord of those units.
2. The Council recommends that the committees of jurisdiction review the correlation (or lack thereof) between increased minimum wage and homelessness. The Council did not receive sufficient information to draw a conclusion about this relationship.

The Council also reaffirms its support of the following 2015 recommendations made by the Council's Subcommittee on Housing and Homelessness:

⁶ 2014 Acts and Resolves No. 166 is available at <http://legislature.vermont.gov/assets/Documents/2014/Docs/ACTS/ACT166/ACT166%20As%20Enacted.pdf>.

1. The General Assembly should support an increase in the funds available to help pay overdue rent owed by individuals at risk of becoming homeless through eviction. Assistance with up to three months of overdue rent is one of several forms of financial and rental assistance related to homelessness prevention and rapid rehousing that may be provided by community organizations that receive funding from the Office of Economic Opportunity's Housing and Opportunity Grant Program. Such assistance increases housing stability and can prevent children from becoming homeless.

2. The General Assembly should work with the Governor to adopt and implement the recommendations of the Governor's Council on Pathways from Poverty concerning housing and homelessness.⁷ These recommendations include:

a. fully funding the Vermont Housing and Conservation Board;

b. transitioning funding from temporary housing in motels to community-based solutions such as the Vermont Rental Subsidy Program, the Housing and Opportunity Grant Program, Family Supportive Housing, Mental Health Vouchers, and AHS Central Office Direct Service and Service Coordination Grants;

c. creating incentives for private, for-profit landlords to bring substandard or vacant rental housing up to code and back into the rental housing market; and

d. implementing a \$2.00 occupancy fee on lodging, that can be used to support affordable housing and homelessness prevention programs.

D. Economic Supports

At its October 20th and November 17th meetings, the Council also focused its attention on economic supports for families living in poverty. The Council specifically heard testimony about Reach Up and the Post-Secondary Education program.

The Council made the following recommendations regarding these programs:

1. The use of a two-generational approach to combat poverty has proven beneficial to families. The Council supports an expansion of the Post-Secondary Education program, as well as an increase in the ratable reimbursement within Reach Up.

2. Some potential Post-Secondary Education participants are unable take certain college courses due to the fact they do not contain elements required by the federal TANF program. The Departments of Labor and for Children and Families are encouraged to work with Vermont

⁷ The November 2015 report of the Council on Pathways from Poverty is available at <http://governor.vermont.gov/sites/governor/files/2015%20Poverty%20Council%20report%20to%20Governor%20FINAL.pdf>.

colleges to build certain certifications into the course work, which will provide PSE students with a greater variety of qualifying courses.

3. Lack of transportation is the single greatest barrier to employment among work-eligible Vermonters. To that end, the Council suggests that economic supports within Reach Up be expanded to provide more families with transportation to their employment and child care sites.

E. Substance Abuse and Mental Health

At its November 17th meeting, the Council heard testimony on the impacts of substance abuse and mental health disorders on low-income children, both with regard to personal and familial illnesses. Witnesses providing testimony to the Council explained that multiple adverse childhood experiences, such as living with someone who abuses substances or has a mental illness, significantly decrease a child's resiliency. Witnesses also emphasized the importance of connecting a child or family with services as soon as possible after an initial contact is made to capitalize on a participant's interest and engagement in services.

The Council makes the following recommendations:

1. There is a lack of information on individuals with co-occurring mental health and substance use disorders due to the fact that only one code is selected at the time of service. The Council recommends that the committees of jurisdiction work with the Departments of Health and Mental Health to generate better data for analysis.
2. The Council encourages the committees of jurisdiction to consider what more can be done to encourage low-income families to take advantage of substance use and mental health services offered in schools or the community.
3. The Council supports the development of initiatives to better train youth mental health clinicians in identifying, intervening, and treating co-occurrences of mental illness and substance use.
4. The Departments of Health and Mental Health should coordinate with community partners to better support youth with mental health challenges and other disabilities with regard to learning, mentoring, and internship opportunities.
5. The Council supports the appropriation of additional funds to the designated agencies for the purpose of expanding service delivery and ensuring timely access to cost-effective, evidence-based treatments.

F. Economic Empowerment

DRAFT

2016 Report of the Vermont Child Poverty Council

Representative Diane Lanpher, Co-Chair

Representative Jill Krowinski, Co-Chair

DRAFT

Appendix 1. 2007 Acts and Resolves No. 68

NO. 68. AN ACT RELATING TO CHILD POVERTY IN VERMONT.

It is hereby enacted by the General Assembly of the State of Vermont:

Sec. 1. VERMONT CHILD POVERTY COUNCIL

(a) The Vermont child poverty council is created to examine child poverty in Vermont and to make recommendations to the governor and general assembly on methods of improving the financial stability and well-being of children. The council shall develop a ten-year plan to reduce the number of children living in poverty in the state by at least 50%.

(b)(1) The council shall consist of the following members or their designees:

- (A) the president pro tempore of the senate;
- (B) the speaker of the house of representatives;
- (C) the chair of the senate committee on health and welfare;
- (D) the chair of the house committee on human services;
- (E) the chair of the senate committee on education;
- (F) the chair of the house committee on education;
- (G) the commissioners of the departments for children and families; of health; of education; and of labor; and

(H) one representative each from Voices for Vermont's Children, the Vermont low income advocacy council, Vermont Legal Aid, and the Vermont superintendents' association.

(2) The council, at its first meeting, shall elect one of the legislative members as chair or two legislative members as co-chairs. The legislative council and the joint fiscal office shall provide staff support to the council.

(3) The council shall meet up to six times while the general assembly is not in session to perform its functions under this section. In addition, during the 2007 legislative interim, the council shall hold 14 public hearings as required under subsection (d) of this section.

(c) The plan shall contain:

- (1) an identification and analysis of the occurrence of poverty in the state;
- (2) an analysis of the long-term effects of child poverty on children, their families, and their communities;
- (3) an analysis of costs of child poverty to municipalities and the state;
- (4) an inventory of state-wide public and private programs that address child poverty;
- (5) the percentage of the target population served by such programs and the current state funding levels, if any, for such programs;
- (6) an identification and analysis of any deficiencies or inefficiencies of such programs; and
- (7) procedures and priorities for implementing strategies and biannual benchmarks to achieve at least a 50% reduction in child poverty in the state by June 30, 2017. Such procedures, priorities, and benchmarks shall include improving or adequately funding:

- (A) workforce training and placement to promote career progression, for parents of children living in poverty;
 - (B) educational opportunities, including higher education opportunities, and advancement for such parents and children, including, but not limited to, pre-literacy, literacy, and family literacy programs;
 - (C) affordable housing for such parents and children;
 - (D) early care and education programs for such children and their families;
 - (E) after-school programs and mentoring programs for such children and their families;
 - (F) affordable health care access for such parents and children, including access to mental health services and family planning;
 - (G) treatment programs and services, including substance abuse programs and services, for such parents and children;
 - (H) accessible childhood nutrition programs; and
 - (I) the Reach-Up program and other public benefit programs through the agency of human services serving low income families.
- (d) In developing the working plan, the council shall first consult with experts, with parents of children living in poverty, and with providers of services to children and families living in poverty. The council shall hold one public hearing in each of the 14 counties.
- (e) Funds from private and public sources may be accepted and utilized by the council to develop and implement the plan and provisions of this section. Legislative members of the committee shall be entitled to compensation and reimbursement for expenses under section 406 of Title 2. All other members not receiving compensation for service on the committee from another source are entitled to compensation under section 1010 of Title 32.
- (f) Not later than January 1, 2008, the council shall submit the working plan to the house committees on appropriations and human services and the senate committees on appropriations and health and welfare. On January 1, 2009, and annually thereafter, until January 1, 2018, the council shall report to these committees on yearly progress toward benchmarks, updates to the plan, and recommendations for budgetary and policy changes in order to accomplish the goals of this act
- (g) The council shall cease to exist on June 30, 2018.

Approved: June 5, 2007

Appendix 2. 2014 Acts and Resolves No. 104

No. 104. AN ACT RELATING TO THE CHARGE OF THE VERMONT CHILD POVERTY COUNCIL.

(H.583)

It is hereby enacted by the General Assembly of the State of Vermont:

Sec. 1. 2007 Acts and Resolves No. 68, Sec. 1 is amended to read:

Sec. 1. VERMONT CHILD POVERTY COUNCIL

* * *

(b)(1) The ~~council~~ Council shall consist of the following members or their designees:

- (A) the ~~president pro tempore of the senate~~ President Pro Tempore of the Senate;
- (B) the ~~speaker of the house of representatives~~ Speaker of the House of Representatives;
- (C) the ~~chair of the senate committee on health and welfare~~ Chair of the Senate Committee on Health and Welfare;
- (D) the ~~chair of the house committee on human services~~ Chair of the House Committee on Human Services;
- (E) the ~~chair of the senate committee on education~~ Chair of the Senate Committee on Education;
- (F) the ~~chair of the house committee on education~~ Chair of the House Committee on Education;
- (G) the ~~commissioners of the departments for children and families; of health; of education; and of labor~~ Commissioners for Children and Families; of Health; and of Labor; and the Secretaries of Human Services and of Education; and
- (H) one representative each from Voices for Vermont's Children, the Vermont ~~low income advocacy council~~ Low Income Advocacy Council, Vermont Legal Aid, and the Vermont ~~superintendents' association~~ Superintendents' Association.

* * *

(3) The ~~council~~ Council shall meet up to six times while the ~~general assembly~~ General Assembly is not in session to perform its functions under this section. ~~In addition, during the 2007 legislative interim, the council shall hold 14 public hearings as required under subsection (d) of this section.~~ The Council may meet an unlimited number of times during the legislative session, but legislative Council members shall not receive compensation and reimbursement for expenses pursuant to subsection (e) of this section for participation in meetings during the legislative session.

(e) Funds from private and public sources may be accepted and utilized by the ~~council~~ Council to develop and implement the plan and provisions of this section. ~~Legislative For participation in meetings during the legislative interim, legislative members of the committee~~ Council shall be entitled to compensation and reimbursement for expenses under section 406 of Title 2 2 V.S.A. § 406. ~~All other members not receiving~~

~~compensation for service on the committee from another source are entitled to compensation under section 1010 of Title 32. Nonlegislative members who are not otherwise compensated and reimbursed for their participation on the Council shall be entitled to receive compensation and reimbursement of expenses under 32 V.S.A. § 1010.~~

* * *

Sec. 2. EFFECTIVE DATE

This act shall take effect on passage.

Date Governor signed bill: April 14, 2014

DRAFT

Appendix 3. 2016 Witness List

DRAFT