

## Initial Implementation of Act 46

Rebecca Holcombe January 13, 2016

## Overview:

-Why we are doing this?

- Progress to date?
- Clarifications and choices on the way?

Julia Dunn, Student member, CESU board

## Equity, Quality, Opportunity

We are able to share resources so that when kids come together at the high school, they have all had the same good opportunities and can be at the same level.

## State and local revenues to K-12 education as a share of GSP (2011-12)

Highest in Nation: 5.2\%


Thank you to Rep. Oliver Olsen for the image.
Act 46 Initial Implementation

## Fewer state income tax returns for resident taxpayers under age 65



Thank you to Rep. Oliver Olsen for the image.
Act 46 Initial Implementation
AGENCY OF EDUCATION


## Governance Activity to Date

Estimated 15 Votes expected before July 1, 2016:

- 8 supervisory unions have notified the AOE they are pursuing accelerated mergers
- We believe 2 more are pursuing accelerated mergers
- 1 accelerated merger was approved by voters
- AOE expects several RED or RED variation votes as well


## Also:

- 23 active Section 706b study committees to our knowledge
- Additional conversations about mergers across SU lines (including regional conversations)


## Governance Activity to Date by Region




Act 46 Initial Implementation
$\xrightarrow[\text { AGENCO O F EDOCATOON }]{\text {. VERMONT }}$

## Clarifications and Choices

## Clarification



## Supervisory Union

Board 1 Board 2 Board 3 Board 4 Board 5 Board 6 Board 7 Board 8


School 1 School 2 School 3 School 4 School 5 School 6 School 7 School 8

## Supervisory District



## Clarification



## Clarification: Difference between districts and schools

## Districts:

- Either operate school(s) or tuition district students to schools (public or private).
- Set a budget to cover the costs of either operating or tuitioning, and providing access.



## Schools:

- educate children
- have parent councils and traditions
- can be public or private


## Clarification: Tuitioning and Operating

## To Operate or Not Operate? That is the Question...



## Purposes of Education

- Democratic equity (Education as a public good, shared community purpose, common opportunities)
- Social and economic efficiency (Education as a public good, workers for the workforce)
- Individual advancement: "getting ahead" (Education as an individual good, use market competition to incentivize quality)

Note that these are contradictory goals. Schools will never "succeed."
Thank you to David Labaree, Stanford University, for framing.

## No strategy is perfect.

 All strategies present challenges. Different choices mean different challenges.District Structure: Main Challenges:
Meeting individual needs
Operating within one system.
If very small, controlling costs.
Tuitioning
Ensuring equity of opportunity, controlling costs. Operate at some levels All of above, can mitigate with and tuition at others scale.

These are typical challenges, although local circumstances may vary.

## To Operate or Not Operate?



Tuitioning and Operating

## If you tuition...



To operate or not to operate?

NO: Required to tuition at some or all levels. Parents get to select where kids go, unless board designates.
Primary challenges: Cost containment and equity.

Act 46, Section 45: Parents of secondary students choose a school in or out of the state unless the district votes to designate up to three VT schools (generally for purposes of cost containment).

## YES

## Challenge of Equity

Where publicly-funded tuition students attend school

| Type of School | Number of publicly funded students enrolled | \% of those publiclyfunded students with an IEP | \% of those publicly- funded students who are living in poverty |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Four Vermont "Academies" | 1948 | 12.27\% | 24.90\% |
| Approved Independent Schools EXCLUDING schools for only students with disabilities | 828 | 10.39\% | 27.54\% |
| Publicly tuitioned students attending VT Public Schools | 2614 | 22.88\% | 34.85\% |
| All Vermont Public Schools | 77611 | 14.67\% | 40.13\% |
| Tuitioning and Operating |  |  | -.VERMONT |

## Challenge of Cost

Costs can also rise as more students for whom tuition must be paid move into the district. If a budget fails, only local school costs can be reduced.



Tuitioning and Operating

## If you operate...



## Value for Dollars?

Do students in these VT public high schools have comparable opportunities? Do they have the opportunities they deserve?

## School A:

## Mathematics:

General Math
Pre-Algebra
Algebra I
Algebra II
Geometry
Trigonometry
Pre-Calculus
Calculus
AP Calculus AB
Business Math
Probability and Statistics-Other
Math Proficiency Development

## School B:

Mathematics:
Integrated Math
Problem Solving
Pre Algebra
Algebra I
Junior Math

## VT Operating and Tuitioning Options

NO: Required to tuition at some or all levels. Parents get to select where kids go, unless board designates.
Primary challenges:
To operate or not to operate?
 Cost containment and equity.

YES: Operate. Primary challenge: Maintaining quality and breadth of opportunities.

Act 46, Section 45: Parents of secondary students choose a school in or out of the state unless the district votes to designate up to three VT schools (generally for purposes of cost containment).

VSA 16, §822 (c):
School board may choose to pay tuition for an individual student if it is in the best interests of the child.
Act $\mathbf{1 2 9}$ of 2012 allows students to apply to attend any other public high school in the state; money does not follow the child.

## What would be the likely impact of tuitioning while operating?

Scenario 1

50 kids
Per pupil cost: \$14,000

Total operating budget: \$700,000

Scenario 2


50 kids
Per pupil cost: \$14,000
45 attend, 5 tuition students
Either:
Cut operating budget to $\$ 630,000$ and pay $\$ 70,000$ in tuition. (Total budget of $\$ 700,000$ ).

OR
Level fund operating budget and increase total expenditures to \$770,000

## Voters make the choice.



## Advice to Communities

## Identify and focus on YOUR goals and culture

- Start by clarifying your goals and core commitments.
- The RIGHT strategy is a function of local commitments and regional conditions.
- None of us can have everything, but we can get what we need.


## Guildhall

- Only 20 students in grades K-5
- Project only 10 students in 2018
- Expected per pupil costs to rise from \$12k to about \$20k
- Decided to close school and tuition


## Bridgewater and Pomfret

- Declining enrollments, rising taxes
- Wanted a community school
- Closed the Bridgewater school and now jointly operate the Prosper Valley School



## Elmore

- Tax rate increased \$0.15 between FY15 and FY16

- Projected to increase the same in FY17, which will put them over the threshold
- Held a revote on a merger with Morristown; now waiting on a revote in Morristown.
- If revote fails, Board expects a $\$ 0.35$ tax increase
Choices


## North Bennington



NB ID School District decided to not operate a school.

FY15: North Bennington students attended elementary school in 5 schools in 4 towns.

North Bennington ID tax rate has gone up about $20 \%$ from FY13 to FY16. The State as a whole has gone up about $16 \%$ in that time.

## Bolton



## FY14 ETR = 1.5538 FY15 ETR = 1.7162 FY16 ETR = 1.6304

The new entity tax rate is 1.5450 and with the 8 cents off, the incentive rate is 1.4651 . Bolton is in the four year transition period that limits a tax rate increase or decrease to $5 \%$. Under that limit, Bolton's rate can only go down to 1.6304

## Weybridge

FY16:
The Education Fund sent $\$ 366,140$ to Weybridge beyond what it raised off its local homestead base.


Town Equalized Homestead Rates

|  | FY2014 | FY2015 | FY2016 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Weybridge | 1.635 | 1.881 | 2.015 |
| Hard Choice |  |  | VERMONT |

## The Challenge



We have one education fund.

Are individual districts making decisions we can all afford?

Are we making decisions that take care of our most vulnerable children?

The Challenge

## Caution: tax incentives are a means to an end, not an end in themselves

- Tax benefits cover transition costs, then go away.
- Don't make changes for the sake of short term tax reductions that were designed to offset transition costs.

"I think the community made a really good case that we're better off together than we are separated. We're trying to do what's best for the students in this community, so that's been the impetus."

John Alberghini, CESU



Act 46: Unification to Achieve Sustainable Governance


What is Act 46?
Act 46 of 2015 is an opportunity for districts and supervisory unions to unify existing disparate governance structures into sustainable systems of education delivery that are designed to meet identified State goals, while ecognizing and reflecting local priorities. Learn more


What are my options?
There are several different routes to take that may provide incentives for communities that voluntarily merge. Learn more.

- Phase 1: Accelerated
- Phase 2: REDs and

Variations

- Phase 3: Conventional
- Study Committee Worksheet


FAQs and Other Resources
The Agency has provided answers to frequently asked questions and clarification regarding Act 46 and the related Acts 153 (2010) and 156 (2012) Links to other related resources are also listed. Learn more
http://education.vermont.gov/laws/2015/act-46

