No. 59. An act relating to establishing a government transparency office to enforce the public records act.

(H.73)

It is hereby enacted by the General Assembly of the State of Vermont:

Sec. 1. 1 V.S.A. § 315 is amended to read:

§ 315. STATEMENT OF POLICY

It is the policy of this subchapter to provide for free and open examination of records consistent with Chapter I, Article 6 of the Vermont Constitution. Officers of government are trustees and servants of the people and it is in the public interest to enable any person to review and criticize their decisions even though such examination may cause inconvenience or embarrassment. All people, however, have a right to privacy in their personal and economic pursuits, which ought to be protected unless specific information is needed to review the action of a governmental officer. Consistent with these principles, the general assembly hereby declares that certain public records shall be made available to any person as hereinafter provided. To that end, the provisions of this subchapter shall be liberally construed ~~with the view towards carrying out the above declaration of public policy~~ <u>to implement this policy, and the burden of proof shall be on the public agency to sustain its action</u>.

Sec. 2. 1 V.S.A. § 316 is amended to read:

§ 316. ACCESS TO PUBLIC RECORDS AND DOCUMENTS

(a) Any person may inspect or copy any public record ~~or document~~ of a public agency, as follows:

(1) For any agency, board, department, commission, committee, branch, instrumentality, or authority of the state, a person may inspect a public record on any day other than a Saturday, Sunday, or a legal holiday, between the hours of nine o'clock and 12 o'clock in the forenoon and between one o'clock and four o'clock in the afternoon; ~~provided, however, if the public agency is not regularly open to the public during those hours, inspection or copying may be made~~

(2) For any agency, board, committee, department, instrumentality, commission, or authority of a political subdivision of the state, a person may inspect a public record during customary ~~office~~ business hours.

(b) If copying equipment maintained for use by a public agency is used by the agency to copy the public record or document requested, the agency may charge and collect from the person requesting the copy the actual cost of providing the copy. The agency may also charge and collect from the person making the request, the costs associated with mailing or transmitting the record by facsimile or other electronic means. Nothing in this section shall exempt any person from paying fees otherwise established by law for obtaining copies

of public records or documents, but if such fee is established for the copy, no additional costs or fees shall be charged.

(c) ~~In~~ Unless otherwise provided by law, in the following instances an agency may also charge and collect the cost of staff time associated with complying with a request for a copy of a public record: (1) the time directly involved in complying with the request exceeds 30 minutes; (2) the agency agrees to create a public record; or (3) the agency agrees to provide the public record in a nonstandard format and the time directly involved in complying with the request exceeds 30 minutes. The agency may require that requests subject to staff time charges under this subsection be made in writing and that all charges be paid, in whole or in part, prior to delivery of the copies. Upon request, the agency shall provide an estimate of the charge.

(d) The secretary of state, after consultation with the secretary of administration, shall establish the actual cost of providing a copy of a public record that may be charged by state agencies. The secretary shall also establish the amount that may be charged for staff time, when such a charge is authorized under this section. To determine "actual cost" the secretary shall consider the following only: the cost of the paper or the electronic media onto which a public record is copied, a prorated amount for maintenance and replacement of the machine or equipment used to copy the record and any utility charges directly associated with copying a record. The secretary of state

shall adopt, by rule, a uniform schedule of public record charges for state agencies.

(e) After public hearing, the legislative body of a political subdivision shall establish actual cost charges for copies of public records. The legislative body shall also establish the amount that may be charged for staff time, when such a charge is authorized under this section. To determine actual cost charges, the legislative body shall use the same factors used by the secretary of state. If a legislative body fails to establish a uniform schedule of charges, the charges for that political subdivision shall be the uniform schedule of charges established by the secretary of state until the local legislative body establishes such a schedule. A schedule of public records charges shall be posted in prominent locations in the town offices.

* * *

Sec. 3. 1 V.S.A. § 317 is amended to read:

§ 317. DEFINITIONS; PUBLIC AGENCY; PUBLIC RECORDS AND DOCUMENTS

(a) As used in this subchapter~~,~~:

(1) "Business day" means a day that a public agency is open to provide services.

(2) "~~public~~ Public agency" or "agency" means any agency, board, department, commission, committee, branch, instrumentality, or authority of

the state or any agency, board, committee, department, branch, instrumentality, commission, or authority of any political subdivision of the state.

(b) As used in this subchapter, "public record" or "public document" means any written or recorded information, regardless of physical form or characteristics, which is produced or acquired in the course of public agency business. Individual salaries and benefits of and salary schedules relating to elected or appointed officials and employees of public agencies shall not be exempt from public inspection and copying.

(c) The following public records are exempt from public inspection and copying:

* * *

(5) records dealing with the detection and investigation of crime, including those maintained on any individual or compiled in the course of a criminal or disciplinary investigation by any police or professional licensing agency; provided, however, that records relating to management and direction of a law enforcement agency ~~and~~; records reflecting the initial arrest of a person, including any ticket, citation, or complaint issued for a traffic violation, as that term is defined in 23 V.S.A. § 2302; and records reflecting the charge of a person shall be public;

* * *

Sec. 4. 1 V.S.A. § 318 is amended to read:

§ 318. PROCEDURE

(a) Upon request, the custodian of a public record shall promptly produce the record for inspection, except that:

(1) if the record is in active use or in storage and therefore not available for use at the time the person asks to examine it, the custodian shall so certify this fact in writing to the applicant and set a date and hour within one calendar week of the request when the record will be available for examination;

(2) if the custodian considers the record to be exempt from inspection under the provisions of this subchapter, the custodian shall so certify in writing. Such certification shall identify the records withheld and the basis for the denial. ~~The~~ A record shall be produced for inspection or a certification shall be made that a record is exempt within ~~two~~ three business days of receipt of the request, unless otherwise provided in subdivision (5) of this subsection. The certification shall include the asserted statutory basis for denial and a brief statement of the reasons and supporting facts for denial. The custodian shall also notify the person of his or her right to appeal to the head of the agency any adverse determination;

(3) if appealed to the head of the agency, the head of the agency shall make a determination with respect to any appeal within five business days~~, excepting Saturdays, Sundays, and legal public holidays,~~ after the receipt of

such appeal. If an appeal of the denial of the request for records is in whole or in part upheld, the agency shall notify the person making such request of the provisions for judicial review of that determination under section 319 of this title;

(4) if a record does not exist, the custodian shall certify in writing that the record does not exist under the name given to the custodian by the applicant or by any other name known to the custodian;

(5) in unusual circumstances as herein specified the time limits prescribed in this subsection may be extended by written notice to the person making such request setting forth the reasons for such extension and the date on which a determination is expected to be dispatched. No such notice shall specify a date that would result in an extension for more than ten ~~working~~ business days from receipt of the request. As used in this subdivision, "unusual circumstances" means to the extent reasonably necessary to the proper processing of the particular request:

(A) the need to search for and collect the requested records from field facilities or other establishments that are separate from the office processing the request;

(B) the need to search for, collect, and appropriately examine a voluminous amount of separate and distinct records which are demanded in a single request; or

(C) the need for consultation, which shall be conducted with all practicable speed, with another agency having a substantial interest in the determination of the request or among two or more components of the agency having substantial subject matter interest therein, or with the attorney general.

(b) Any person making a request to any agency for records under subsection (a) of this section shall be deemed to have exhausted the person's administrative remedies with respect to each request if the agency fails to comply within the applicable time limit provisions of this section. Upon any determination by an agency to comply with a request for records, the records shall be made available promptly to the person making such request. Any notification of denial of any request for records under this section shall set forth the names and titles or positions of each person responsible for the denial of such request.

(c)(1) Any denial of access by the custodian of a public record may be appealed to the head of the agency. The head of the agency shall make a written determination on an appeal within five business days after the receipt of the appeal. A written determination shall include the asserted statutory basis for denial and a brief statement of the reasons and supporting facts for denial.

(2) If the head of the agency reverses the denial of a request for records, the records shall be promptly made available to the person making the request.

A failure by the agency to comply with any of the time limit provisions of this section shall be deemed a final denial of the request for records by the agency.

(d) In responding to a request to inspect or copy a record under this subchapter, a public agency shall consult with the person making the request in order to clarify the request or to obtain additional information that will assist the public agency in responding to the request and, when authorized by this subchapter, in facilitating production of the requested record for inspection or copying. In unusual circumstances, as that term is defined in subdivision (a)(5) of this section, a public agency may request that a person seeking a voluminous amount of separate and distinct records narrow the scope of a public records request.

(e) A public agency shall not withhold any record in its entirety on the basis that it contains some exempt content if the record is otherwise subject to disclosure; instead, the public agency shall redact the information it considers to be exempt and produce the record accompanied by an explanation of the basis for denial of the redacted information.

(f) If a person making the request has a disability which requires accommodation to gain equal access to the public record sought, the person shall notify the public agency of the type of accommodation requested. The public agency shall give primary consideration to the accommodation choice expressed by the requestor, but may propose an alternative accommodation so

long as it achieves equal access. The public agency shall provide accommodation to the person making the request unless the agency can demonstrate that accommodation would result in a fundamental alteration in the nature of its service, programs, activities, or in undue financial and administrative burden.

(g) The secretary of state shall provide municipal public agencies and members of the public information and advice regarding the requirements of the public records act and may utilize informational websites, toll-free telephone numbers, or other methods to provide such information and advice.

Sec. 5. 1 V.S.A. § 319 is amended to read:

§ 319. ENFORCEMENT

(a) Any person aggrieved by the denial of a request for public records under this subchapter may apply to the civil division of the superior court in the county in which the complainant resides, or has his or her personal place of business, or in which the public records are situated, or in the civil division of the superior court of Washington County, to enjoin the public agency from withholding agency records and to order the production of any agency records improperly withheld from the complainant. In such a case, the court shall determine the matter de novo, and may examine the contents of such agency records in camera to determine whether such records or any part thereof shall

be withheld under any of the exemptions set forth in section 317 of this title, and the burden ~~is~~ of proof shall be on the public agency to sustain its action.

(b) Except as to cases the court considers of greater importance, proceedings before the civil division of the superior court, as authorized by this section, and appeals there from, take precedence on the docket over all cases and shall be assigned for hearing and trial or for argument at the earliest practicable date and expedited in every way.

(c) If the public agency can show the court that exceptional circumstances exist and that the agency is exercising due diligence in responding to the request, the court may retain jurisdiction and allow the agency additional time to complete its review of the records.

(d)(1) ~~The~~ Except as provided in subdivision (2) of this subsection, the court ~~may~~ shall assess against the public agency reasonable attorney fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred in any case under this section in which the complainant has substantially prevailed.

(2) The court may, in its discretion, assess against a public agency reasonable attorney fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred in a case under this section in which the complainant has substantially prevailed provided that the public agency, within the time allowed for service of an answer under Rule 12(a)(1) of the Vermont Rules of Civil Procedure:

(A) concedes that a contested record or contested records are public; and

(B) provides the record or records to the complainant.

(3) The court may assesses against the complainant reasonable attorney fees and other litigation costs reasonably incurred in any case under this section when the court finds that the complainant has violated Rule 11 of the Vermont Rules of Civil Procedure.

Sec. 6. 1 V.S.A. § 320(b) is amended to read:

(b) In the event of noncompliance with the order of the court, the civil division of the superior court may punish for contempt the responsible employee or official, and in the case of a uniformed service, the responsible member.

Sec. 7. 1 V.S.A. § 313(a)(6) is amended to read:

(6) Discussion or consideration of records or documents excepted from the access to public records provisions of ~~subsection~~ section 317~~(b)~~ of this title. Discussion or consideration of the excepted record or document shall not itself permit an extension of the executive session to the general subject to which the record or document pertains;

Sec. 8. 3 V.S.A. § 218(d) is amended to read:

(d) The head of each state agency or department shall designate a member of his or her staff as the records officer for his or her agency or department,

and shall notify the Vermont state archives and records administration in writing of the name and title of the person designated, and shall post the name and contact information of the person on the agency or department website, if one exists.

Sec. 9. 9 V.S.A. § 4113(b) is amended to read:

(b) Reports filed pursuant to this section shall be an exempt record and confidential pursuant to ~~subdivision 317(b)(1) of Title 1~~ 1 V.S.A. § 317(c)(1) and shall be maintained for the sole and confidential use of the commissioner, except that the reports may be disclosed to the federal government or to the appropriate energy agency or department of another state with substantially similar confidentiality statutes for regulations with respect to such reports. However, the commissioner shall make available to appropriate committees of the general assembly statistical information derived from the reports required by this section, provided that this may be done in a manner which preserves the confidentiality of the reports submitted by particular persons.

Sec. 10. 32 V.S.A. § 3755(e) is amended to read:

(e) Any applicant for appraisal under this subchapter bears the burden of proof as to his or her qualification. Any documents submitted by an applicant as evidence of income shall be held in confidence by any person accepting or reviewing them pursuant to provisions of this subchapter, and shall not be

made available for public examination, whether or not such person is subject to the provisions of ~~subdivision 317(a)(6) of Title 1~~ 1 V.S.A. § 317(c)(6).

Sec. 11. PUBLIC RECORDS LEGISLATIVE STUDY COMMITTEE

(a) There is established a legislative study committee to review the requirements of the public records act and the numerous exemptions to that act in order to assure the integrity, viability, and the ultimate purposes of the act. The review committee shall consist of:

(1) Three members of the house of representatives, appointed by the speaker of the house; and

(2) Three members of the senate, appointed by the committee on committees.

(b) The review committee shall review the exemptions set forth in 1 V.S.A. § 317 or elsewhere in the Vermont Statutes Annotated to the inspection and copying of public records under the public records act, 1 V.S.A. chapter 5, subchapter 3. Prior to each legislative session, the committee shall submit to the house and senate committees on government operations and the house and senate committees on judiciary recommendations concerning whether the public records act and exemptions under the act from inspection and copying of a public record should be repealed, amended, or remain unchanged. The report of the committee may take the form of draft legislation.

(c) In reviewing and making a recommendation under subsection (b) of

this section, the study committee may review:

(1) Whether the public records act requires revision;

(2) Whether an exemption to inspection or copying under the public records act is necessary, antiquated, or in need of revision;

(3) Whether an exemption to inspection or copying under the public records act is as narrowly tailored as possible, including the need to clarify the term "personal documents" referenced in 1 V.S.A. § 317(c)(7) in order to ensure that it does not unintentionally limit access to public records that are not personnel records; and

(4) Whether the public records act should be amended to clarify application of the act to contracts between a public agency and a private entity for the performance of a governmental function;

(5) Whether or not to authorize a public agency to charge for staff time associated with responding to a request to inspect or copy a public record, including whether an agency should be authorized to charge for the staff time incurred in locating, reviewing, or redacting a public record; and

(6) Any other criteria that assist the review committee in determining the value of an exemption as compared to the public's interest in the public record protected by the exemption.

(7) Whether a municipality and how a municipality shall appoint or designate an official, officer, or employee responsible for advising municipal

employees and any agency, board, committee, department, instrumentality, commission, or authority of the municipality regarding the requirements of the public records act and proper management of public records. As used in this subdivision, "municipality" shall mean a city, town, village or school district.

(d) In developing recommendations authorized under subsection (a) of this section, the study committee shall consult with the secretary of administration, the secretary of state, the office of the attorney general, representatives of municipal interests, representatives of school or education interests, representatives of the media, and advocates for access to public records.

(e) The study committee shall elect co-chairs from among its members. For attendance at a meeting when the general assembly is not in session, legislative members of the commission shall be entitled to the same per diem compensation and reimbursement for actual and necessary expenses as provided members of standing committees under 2 V.S.A. § 406. The study committee is authorized to meet three times each year during the interim between sessions of the general assembly, provided that the speaker of the house and the committee on committees may authorize the study committee to hold additional meetings during the interim between sessions so that the committee may accomplish its charge.

(f) Legislative council shall provide legal and administrative services to the study committee. The study committee may utilize the legal, research, and

administrative services of other entities, such as educational institutions and, when necessary for the performance of its duties, the Vermont state archives and records administration.

Sec. 12. LEGISLATIVE COUNCIL; LIST OF PUBLIC RECORDS ACT EXEMPTIONS

The legislative council, under its statutory revision authority set forth in 2 V.S.A. § 421, shall compile a list of all known Vermont statutory exemptions to the inspection and copying of public records under the public records act, 1 V.S.A. chapter 5, subchapter 3. Legislative council shall publish the list of exemptions compiled under this section as a statutory revision note to 1 V.S.A. § 317 and shall update the list as necessary.

Sec. 13. STATE AGENCY PUBLIC RECORDS REQUEST SYSTEM

(a) Beginning July 1, 2011, all state agencies that receive a request to inspect or copy a public record shall catalogue the request in the public records request system that the secretary of administration established in response to the requirements of Sec. 3 of No. 132 of the Acts of the 2005 Adj. Sess. (2006).

(b) The secretary of administration shall revise and update the public records request system so that it includes: the date a public records request is received; the state agency that received the request; the organization or individual that made the request, including a contact name; the status of the

request, including whether the request was fulfilled in whole, fulfilled in part, or denied; if the request was fulfilled in part or denied, the exemption or other grounds asserted as the basis for partial fulfillment or denial; the estimated hours necessary to respond to the request; the date the state agency closed the request; and the elapsed time between receipt of the request and the date the agency closed the request.

(c) On or before January 15, 2012, and annually thereafter, the secretary of administration shall submit to the senate and house committees on government operations a copy of the records requests catalogued in the public records request system in the preceding calendar year.

(d)(1) As a part of the report issued on or before January 15, 2012 to the senate and house committees on government operations under subsection (c) of this section, the secretary of administration, after consultation with the department of information and innovation and the Vermont state archives and records administration, shall submit a report regarding implementation by state agencies of an electronic documents management system for the creation, management, archiving, redaction, and confidential designation of records produced or acquired by state agencies. The report shall include a recommendation as to whether a documents management system should be implemented by state agencies.

(2) If the secretary recommends implementation of a document management system, the recommendation shall:

(A) identify a specific document management system for implementation by state agencies. The report shall summarize the operation or application of the system, provide a short explanation of the basis for selection of the system, and describe how the system will improve efficiency of state agencies in managing public records;

(B) estimate the cost of implementation by state agencies of the recommended document system;

(C) propose a schedule for implementation of the recommended document management system by all state agencies.

Sec. 14. PUBLIC RECORDS REQUESTS; MUNICIPALITIES

The secretary of state, after consultation with the Vermont League of Cities and Towns, annually shall survey municipalities in the state regarding whether municipalities are receiving an increased number of requests to inspect records, whether requests for inspection of public records are being used to circumvent copying of a record by a municipality, and whether requests to inspect records pose any administrative burdens on municipalities. For purposes of this subsection, "municipality" shall mean a city, town, village, or school district of the state. On or before January 15, 2012 and annually thereafter, the secretary

of state shall submit the results of the survey to the senate and house committees on government operations.

Sec. 15. COURT ADMINISTRATOR REPORT ON PUBLIC RECORDS CASES

On or before January 15, 2012 and annually thereafter, the Vermont court administrator's office shall report to the senate and house committees on government operations regarding contested cases filed in the civil division of the superior court involving disputes under the Public Records Act, as set forth in 1 V.S.A. chapter 5, subchapter 4. The report shall include the number of Public Records Act contested cases filed annually in the civil division of the superior court, the disposition of such cases, and whether attorney's fees were awarded in any of the cases. The court administrator shall submit a copy of a report required under this section to the secretary of state at the same time the report is submitted to the senate and house committees on government operations.

Sec. 16. REPEAL

Sec. 11 of this act (public records legislative study committee) is repealed on January 15, 2015.

Sec. 17. EFFECTIVE DATE

This act shall take effect on July 1, 2011.

Approved: June 1, 2011