

1 TO THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES:

2 The Committee on Commerce and Economic Development to which was
3 referred House Bill No. 35 entitled “An act relating to adopting the Uniform
4 Voidable Transactions Act” respectfully reports that it has considered the same
5 and recommends that the bill be amended by striking out all after the enacting
6 clause and inserting in lieu thereof the following:

7 Sec. 1. 9 V.S.A. chapter 57 is amended to read:

8 CHAPTER 57. ~~FRAUDULENT CONVEYANCES~~ VOIDABLE
9 TRANSACTIONS AND FALSE CHECKS

10 Subchapter 1: ~~Fraudulent Transfers~~ Voidable Transactions

11 § 2285. DEFINITIONS

12 As used in this chapter:

13 (1) “Affiliate” means:

14 (A) a person who directly or indirectly owns, controls, or holds with
15 power to vote, 20 percent or more of the outstanding voting securities of the
16 debtor, other than a person who holds the securities:

17 (i) as a fiduciary or agent without sole discretionary power to vote
18 the securities; or

19 (ii) solely to secure a debt, if the person has not exercised the
20 power to vote;

1 (B) a corporation 20 percent or more of whose outstanding voting
2 securities are directly or indirectly owned, controlled, or held with power to
3 vote by the debtor or a person that directly or indirectly owns, controls, or
4 holds, with power to vote, 20 percent or more of the outstanding voting
5 securities of the debtor, other than a person that holds the securities:

6 (i) as a fiduciary or agent without sole discretionary power to vote
7 the securities; or

8 (ii) solely to secure a debt, if the person has not in fact exercised
9 the power to vote;

10 (C) a person whose business is operated by the debtor under a lease
11 or other agreement, or a person substantially all of whose assets are controlled
12 by the debtor; or

13 ~~(C)~~(D) a person who operates the debtor’s business under a lease or
14 other agreement or controls substantially all of the debtor’s assets.

15 (2) “Asset” means property of a debtor, but the term does not include:

16 (A) property to the extent it is encumbered by a valid lien;

17 (B) property to the extent it is generally exempt under nonbankruptcy
18 law; or

19 (C) an interest in property held in tenancy by the entirety to the
20 extent it is not subject to process by a creditor holding a claim against only one
21 tenant.

1 (3) “Claim”, except as used in “claim for relief” means a right to
2 payment, whether or not the right is reduced to judgement, liquidated,
3 unliquidated, fixed, contingent, matured, unmatured, disputed, undisputed,
4 legal, equitable, secured, or unsecured.

5 (4) “Creditor” means a person who has a claim.

6 (5) “Debt” means liability on a claim.

7 (6) “Debtor” means a person who is liable on a claim.

8 (7) “Electronic” means relating to technology having electrical, digital,
9 magnetic, wireless, optical, electromagnetic, or similar capabilities.

10 (8) “Insider” includes:

11 (A) if the debtor is an individual,

12 (i) a relative of the debtor or of a general partner of the debtor;

13 (ii) a partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;

14 (iii) a general partner in a partnership described in subdivision

15 (A)(ii) of this subdivision ~~(6)~~(8) ;

16 (iv) a corporation of which the debtor is a director, officer, or
17 person in control; or

18 (v) a member-managed limited liability company in which the
19 debtor is a member, a manager-managed limited liability company in which
20 the debtor is a manager, or any limited liability company in which the debtor is
21 in control;

1 (vi) a member in a member-managed limited liability company or
2 a manager in a manager-managed limited liability company as described in
3 subdivision (A)(v) of this subdivision ~~(6)~~(8) ;

4 (B) if the debtor is a corporation,

5 (i) a director of the debtor;

6 (ii) an officer of the debtor;

7 (iii) a person in control of the debtor;

8 (iv) a partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;

9 (v) a general partner in a partnership described in subdivision

10 (B)(iv) of this subdivision ~~(6)~~(8); or

11 (vi) a relative of a general partner, director, officer, or person in
12 control of the debtor;

13 (C) if the debtor is a partnership,

14 (i) a general partner in the debtor;

15 (ii) a relative of a general partner in, a general partner of, or a
16 person in control of the debtor;

17 (iii) another partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;

18 (iv) a general partner in a partnership described in subdivision

19 (C)(iii) of this subdivision ~~(6)~~(8); or

20 (v) a person in control of the debtor;

21 (D) if the debtor is a limited liability company,

- 1 (i) a member of the member-managed limited liability company;
- 2 (ii) a manager of the manager-managed limited liability company;
- 3 (iii) a partnership in which the debtor is a general partner;
- 4 (iv) a general partner in a partnership described in subdivision
- 5 (D)(iii) of this subdivision ~~(6)~~(8); or
- 6 (v) a person in control of the debtor;
- 7 (E) an affiliate, or an insider of an affiliate as if the affiliate were the
- 8 debtor; and
- 9 (F) a managing agent of the debtor.

10 ~~(7)~~(9) “Lien” means a charge against or an interest in property to secure

11 payment of a debt or performance of an obligation, and includes a security

12 interest created by agreement, a judicial lien obtained by legal or equitable

13 process or proceedings, a common-law lien, or a statutory lien.

14 (10) “Organization” means a person other than an individual.

15 ~~(8)~~(11) “Person” means an individual, partnership, corporation, limited

16 liability company, association, organization, government or governmental

17 subdivision or agency, business trust, estate, trust, or any other legal or

18 commercial entity.

19 ~~(9)~~(12) “Property” means anything that may be the subject of

20 ownership.

1 ~~(10)~~(14) “Relative” means an individual related by consanguinity within
2 the third degree as determined by the common law, a spouse, or an individual
3 related to a spouse within the third degree as so determined, and includes an
4 individual in an adoptive relationship within the third degree.

5 (15) “Sign” means, with present intent to authenticate or adopt a record:

6 (A) to execute or adopt a tangible symbol; or

7 (B) to attach to or logically associate with the record an electronic
8 symbol, sound, or process.

9 ~~(11)~~(16) “Transfer” means every mode, direct or indirect, absolute or
10 conditional, voluntary or involuntary, of disposing of or parting with an asset
11 or an interest in an asset, and includes payment of money, release, lease, and
12 creation of a lien or other encumbrance.

13 ~~(12)~~(17) “Valid lien” means a lien that is effective against the holder of
14 a judicial lien subsequently obtained by legal or equitable process or
15 proceedings.

16 § 2286. INSOLVENCY

17 (a) A debtor is insolvent if, at a fair valuation, the sum of the debtor’s debts
18 is greater than ~~all of the~~ sum of the debtor’s assets ~~at a fair valuation~~.

19 (b) A debtor who is generally not paying his or her debts as they become
20 due other than as a result of a bona fide dispute is presumed to be insolvent.

21 The presumption imposes on the party against which the presumption is

1 directed the burden of proving that the nonexistence of insolvency is more
2 probable than its existence.

3 ~~(c) A partnership is insolvent under subsection (a) of this section if the sum~~
4 ~~of the partnership's debts is greater than the aggregate, at a fair valuation, of all~~
5 ~~of the partnership's assets and the sum of the excess of the value of each~~
6 ~~general partner's nonpartnership assets over the partner's nonpartnership debts.~~

7 ~~(d)~~ Assets under this section do not include property that has been
8 transferred, concealed, or removed with the intent to hinder, delay, or defraud
9 creditors or that has been transferred in a manner making the transfer violable
10 under this chapter.

11 ~~(e)~~(d) Debts under this section do not include an obligation to the extent it
12 is secured by a valid lien on property of the debtor not included as an asset.

13 § 2287. VALUE

14 (a) Value is given for a transfer or an obligation if, in exchange for the
15 transfer or obligation, property is transferred or an antecedent debt is secured
16 or satisfied, but value does not include an unperformed promise made
17 otherwise than in the ordinary course of the promisor's business to furnish
18 support to the debtor or another person.

19 (b) For the purposes of subdivision 2288(a)(2) and section 2289 of this
20 title, a person gives a reasonably equivalent value if the person acquires an
21 interest of the debtor in an asset pursuant to a regularly conducted,

1 nonconclusive foreclosure sale or execution of a power of sale for the
2 acquisition or disposition of the interest of the debtor upon default under a
3 mortgage, deed of trust, or security agreement.

4 (c) A transfer is made for present value if the exchange between the debtor
5 and the transferee is intended by them to be contemporaneous and is in fact
6 substantially contemporaneous.

7 § 2288. ~~TRANSFERS FRAUDULENT AS TO PRESENT AND FUTURE~~
8 CREDITORS TRANSFER OR OBLIGATION VOIDABLE AS TO
9 PRESENT OR FUTURE CREDITOR

10 (a) A transfer made or obligation incurred by a debtor is ~~fraudulent~~
11 voidable as to a creditor, whether the creditor's claim arose before or after the
12 transfer was made or the obligation was incurred, if the debtor made the
13 transfer or incurred the obligation:

14 (1) with actual intent to hinder, delay, or defraud any creditor of the
15 debtor; or

16 (2) without receiving a reasonably equivalent value in exchange for the
17 transfer or obligation, and the debtor:

18 (A) was engaged or was about to engage in a business or a
19 transaction for which the remaining assets of the debtor were unreasonably
20 small in relation to the business or transaction; or

1 (B) intended to incur, or believed or reasonably should have believed
2 that he or she would incur, debts beyond his or her ability to pay as they
3 became due.

4 (b) In determining actual intent under subdivision (a)(1) of this section,
5 consideration may be given, among other factors, to whether:

6 (1) the transfer or obligation was to an insider;

7 (2) the debtor retained possession or control of the property transferred
8 after the transfer;

9 (3) the transfer or obligation was disclosed or concealed;

10 (4) before the transfer was made or obligation was incurred, the debtor
11 had been sued or threatened with suit;

12 (5) the transfer was of substantially all the debtor's assets;

13 (6) the debtor absconded;

14 (7) the debtor removed or concealed assets;

15 (8) the value of the consideration received by the debtor was reasonably
16 equivalent to the value of the asset transferred or the amount of the obligation
17 incurred;

18 (9) the debtor was insolvent or became insolvent shortly after the
19 transfer was made or the obligation was incurred;

20 (10) the transfer occurred shortly before or shortly after a substantial
21 debt was incurred; and

1 (11) the debtor transferred the essential assets of the business to a lienor
2 who transferred the assets to an insider of the debtor.

3 (c) A creditor making a claim for relief under subsection (a) of this section
4 has the burden of proving the elements of the claim for relief by a
5 preponderance of the evidence.

6 § 2289. ~~TRANSFERS FRAUDULENT AS TO PRESENT CREDITORS~~
7 TRANSFER OR OBLIGATION VOIDABLE AS TO PRESENT
8 CREDITOR

9 (a) A transfer made or obligation incurred by a debtor is ~~fraudulent~~
10 voidable as to a creditor whose claim arose before the transfer was made or the
11 obligation was incurred if the debtor made the transfer or incurred the
12 obligation without receiving a reasonably equivalent value in exchange for the
13 transfer or obligation and the debtor was insolvent at that time or the debtor
14 became insolvent as a result of the transfer or obligation.

15 (b) A transfer made by a debtor is ~~fraudulent~~ voidable as to a creditor
16 whose claim arose before the transfer was made if the transfer was made to an
17 insider for an antecedent debt, the debtor was insolvent at that time, and the
18 insider had reasonable cause to believe that the debtor was insolvent.

19 (c) Subject to subsection 2286(b) of this title, a creditor making a claim for
20 relief under subsection (a) or (b) of this section has the burden of proving the
21 elements of the claim for relief by a preponderance of the evidence.

1 § 2290. WHEN TRANSFER IS MADE OR OBLIGATION IS INCURRED

2 For the purposes of this chapter:

3 (1) a transfer is made:

4 (A) with respect to an asset that is real property other than a fixture,
5 but including the interest of a seller or purchaser under a contract for the sale
6 of the asset, when the transfer is so far perfected that a good-faith purchaser of
7 the asset from the debtor against whom applicable law permits the transfer to
8 be perfected cannot acquire an interest in the asset that is superior to the
9 interest of the transferee; and

10 (B) with respect to an asset that is not real property or that is a
11 fixture, when the transfer is so far perfected that a creditor on a simple contract
12 cannot acquire a judicial lien otherwise than under this chapter that is superior
13 to the interest of the transferee;

14 (2) if applicable law permits the transfer to be perfected as provided in
15 subdivision (1) of this section and the transfer is not so perfected before the
16 commencement of an action for relief under this chapter, the transfer is deemed
17 made immediately before the commencement of the action;

18 (3) if applicable law does not permit the transfer to be perfected as
19 provided in subdivision (1) of this section, the transfer is made when it
20 becomes effective between the debtor and the transferee;

1 (4) a transfer is not made until the debtor has acquired rights in the asset
2 transferred;

3 (5) an obligation is incurred:

4 (A) if oral, when it becomes effective between parties; or

5 (B) if evidenced by a ~~writing~~ record, when the ~~writing~~ record
6 ~~executed~~ signed by the obligor is delivered to or for the benefit of the obligee.

7 § 2291. REMEDIES OF ~~CREDITORS~~ CREDITOR

8 (a) In an action for relief against a transfer or obligation under this chapter,
9 a creditor, subject to the limitations in section 2292 of this title, may obtain:

10 (1) avoidance of the transfer or obligation to the extent necessary to
11 satisfy the creditor's claim;

12 (2) an attachment or other provisional remedy against the asset
13 transferred or other property of the transferee in accordance with the procedure
14 prescribed by the Vermont Rules of Civil Procedure;

15 (3) subject to applicable principles of equity and in accordance with
16 applicable Rules of Civil Procedure:

17 (A) an injunction against further disposition by the debtor or a
18 transferee, or both, of the asset transferred or of other property;

19 (B) appointment of a receiver to take charge of the asset transferred
20 or of other property of the transferee; or

21 (C) any other relief the circumstances may require.

1 (b) If a creditor has obtained a judgment on a claim against the debtor, the
2 creditor, if the court so orders, may levy execution on the asset transferred or
3 its proceeds.

4 § 2292. DEFENSES; LIABILITY, AND PROTECTION OF TRANSFEREE
5 OR OBLIGEE

6 (a) A transfer or obligation is not voidable under subdivision 2288(a)(1) of
7 this title against a person who took in good faith and for a reasonably
8 equivalent value or against any subsequent transferee or obligee.

9 (b) To the extent a transfer is avoidable in an action by a creditor under
10 subdivision 2291(a)(1) of this title, the following rules apply:

11 (1) Except as otherwise provided in this section, ~~to the extent a transfer~~
12 ~~is voidable in an action by a creditor under subdivision 2291(a)(1) of this title,~~
13 the creditor may recover judgment for the value of the asset transferred, as
14 adjusted under subsection (c) of this section, or the amount necessary to satisfy
15 the creditor's claim, whichever is less. The judgment may be entered against:

16 (1)(A) the first transferee of the asset or the person for whose benefit
17 the transfer was made; or

18 (2)(B) ~~any subsequent transferee other than a good faith transferee~~
19 ~~who took for value or from any subsequent transferee~~ an immediate or mediate
20 transferee of the first transferee, other than:

21 (i) a good-faith transferee who took for value; or

1 (ii) an immediate or mediate good-faith transferee of a person
2 described in subdivision (1)(B)(i) of this subsection (b).

3 (2) Recovery pursuant to subdivision 2291(a)(1) or subsection
4 2291(b) of this title of or from the asset transferred or its proceeds, by levy or
5 otherwise, is available only against a person described in subdivision (1)(A) or
6 (1)(B) of this subsection (b).

7 (c) If the judgment under subsection (b) of this section is based upon the
8 value of the asset transferred, the judgment must be for an amount equal to the
9 value of the asset at the time of the transfer, subject to adjustment as the
10 equities may require.

11 (d) Notwithstanding voidability of a transfer or an obligation under this
12 chapter, a good-faith transferee or obligee is entitled, to the extent of the value
13 given the debtor for the transfer or obligation, to:

14 (1) a lien on or a right to retain any interest in the asset transferred;

15 (2) enforcement of any obligation incurred; or

16 (3) a reduction in the amount of the liability on the judgment.

17 (e) A transfer is not voidable under subdivision 2288(a)(2) or section 2289
18 of this title if the transfer results from:

19 (1) termination of a lease upon default by the debtor when the

20 termination is pursuant to the lease and applicable law;

1 (2) enforcement of a security interest in compliance with 9A V.S.A.

2 Article 9, other than acceptance of collateral in full or partial satisfaction of the
3 obligation it secures; or

4 (3) foreclosure of a mortgage in compliance with 12 V.S.A. ~~chapter 163,~~
5 ~~subchapter 6 or chapter 172, subchapter 1.~~

6 (f) A transfer is not voidable under subsection 2289(b) of this title:

7 (1) to the extent the insider gave new value to or for the benefit of the
8 debtor after the transfer was made ~~unless, except to the extent~~ the new value
9 was secured by a valid lien;

10 (2) if made in the ordinary course of business or financial affairs of the
11 debtors and the insider; or

12 (3) if made pursuant to a good-faith effort to rehabilitate the debtor and
13 the transfer secured present value given for that purpose as well as an
14 antecedent debt of the debtor.

15 (g) The following rules determine the burden of proving matters referred to
16 in this section:

17 (1) A party that seeks to invoke subsection (a), (d), (e), or (f) of this
18 section has the burden of proving the applicability of that subsection.

19 (2) Except as otherwise provided in subdivisions (3) and (4) of this
20 subsection, the creditor has the burden of proving each applicable element of
21 subsection (b) or (c) of this section.

1 (3) The transferee has the burden of proving the applicability to the
2 transferee of subdivision (b)(1)(B)(i) or (ii) of this section.

3 (4) A party that seeks adjustment under subsection (c) of this section has
4 the burden of proving the adjustment.

5 (h) The standard of proof required to establish matters referred to in this
6 section is preponderance of the evidence.

7 § 2293. ~~EXTINGUISHMENT OF CAUSE OF ACTION~~ CLAIM FOR
8 RELIEF

9 A ~~cause of action~~ claim for relief with respect to a ~~fraudulent~~ transfer or
10 obligation under this chapter is extinguished unless action is brought:

11 (1) under subdivision 2288(a)(1) of this title ~~within~~ not later than four
12 years after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred or, if later,
13 ~~within~~ not later than one year after the transfer or obligation was or could
14 reasonably have been discovered by the claimant;

15 (2) under subdivision 2288(a)(2) or subsection 2289(a) of this title
16 ~~within~~ not later than four years after the transfer was made or the obligation
17 was incurred; or

18 (3) under subsection 2289(b) of this title, ~~within~~ not later than one year
19 after the transfer was made or the obligation was incurred.

20 § 2294. GOVERNING LAW

21 (a) In this section, the following rules determine a debtor's location:

1 (1) A debtor who is an individual is located at the individual’s principal
2 residence.

3 (2) A debtor that is an organization and has only one place of business is
4 located at its place of business.

5 (3) A debtor that is an organization and has more than one place of
6 business is located at its chief executive office.

7 (b) A claim for relief in the nature of a claim for relief under this chapter is
8 governed by the local law of the jurisdiction in which the debtor is located
9 when the transfer is made or the obligation is incurred.

10 § 2295. APPLICATION TO SERIES ORGANIZATION

11 (a) In this section:

12 (1) “Protected series” means an arrangement, however denominated,
13 created by a series organization that, pursuant to the law under which the series
14 organization is organized, has the characteristics set forth in subdivision (2) of
15 this subsection.

16 (2) “Series organization” means an organization that, pursuant to the law
17 under which it is organized, has the following characteristics:

18 (A) The organic record of the organization provides for creation by
19 the organization of one or more protected series, however denominated, with
20 respect to specified property of the organization, and for records to be

1 maintained for each protected series that identify the property of or associated
2 with the protected series.

3 (B) Debt incurred or existing with respect to the activities of, or
4 property of or associated with, a particular protected series is enforceable
5 against the property of or associated with the protected series only, and not
6 against the property of or associated with the organization or other protected
7 series of the organization.

8 (C) Debt incurred or existing with respect to the activities or property
9 of the organization is enforceable against the property of the organization only,
10 and not against the property of or associated with a protected series of the
11 organization.

12 (b) A series organization and each protected series of the organization is a
13 separate person for purposes of this chapter, even if for other purposes a
14 protected series is not a person separate from the organization or other
15 protected series of the organization.

16 § 2296. SUPPLEMENTARY PROVISIONS

17 Unless displaced by the provisions of this chapter, the principles of law and
18 equity, including the law merchant and the law relating to principal and agent,
19 estoppel, laches, fraud, misrepresentation, duress, coercion, mistake,
20 insolvency, or other validating or invalidating cause, supplement the provisions
21 of this chapter.

1 ~~§ 2295~~ § 2297. UNIFORMITY OF APPLICATION AND CONSTRUCTION

2 This chapter shall be applied and construed to effectuate its general purpose
3 to make uniform the law with respect to the subject of this chapter among
4 states enacting it.

5 § 2298. RELATION TO ELECTRONIC SIGNATURES IN GLOBAL AND
6 NATIONAL COMMERCE ACT

7 This chapter modifies, limits, or supersedes the Electronic Signatures in
8 Global and National Commerce Act, 15 U.S.C. § 7001 et seq., but does not
9 modify, limit, or supersede 15 U.S.C. § 7001(c), or authorize electronic
10 delivery of any of the notices described in 15 U.S.C. § 7003(b).

11 § 2299. SHORT TITLE

12 This chapter, which was formerly cited as the Uniform Fraudulent Transfer
13 Act, may be cited as the Uniform Voidable Transactions Act.

14 * * *

15 Sec. 2. EFFECTIVE DATE; IMPLEMENTATION

16 (a) This act shall take effect on July 1, 2017.

17 (b) The provisions of this act apply to a transfer made or obligation
18 incurred on or after July 1, 2017.

19 (c) The provisions of this act do not apply:

20 (1) to a transfer made or obligation incurred before July 1, 2017; or

21 (2) to a right of action that has accrued before July 1, 2017.

1 (d) For purposes of this act, a transfer is made and an obligation is incurred
2 at the time provided in 9 V.S.A. § 2290.

3

4

5 (Committee vote: _____)

6

7

Representative _____

8

FOR THE COMMITTEE