

House Proposal of Amendment

S. 23

An act relating to juvenile jurisdiction.

The House proposes to the Senate to amend the bill by striking all after the enacting clause and inserting in lieu thereof the following:

Sec. 1. 13 V.S.A. § 5401 is amended to read:

§ 5401. DEFINITIONS

As used in this subchapter:

* * *

(15)(A) “Conviction” means a judgment of guilt following a verdict or finding of guilt, a plea of guilty, a plea of nolo contendere, an Alford Plea, or a judgment of guilt pursuant to a deferred sentence. A sex offender whose sentence is deferred shall have no duty to register after successful completion of the terms of the deferred sentence agreement for the duration specified in the agreement.

(B) A sex offender treated as a youthful offender pursuant to 33 V.S.A. chapter 52A shall have no duty to register unless the offender’s youthful offender status is revoked and he or she is sentenced for the offense in the Criminal Division of Superior Court.

* * *

Sec. 2. 28 V.S.A. chapter 16 is added to read:

CHAPTER 16. YOUTHFUL OFFENDERS

§ 1161. POWERS AND RESPONSIBILITIES OF THE COMMISSIONER REGARDING SUPERVISION OF YOUTHFUL OFFENDERS

In accordance with 33 V.S.A. chapter 52A, the Commissioner shall be charged with the following powers and responsibilities regarding supervision of youthful offenders:

(1) consistent with 33 V.S.A. § 5284(d), to designate a case manager who, together with a case manager appointed by the Commissioner for Children and Families, will determine the lead Department to preside over the case plan and the provision of services to youths who are adjudicated as youthful offenders;

(2) together with the Commissioner for Children and Families, to maintain the general supervision of youths adjudicated as youthful offenders and placed on conditions of juvenile probation; and

(3) to supervise the administration of probation services and establish

policies and standards regarding youthful offender probation investigation, supervision, case work, record keeping, and the qualification of probation officers working with youthful offenders.

§ 1162. METHODS OF SUPERVISION

(a) Electronic monitoring. The Commissioner may utilize an electronic monitoring system to supervise a youthful offender placed on juvenile probation.

(b) Graduated sanctions.

(1) If ordered by the court pursuant to a modification of a youthful offender disposition under 33 V.S.A. § 5285(c)(1), the Commissioner may sanction the youthful offender in accordance with rules adopted pursuant to subdivision (2) of this subsection.

(2) The Department of Corrections shall adopt rules pursuant to 3 V.S.A. chapter 25 that establish graduated sanction guidelines for a youthful offender who violates the terms of his or her probation.

Sec. 3. 33 V.S.A. § 5102 is amended to read:

§ 5102. DEFINITIONS AND PROVISIONS OF GENERAL APPLICATION

As used in the juvenile judicial proceedings chapters, unless the context otherwise requires:

* * *

(2) “Child” means any of the following:

* * *

(C) An individual who has been alleged to have committed or has committed an act of delinquency after becoming 10 years of age and prior to becoming ~~18~~ 22 years of age; provided, however:

(i) that an individual who is alleged to have committed an act specified in subsection 5204(a) of this title after attaining ~~the age of 10~~ 12 years of age but not ~~the age of 14 years of age~~ may be treated as an adult as provided therein;

* * *

(9) “Delinquent act” means an act designated a crime under the laws of this State, or of another state if the act occurred in another state, or under federal law. A delinquent act shall include 7 V.S.A. §§ ~~656 and 657~~ § 656; however, it shall not include:

(A) snowmobile offenses in 23 V.S.A. chapter 29, subchapter 1 and motorboat offenses in 23 V.S.A. chapter 29, subchapter 2, except for violations of sections 3207a, 3207b, 3207c, 3207d, and 3323;

(B) pursuant to 4 V.S.A. § 33(b), felony motor vehicle offenses committed by an individual who is at least 16 years of age or older, except for violations of 23 V.S.A. chapter 13, subchapter 13 and of 23 V.S.A. § 1091.

* * *

(22) "Party" includes the following persons:

(A) the child with respect to whom the proceedings are brought;

(B) the custodial parent, the guardian, or the custodian of the child in all instances except a hearing on the merits of a delinquency petition;

(C) the noncustodial parent for the purposes of custody, visitation, and such other issues ~~which~~ that the Court court may determine are proper and necessary to the proceedings, provided that the noncustodial parent has entered an appearance;

(D) the State's Attorney;

(E) the Commissioner for Children and Families;

(F) such other persons as appear to the ~~Court~~ court to be proper and necessary to the proceedings; and

(G) in youthful offender cases brought under 33 V.S.A. chapter 52A, the Commissioner of Corrections.

* * *

Sec. 4. 33 V.S.A. § 5112 is amended to read:
§ 5112. ATTORNEY AND GUARDIAN AD LITEM FOR CHILD

(a) The Court shall appoint an attorney for a child who is a party to a proceeding brought under the juvenile judicial proceedings chapters.

(b) The Court shall appoint a guardian ad litem for a child under 18 years of age who is a party to a proceeding brought under the juvenile judicial proceedings chapters. In a delinquency proceeding, a parent, guardian, or custodian of the child may serve as a guardian ad litem for the child, providing his or her interests do not conflict with the interests of the child. The guardian ad litem appointed under this section shall not be a party to that proceeding or an employee or representative of such party.

Sec. 5. 33 V.S.A. chapter 52A is added to read:

CHAPTER 52A. YOUTHFUL OFFENDERS

§ 5280. COMMENCEMENT OF YOUTHFUL OFFENDER

PROCEEDINGS IN THE FAMILY DIVISION

(a) A proceeding under this chapter shall be commenced by:

(1) the filing of a youthful offender petition by a State's Attorney; or

(2) transfer to the Family Court of a proceeding from the Criminal Division of the Superior Court as provided in section 5281 of this title.

(b) A State's Attorney may commence a proceeding in the Family Division of the Superior Court concerning a child who is alleged to have committed an offense after attaining 16 years of age but not 22 years of age that could otherwise be filed in the Criminal Division.

(c) If a State's Attorney files a petition under subdivision (a)(1) of this section, the case shall proceed as provided under subsection 5281(b) of this title.

§ 5281. MOTION IN CRIMINAL DIVISION OF SUPERIOR COURT

(a) A motion may be filed in the Criminal Division of the Superior Court requesting that a defendant under 22 years of age in a criminal proceeding who had attained 12 years of age but not 22 years of age at the time the offense is alleged to have been committed be treated as a youthful offender. The motion may be filed by the State's Attorney, the defendant, or the court on its own motion.

(b) Upon the filing of a motion under this section or the filing of a youthful offender petition pursuant to section 5280 of this title, the Family Division shall hold a hearing pursuant to section 5283 of this title. Pursuant to section 5110 of this title, the hearing shall be confidential. Copies of all records relating to the case shall be forwarded to the Family Division. Conditions of release and any Department of Corrections supervision or custody shall remain in effect until the Family Division accepts the case for treatment as a youthful offender and orders conditions of juvenile probation pursuant to section 5284 of this title, or the case is otherwise concluded.

(c)(1) If the Family Division rejects the case for youthful offender treatment pursuant to subsection 5284 of this title, the case shall be transferred to the Criminal Division. The conditions of release imposed by the Criminal Division shall remain in effect, and the case shall proceed as though the motion for youthful offender treatment or youthful offender petition had not been filed.

(2) Subject to Rule 11 of the Vermont Rules of Criminal Procedure and Rule 410 of the Vermont Rules of Evidence, the Family Division's denial of the motion for youthful offender treatment and any information related to the youthful offender proceeding shall be inadmissible against the youth for any purpose in the subsequent Criminal Division proceeding.

(d) If the Family Division accepts the case for youthful offender treatment, the case shall proceed to a confidential merits hearing or admission pursuant to sections 5227–5229 of this title.

§ 5282. REPORT FROM THE DEPARTMENT

(a) Within 30 days after the case is transferred to the Family Division or a youthful offender petition is filed in the Family Division, unless the court extends the period for good cause shown, the Department for Children and Families shall file a report with the Family Division of the Superior Court.

(b) A report filed pursuant to this section shall include the following elements:

(1) a recommendation as to whether diversion is appropriate for the youth because the youth is a low to moderate risk to reoffend;

(2) a recommendation as to whether youthful offender status is appropriate for the youth; and

(3) a description of the services that may be available for the youth.

(c) A report filed pursuant to this section is privileged and shall not be disclosed to any person other than:

(1) the Department;

(2) the court;

(3) the State's Attorney;

(4) the youth, the youth's attorney, and the youth's guardian ad litem;

(5) the youth's parent, guardian, or custodian if the youth is under 18 years of age, unless the court finds that disclosure would be contrary to the best interest of the child;

(6) the Department of Corrections; or

(7) any other person when the court determines that the best interests of the youth would make such a disclosure desirable or helpful.

§ 5283. HEARING IN FAMILY DIVISION

(a) Timeline. A youthful offender status hearing shall be held no later than 35 days after the transfer of the case from the Criminal Division or filing of a youthful offender petition in the Family Division.

(b) Notice. Notice of the hearing shall be provided to the State's Attorney; the youth; the youth's parent, guardian, or custodian; the Department; and the Department of Corrections.

(c) Hearing procedure.

(1) If the motion is contested, all parties shall have the right to present evidence and examine witnesses. Hearsay may be admitted and may be relied on to the extent of its probative value. If reports are admitted, the parties shall be afforded an opportunity to examine those persons making the reports, but

sources of confidential information need not be disclosed.

(2) All youthful offender proceedings shall be confidential.

(d) Burden of proof. The burden of proof shall be on the moving party to prove by a preponderance of the evidence that a child should be granted youthful offender status. If the court makes the motion, the burden shall be on the youth.

(e) Further hearing. On its own motion or the motion of a party, the court may schedule a further hearing to obtain reports or other information necessary for the appropriate disposition of the case.

§ 5284. YOUTHFUL OFFENDER DETERMINATION AND DISPOSITION ORDER

(a) In a hearing on a motion for youthful offender status, the court shall first consider whether public safety will be protected by treating the youth as a youthful offender. If the court finds that public safety will not be protected by treating the youth as a youthful offender, the court shall deny the motion and transfer the case to the Criminal Division of the Superior Court pursuant to subsection 5281(d) of this title. If the court finds that public safety will be protected by treating the youth as a youthful offender, the court shall proceed to make a determination under subsection (b) of this section.

(b)(1) The court shall deny the motion if the court finds that:

(A) the youth is not amenable to treatment or rehabilitation as a youthful offender; or

(B) there are insufficient services in the juvenile court system and the Department for Children and Families and the Department of Corrections to meet the youth's treatment and rehabilitation needs.

(2) The court shall grant the motion if the court finds that:

(A) the youth is amenable to treatment or rehabilitation as a youthful offender; and

(B) there are sufficient services in the juvenile court system and the Department for Children and Families and the Department of Corrections to meet the youth's treatment and rehabilitation needs.

(c) If the court approves the motion for youthful offender treatment after an adjudication pursuant to subsection 5281(d) of this title, the court:

(1) shall approve a disposition case plan and impose conditions of juvenile probation on the youth; and

(2) may transfer legal custody of the youth to a parent, relative, person with a significant relationship with the youth, or Commissioner, provided that

any transfer of custody shall expire on the youth's 18th birthday.

(d) The Department for Children and Families and the Department of Corrections shall be responsible for supervision of and providing services to the youth until he or she reaches 22 years of age. Both Departments shall designate a case manager who together shall appoint a lead Department to have final decision-making authority over the case plan and the provision of services to the youth. The youth shall be eligible for appropriate community-based programming and services provided by both Departments.

§ 5285. MODIFICATION OR REVOCATION OF DISPOSITION

(a) If it appears that the youth has violated the terms of juvenile probation ordered by the court pursuant to subdivision 5284(c)(1) of this title, a motion for modification or revocation of youthful offender status may be filed in the Family Division of the Superior Court. The court shall set the motion for hearing as soon as practicable. The hearing may be joined with a hearing on a violation of conditions of probation under section 5265 of this title. A supervising juvenile or adult probation officer may detain in an adult facility a youthful offender who has attained 18 years of age for violating conditions of probation.

(b) A hearing under this section shall be held in accordance with section 5268 of this title.

(c) If the court finds after the hearing that the youth has violated the terms of his or her probation, the court may:

(1) maintain the youth's status as a youthful offender, with modified conditions of juvenile probation if the court deems it appropriate;

(2) revoke the youth's status as a youthful offender and transfer the case with a record of the petition, affidavit, adjudication, disposition, and revocation to the Criminal Division for sentencing; or

(3) transfer supervision of the youth to the Department of Corrections with all of the powers and authority of the Department and the Commissioner under Title 28, including graduated sanctions and electronic monitoring.

(d) If a youth's status as a youthful offender is revoked and the case is transferred to the Criminal Division pursuant to subdivision (c)(2) of this section, the court shall hold a sentencing hearing and impose sentence. When determining an appropriate sentence, the court may take into consideration the youth's degree of progress toward rehabilitation while on youthful offender status. The Criminal Division shall have access to all Family Division records of the proceeding.

§ 5286. REVIEW PRIOR TO 18 YEARS OF AGE

(a) If a youth is adjudicated as a youthful offender prior to reaching

18 years of age, the Family Division shall review the youth's case before he or she reaches 18 years of age and set a hearing to determine whether the court's jurisdiction over the youth should be continued past 18 years of age. The hearing may be joined with a motion to terminate youthful offender status under section 5285 of this title. The court shall provide notice and an opportunity to be heard at the hearing to the State's Attorney, the youth, the Department for Children and Families, and the Department of Corrections.

(b) After receiving a notice of review under this section, the State may file a motion to modify or revoke pursuant to section 5285 of this title. If such a motion is filed, it shall be consolidated with the review under this section and all options provided for under section 5285 of this title shall be available to the court.

(c) The following reports shall be filed with the court prior to the hearing:

(1) The Department for Children and Families and the Department of Corrections shall jointly report their recommendations, with supporting justifications, as to whether the Family Division should continue jurisdiction over the youth past 18 years of age and, if continued jurisdiction is recommended, propose a case plan for the youth to ensure compliance with and completion of the juvenile disposition.

(2) If the Departments recommend continued supervision of the youthful offender past 18 years of age, the Departments shall report on the services which would be available for the youth.

(d) If the court finds that it is in the best interest of the youth and consistent with community safety to continue the case past 18 years of age, it shall make an order continuing the court's jurisdiction up to 22 years of age. The Department for Children and Families and the Department of Corrections shall jointly develop a case plan for the youth and coordinate services and share information to ensure compliance with and completion of the juvenile disposition.

(e) If the court finds that it is not in the best interest of the youth to continue the case past 18 years of age, it shall terminate the disposition order, discharge the youth, and dismiss the case in accordance with subsection 5287(c) of this title.

§ 5287. TERMINATION OR CONTINUANCE OF PROBATION

(a) A motion may be filed at any time in the Family Division requesting that the court terminate the youth's status as a youthful offender and discharge him or her from probation. The motion may be filed by the State's Attorney, the youth, the Department, or the court on its own motion. The court shall set the motion for hearing and provide notice and an opportunity to be heard at the hearing to the State's Attorney, the youth, the Department for Children and

Families and the Department of Corrections.

(b) In determining whether a youth has successfully completed the terms of probation, the Court shall consider:

(1) the degree to which the youth fulfilled the terms of the case plan and the probation order;

(2) the youth's performance during treatment;

(3) reports of treatment personnel; and

(4) any other relevant facts associated with the youth's behavior.

(c) If the court finds that the youth has successfully completed the terms of the probation order, it shall terminate youthful offender status, discharge the youth from probation, and file a written order dismissing the Family Division case. The Family Division shall provide notice of the dismissal to the Criminal Division, which shall dismiss the criminal case.

(d) Upon discharge and dismissal under subsection (c) of this section, all records relating to the case in the Criminal Division shall be expunged, and all records relating to the case in the Family Court shall be sealed pursuant to section 5119 of this title.

(e) If the court denies the motion to discharge the youth from probation, the court may extend or amend the probation order as it deems necessary.

§ 5288. RIGHTS OF VICTIMS IN YOUTHFUL OFFENDER

PROCEEDINGS

(a) The victim in a proceeding involving a youthful offender shall have the following rights:

(1) to be notified by the prosecutor in a timely manner when a court proceeding is scheduled to take place and when a court proceeding to which he or she has been notified will not take place as scheduled;

(2) to be present during all court proceedings subject to the provisions of Rule 615 of the Vermont Rules of Evidence and to express reasonably his or her views concerning the offense and the youth;

(3) to request notification by the agency having custody of the youth before the youth is released from a residential facility;

(4) to be notified by the prosecutor as to the final disposition of the case;

(5) to be notified by the prosecutor of the victim's rights under this section.

(b) In accordance with court rules, at a hearing on a motion for youthful

offender treatment, the court shall ask if the victim is present and, if so, whether the victim would like to be heard regarding disposition. In ordering disposition, the court shall consider any views offered at the hearing by the victim. If the victim is not present, the court shall ask whether the victim has expressed, either orally or in writing, views regarding disposition and shall take those views into consideration in ordering disposition.

(c) No youthful offender proceeding shall be delayed or voided by reason of the failure to give the victim the required notice or the failure of the victim to appear.

(d) As used in this section, "victim" shall have the same meaning as in 13 V.S.A. § 5301(4).

Sec. 6. 33 V.S.A. § 5291 is amended to read:

§ 5291. DETENTION OR TREATMENT OF MINORS CHARGED AS
DELINQUENTS IN SECURE FACILITIES FOR THE
DETENTION OR TREATMENT OF DELINQUENT CHILDREN

~~(a) Unless ordered otherwise at or after a temporary care hearing, the Commissioner shall have sole authority to place the child who is in the custody of the Department in a secure facility for the detention or treatment of minors.~~

~~(b) Upon a finding at the temporary care hearing that no other suitable placement is available and the child presents a risk of injury to him or herself, to others, or to property, the Court may order that the child be placed in Prior to disposition, the court shall have the sole authority to place a child who is in the custody of the Department in a secure facility used for the detention or treatment of delinquent children until the Commissioner determines that a suitable placement is available for the child. The court shall not order placement in a secure facility without a recommendation from the Department that placement in a secure facility is necessary. Alternatively, the Court may order that the child be placed in a secure facility used for the detention or treatment of delinquent children for up to seven days. Any order for placement at a secure facility shall expire at the end of the seventh day following its issuance unless, after hearing, the Court extends the order for a time period not to exceed seven days. The court order shall include a finding that no other suitable placement is available and the child presents a risk of injury to others or to property.~~

(b) Absent good cause shown and notwithstanding section 5227 of this title, when a child is placed in a secure facility pursuant to subsection (a) of this section and remains in a secure facility for 45 days following the preliminary hearing, the merits hearing shall be held and merits adjudicated within 45 days of the date of the preliminary hearing or the court shall dismiss the petition with prejudice. If merits have been found, the court shall review

the secure facility placement order at the merits hearing.

(c) If a child is placed in a secure facility pursuant to subsection (a) of this section and secure facility placement continues following the merits hearing review pursuant to subsection (b) of this section, the court shall, within 35 days of the merits adjudication:

(1) hold the disposition hearing, or, if disposition is not held within 35 days;

(2) hold a hearing to review the continued secure facility placement.

(d) A child placed in a secure facility on an order pursuant to subsections (a), (b), or (c) of this section with a finding that no other suitable placement is available and the child presents a risk of harm to others or to property shall be entitled to an independent, second evidentiary hearing, which shall be a hearing de novo by a single justice of the Vermont Supreme Court. The Chief Justice may make an appointment or special assignment in accordance with 4 V.S.A. § 22 to conduct the de novo hearing required by this subsection. Unless the parties stipulate to the admission of portions of the trial court record, the de novo review shall be a new evidentiary hearing without regard to the record compiled before the trial court.

(e) Following disposition, the Commissioner shall have the sole authority to place a child who is in the custody of the Department in a secure facility for the detention or treatment of delinquent children pursuant to the Department's administrative policies on admission.

Sec. 7. VERMONT SUPREME COURT; RULEMAKING

The Vermont Supreme Court shall review the youthful offender proceedings statutes and consider a proposed new or amended rule for adoption on or before July 1, 2018 to make clear that a youth is waiving the right to trial by jury in cases where a youth is adjudicated in the Family Division pursuant to 33 V.S.A. §§ 5281 and 5227–5229, youthful offender status is revoked, and a criminal record of the petition, adjudication, disposition and revocation is sent to the Criminal Division pursuant to 33 V.S.A. §5285 for sentencing.

Sec. 8. REPEALS

(a) 33 V.S.A. § 5104 (retention of jurisdiction over youthful offenders) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

(b) 33 V.S.A. § 5280 (commencement of youthful offender proceedings in the Family Division) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

(c) 33 V.S.A. § 5281 (motion in Criminal Division of Superior Court) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

(d) 33 V.S.A. § 5282 (report from the Department) is repealed on July 1,

2018.

(e) 33 V.S.A. § 5283 (hearing in Family Division) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

(f) 33 V.S.A. § 5284 (determination and order) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

(g) 33 V.S.A. § 5285 (modification or revocation of disposition) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

(h) 33 V.S.A. § 5286 (review prior to the age of 18) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

(i) 33 V.S.A. § 5287 (termination or continuance of probation) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

(j) 33 V.S.A. § 5288 (rights of victims in youthful offender proceedings) is repealed on July 1, 2018.

Sec. 9. EFFECTIVE DATES

This act shall take effect on July 1, 2017, except for Secs. 2 (Chapter 16), 5 (Chapter 52A), and 6 (detention or treatment of minors charged as delinquents in secure facilities for the detention or treatment of delinquent children) which shall take effect on July 1, 2018.