

1 TO THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES:

2 The Committee on Judiciary to which was referred House Bill No. 780
3 entitled “An act relating to judicial nominations and appointments”
4 respectfully reports that it has considered the same and recommends that the
5 bill be amended by striking out all after the enacting clause and inserting in
6 lieu thereof the following:

7 Sec. 1. 4 V.S.A. § 601 is amended to read:

8 § 601. JUDICIAL NOMINATING BOARD CREATED; COMPOSITION

9 (a) The Judicial Nominating Board is created for the nomination of
10 Supreme Court Justices, Superior judges, magistrates, and the Chair and
11 members of the Public Utility Commission.

12 (b)~~(1)~~ The Board shall consist of ~~44~~ 12 members who shall be selected as
13 follows:

14 ~~(1)(A)~~ The Governor shall appoint two members who are not attorneys
15 at law.

16 ~~(2)(B)~~ The Senate shall elect three of its members, not all of whom
17 shall be members of the same party, and only one of whom may be an attorney
18 at law.

19 ~~(3)(C)~~ The House shall elect three of its members, not all of whom
20 shall be members of the same party, and only one of whom may be an attorney
21 at law.

1 Chair of the Public Utility Commission, the Judicial Nominating Board shall
2 submit to the Court Administrator a list of all candidates, and ~~he or she~~ the
3 Court Administrator shall disclose to the Board information solely about
4 professional disciplinary action taken or pending concerning any candidate.

5 (2) From the list of candidates, the Judicial Nominating Board shall
6 select by ~~three fourths~~ majority vote, provided that a quorum is present, well-
7 qualified candidates for the position to be filled.

8 (b)(1) Whenever a vacancy occurs in the office of a Supreme Court Justice,
9 a Superior Court judge, magistrate, or Chair of the Public Utility Commission,
10 or when an incumbent does not declare that ~~he or she~~ the incumbent will be a
11 candidate to succeed ~~himself or herself~~ themselves, the Board shall submit to
12 the Governor the names of as many persons as it deems well qualified to be
13 appointed to the office.

14 (2)(A) A person may nominate another person to fill a vacancy in the
15 office of a Supreme Court Justice, a Superior Court judge, magistrate, or Chair
16 of the Public Utility Commission by submitting a form developed by the Court
17 Administrator pursuant to subdivision (B) of this subdivision (2).

18 (B) The Court Administrator shall make available on the Judiciary
19 website a form that permits a person to nominate another person to fill a
20 vacancy in the office of a Supreme Court Justice, a Superior Court judge,
21 magistrate, or Chair of the Public Utility Commission. If a person is

1 nominated pursuant to this subdivision (2), the Court Administrator shall
2 provide the person nominated with information about the application process
3 and shall provide the name of the person nominated to the Board.

4 (c)(1) A candidate for judge or Justice shall be a Vermont resident and an
5 experienced lawyer who has practiced law in Vermont for a minimum of
6 ten 10 years, with at least five three years licensed to practice in Vermont
7 immediately preceding his or her the candidate's application to the Board. The
8 Board may make exceptions to the five year three year requirement for
9 absences from practice for reasons including family, military, academic, or
10 medical leave.

11 (2) A candidate for magistrate shall be a Vermont resident and an
12 experienced lawyer who has practiced law in Vermont for at least five years,
13 with at least three years licensed to practice in Vermont immediately preceding
14 his or her the candidate's application to the Board.

15 (3) A candidate for Chair of the Public Utility Commission shall not be
16 required to be an attorney; however, if the candidate is admitted to practice law
17 in Vermont, the Judicial Nominating Board shall submit the candidate's name
18 to the Court Administrator, and he or she the Court Administrator shall
19 disclose to the Board information solely about professional disciplinary action
20 taken or pending concerning the candidate. If a candidate is not admitted to
21 practice law in Vermont, but practices a profession requiring licensure,

1 certification, or other professional regulation by the State, the Judicial
2 Nominating Board shall submit the candidate’s name to the State professional
3 regulatory entity and that entity shall disclose to the Board any professional
4 disciplinary action taken or pending concerning the candidate.

5 (d) A candidate shall possess the following attributes:

6 (1) Integrity. A candidate shall possess a record and reputation for
7 excellent character and integrity.

8 (2) Legal knowledge and ability. A candidate shall possess a high
9 degree of knowledge of established legal principles and procedures and have
10 demonstrated a high degree of ability to interpret and apply the law to specific
11 factual situations.

12 (3) Judicial temperament. A candidate shall possess an appropriate
13 judicial temperament.

14 (4) Impartiality. A candidate shall exhibit an ability to make judicial
15 determinations in a manner free of bias.

16 (5) Communication capability. A candidate shall possess demonstrated
17 oral and written capacities, with reasonable accommodations, required by the
18 position.

19 (6) Financial integrity. A candidate shall possess demonstrated financial
20 probity.

21 (7) Work ethic. A candidate shall demonstrate diligence.

1 (8) Administrative capabilities. A candidate shall demonstrate
2 management and organizational skills or experience required by the position.

3 (9) Courtroom experience. For Superior Court, a candidate shall have
4 sufficient trial or other comparable experience that ensures knowledge of the
5 Vermont Rules of Evidence and Vermont courtroom procedure. For the
6 Environmental Division of the Superior Court, a candidate shall have
7 experience in environmental and zoning law.

8 (10) Legal experience in Vermont. The Board shall consider the
9 candidate's A candidate shall have ties to the Vermont legal community, the
10 nature and amount of the candidate's practice in State and federal courts in
11 Vermont, and the candidate's familiarity with the Vermont legal system.

12 (11) Diversity of Experience. Candidates shall be drawn from diverse
13 backgrounds and shall have a broad range of lived experience.

14 (12) Other. A candidate shall possess other attributes the Board deems
15 relevant as identified through its rules.

16 Sec. 3. 4 V.S.A. § 603 is amended to read:

17 § 603. APPOINTMENT OF JUSTICES, JUDGES, MAGISTRATES,

18 PUBLIC UTILITY COMMISSION CHAIR, AND MEMBERS

19 Whenever the Governor appoints a Supreme Court Justice, a Superior
20 Judge, a magistrate, the Chair of the Public Utility Commission, or a member
21 of the Public Utility Commission, ~~he or she~~ the Governor shall select from the

1 list of names of ~~qualified~~ well-qualified persons submitted by the Judicial
 2 Nominating Board pursuant to law. The names of candidates submitted and
 3 not selected shall remain confidential. The Governor shall make the
 4 appointment within 60 days after receiving the list from the Board. The
 5 Governor shall not refuse to make an appointment from the list or request that
 6 the Board submit additional names unless the list contains less than three
 7 names.

8 Sec. 4. EFFECTIVE DATE

9 This act shall take effect on July 1, 2024.

10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19

(Committee vote: _____)

Representative _____
FOR THE COMMITTEE