

1 TO THE HOUSE OF REPRESENTATIVES:

2 The Committee on Human Services to which was referred House Bill No.
3 661 entitled “An act relating to child abuse and neglect investigation and
4 substantiation standards and procedures” respectfully reports that it has
5 considered the same and recommends that the bill be amended by striking out
6 all after the enacting clause and inserting in lieu thereof the following:

7 Sec. 1. 33 V.S.A. § 4903 is amended to read:

8 § 4903. RESPONSIBILITY OF DEPARTMENT

9 The Department may expend, within amounts available for the purposes,
10 what is necessary to protect and promote the welfare of children and adults in
11 this State, including the strengthening of their homes whenever possible, by:

12 (1) Investigating complaints of neglect, abuse, or abandonment of
13 children, including when, whether, and how names are placed on the Child
14 Protection Registry.

15 * * *

16 Sec. 2. 33 V.S.A. § 4911 is amended to read:

17 § 4911. PURPOSE

18 The purpose of this subchapter is to:

19 (1) protect children whose health and welfare may be adversely affected
20 through abuse or neglect;

1 (2) strengthen the family and make the home safe for children whenever
2 possible by enhancing the parental capacity for good child care;

3 (3) provide a temporary or permanent nurturing and safe environment
4 for children when necessary; and for these purposes require the reporting of
5 suspected child abuse and neglect, an assessment or investigation of such
6 reports and provision of services, when needed, to such child and family;

7 (4) establish a range of responses to child abuse and neglect that take
8 into account different degrees of child abuse or neglect and that recognize that
9 child offenders should be treated differently from adults; ~~and~~

10 (5) establish a tiered child protection registry that balances the need to
11 protect children and the potential employment consequences of a registry
12 record for ~~persons who are~~ a person's conduct that is substantiated for child
13 abuse and neglect; and

14 (6) ensure that in the Department for Children and Families' efforts to
15 protect children from abuse and neglect, the Department also ensures that
16 investigations are thorough, unbiased, based on accurate and reliable evidence,
17 and adhere to due process requirements.

18 Sec. 3. 33 V.S.A. § 4912 is amended to read:

19 § 4912. DEFINITIONS

20 As used in this subchapter:

21 * * *

1 (4) Determination of the identity of the person alleged to be responsible
2 for such abuse or neglect. The investigator shall use best efforts to obtain the
3 person’s mailing and e-mail address as soon as practicable once the person’s
4 identity is determined. The person shall be notified of the outcome of the
5 investigation and any notices sent by the Department using the mailing
6 address, or if requested by the person, to the person’s e-mail address collected
7 pursuant to this subdivision.

8 (5)(A) The identity, by name, of any other children living in the same
9 home environment as the subject child. The investigator shall consider the
10 physical and emotional condition of those children and may interview them,
11 unless the child is the person who is alleged to be responsible for such abuse
12 or neglect, in accordance with the provisions of subdivision (2) of this
13 subsection (a).

14 (B) The identity, by name, of any other children who may be at risk if
15 the abuse was alleged to have been committed by someone who is not a
16 member of the subject child’s household. The investigator shall consider the
17 physical and emotional condition of those children and may interview them,
18 unless the child is the person who is alleged to be responsible for such abuse
19 or neglect, in accordance with the provisions of subdivision (2) of this
20 subsection (a).

1 Commissioner shall comply with the procedures set forth in section 4916a of
2 this title.

3 (2) In cases involving sexual abuse or serious physical abuse of a child,
4 the Commissioner in ~~his or her~~ the Commissioner's sole judgment may list a
5 substantiated report on the Registry pending any administrative review after:

6 (A) reviewing the investigation file; and

7 (B) making written findings in consideration of:

8 (i) the nature and seriousness of the alleged behavior; and

9 (ii) the person's continuing access to children.

10 (3) A person alleged to have abused or neglected a child and whose
11 name has been placed on the Registry in accordance with subdivision (2) of
12 this subsection shall be notified of the Registry entry, provided with the
13 Commissioner's findings, and advised of the right to seek an administrative
14 review in accordance with section 4916a of this title.

15 (4) If the name of a person has been placed on the Registry in
16 accordance with subdivision (2) of this subsection, it shall be removed from
17 the Registry if the substantiation is rejected after an administrative review.

18 (b) A Registry record means an entry in the Child Protection Registry that
19 consists of the name of an individual whose conduct is substantiated for child
20 abuse or neglect, the date of the finding, the nature of the finding, and at least

1 one other personal identifier, other than a name, listed in order to avoid the
2 possibility of misidentification.

3 (c) The Commissioner shall adopt rules pursuant to 3 V.S.A. chapter 25 to
4 permit use of the Registry records as authorized by this subchapter while
5 preserving confidentiality of the Registry and other Department records related
6 to abuse and neglect.

7 (d) For all substantiated reports of child abuse or neglect made on or after
8 the date the final rules are adopted, the Commissioner shall create a Registry
9 record that reflects a designated child protection level related to the risk of
10 future harm to children. This system of child protection levels shall be based
11 upon an evaluation of the risk the person responsible for the abuse or neglect
12 poses to the safety of children. The risk evaluation shall include consideration
13 of the following factors:

- 14 (1) the nature of the conduct and the extent of the child's injury, if any;
15 (2) the person's prior history of child abuse or neglect as either a victim
16 or perpetrator;
17 (3) the person's response to the investigation and willingness to engage
18 in recommended services; and
19 (4) the person's age and developmental maturity.

1 (e) The Commissioner shall ~~develop~~ adopt rules for the implementation of
2 a system of Child Protection Registry levels for substantiated cases pursuant to
3 3 V.S.A. chapter 25. The rules shall address:

4 (1) when and how names are placed on the Registry;

5 (2) standards for determining a child protection level designation;

6 (3) the length of time a person's name appears on the Registry prior to
7 seeking expungement;

8 ~~(2)~~(4) when and how names are expunged from the Registry;

9 ~~(3)~~(5) whether the person is a juvenile or an adult;

10 ~~(4)~~(6) whether the person was charged with or convicted of a criminal
11 offense arising out of the incident of abuse or neglect; and

12 ~~(5)~~(7) whether a Family Division of the Superior Court has made any
13 findings against the person.

14 (f) [Repealed.]

15 Sec. 6. 33 V.S.A. § 4916a is amended to read:

16 § 4916a. CHALLENGING SUBSTANTIATION OR PLACEMENT ON THE
17 REGISTRY

18 (a) If an investigation conducted in accordance with section 4915b of this
19 title results in a determination that a report of child abuse or neglect should be
20 substantiated, the Department shall notify the person alleged to have abused or
21 neglected a child of the following:

1 (1) the nature of the substantiation decision, and that the Department
2 intends to enter the record of the substantiation into the Registry;

3 (2) who has access to Registry information and under what
4 circumstances;

5 (3) the implications of having one's name placed on the Registry as it
6 applies to employment, licensure, and registration;

7 (4) the Registry child protection level designation to be assigned to the
8 person and the date that the person is eligible to seek expungement based on
9 the designation level;

10 (5) the right to request a review of the substantiation determination or
11 the child protection level designation, or both, by an administrative reviewer,
12 the time in which the request for review shall be made, and the consequences
13 of not seeking a review; ~~and~~

14 ~~(5)(6)~~ the right to receive a copy of the Commissioner's written findings
15 made in accordance with subdivision 4916(a)(2) of this title if applicable; and

16 (7) ways to contact the Department for any further information.

17 (b) Under this section, notice by the Department to a person alleged to have
18 abused or neglected a child shall be by first-class mail sent to the person's last
19 known mailing address, or if requested by the person, to the person's e-mail
20 address collected during the Department's investigation pursuant to
21 subdivision 4915b(a)(4) of this title. The Department shall maintain a record

1 of the notification, including who sent the notification, the date it is sent, and
2 the address to which it is sent.

3 (c)(1) A person ~~alleged to have abused or neglected a child~~ whose conduct
4 is the subject of a substantiation determination may seek an administrative
5 review of the Department's intention to place the person's name on the
6 Registry by notifying the Department within ~~14~~ 30 days ~~of~~ after the date the
7 Department ~~mailed~~ sent notice of the right to review in accordance with
8 subsections (a) and (b) of this section. The Commissioner may grant an
9 extension past the ~~14-day~~ 30-day period for good cause, not to exceed ~~28~~ 60
10 days after the Department has ~~mailed~~ sent notice of the right to review.

11 (2) The administrative review may be stayed upon request of the person
12 ~~alleged to have committed abuse or neglect~~ whose conduct is the subject of a
13 substantiation determination if there is a related case pending in the Criminal
14 or Family Division of the Superior Court that arose out of the same incident of
15 abuse or neglect for which the ~~person~~ person's conduct was substantiated.
16 During the period the review is stayed, the person's name shall be placed on
17 the Registry. Upon resolution of the Superior Court criminal or family case,
18 the person may exercise ~~his or her~~ the person's right to review under this
19 section by notifying the Department in writing within 30 days after the related
20 court case, including any appeals, has been fully adjudicated. If the person

1 fails to notify the Department within 30 days, the Department’s decision shall
2 become final and no further review under this subsection is required.

3 (d)(1) ~~The~~ Except as provided in this subsection, the Department shall hold
4 an administrative review conference within ~~35~~ 60 days ~~of~~ after receipt of the
5 request for review. At least ~~40~~ 20 days prior to the administrative review
6 conference, the Department shall provide to the person requesting review a
7 copy of the redacted investigation file, which shall contain sufficient
8 unredacted information to describe the allegations and the evidence relied upon
9 as the basis of the substantiation, notice of time and place of the conference,
10 and conference procedures, including information that may be submitted and
11 mechanisms for providing information. There shall be no subpoena power to
12 compel witnesses to attend a Registry review conference. The Department
13 shall also provide to the person those redacted investigation files that relate to
14 prior investigations that the Department has relied upon to make its
15 substantiation determination in the case in which a review has been requested.
16 If the Department fails to hold an administrative review conference within 60
17 days after receipt of the request to review, due to good cause shown, an
18 extension may be authorized by the Commissioner or designee in which the
19 basis of the failure is explained.

20 (2) The Department may elect to not hold an administrative review
21 conference when a person who has requested a review does not respond to

1 Department requests to schedule the review meeting or does not appear for the
2 scheduled review meeting. In these circumstances, unless good cause is
3 shown, the Department’s substantiation shall be accepted and the person’s
4 name shall be placed on the Registry. Upon the Department’s substantiation
5 being accepted, the Department shall provide notice that advises the person of
6 the right to appeal the substantiation determination or child protection
7 designation level, or both, to the Human Services Board pursuant to section
8 4916b of this title.

9 (e) At the administrative review conference, the person who requested the
10 review shall be provided with the opportunity to present documentary evidence
11 or other information that supports ~~his or her~~ the person’s position and provides
12 information to the reviewer in making the most accurate decision regarding the
13 allegation. The Department shall have the burden of proving ~~that it has~~
14 ~~accurately and reliably concluded that a reasonable person would believe by a~~
15 preponderance of the evidence that the child has been abused or neglected by
16 that person. Upon the person’s request or during a declared state of emergency
17 in Vermont, the conference may be held ~~by teleconference~~ through a live,
18 interactive, audio-video connection or by telephone.

19 (f) The Department shall establish an administrative case review unit
20 within the Department and contract for the services of administrative
21 reviewers. An administrative reviewer shall be a neutral and independent

1 arbiter who has no prior involvement in the original investigation of the
2 allegation. Department information pertaining to the investigation that is
3 obtained by the reviewer outside of the review meeting shall be disclosed to
4 the person seeking the review.

5 (g) Within seven days ~~of~~ after the conference, the administrative reviewer
6 shall:

7 (1) reject the Department's substantiation determination;

8 (2) accept the Department's substantiation; or

9 (3) place the substantiation determination on hold and direct the

10 Department to further investigate the case based upon recommendations of the
11 reviewer.

12 (h) If the administrative reviewer accepts the Department's substantiation
13 determination, a Registry record shall be made immediately. If the reviewer
14 rejects the Department's substantiation determination, no Registry record shall
15 be made.

16 (i) Within seven days ~~of~~ after the decision to reject or accept or to place the
17 substantiation on hold in accordance with subsection (g) of this section, the
18 administrative reviewer shall provide notice to the person of ~~his or her~~ the
19 reviewer's decision to the person's requested address pursuant to subdivision
20 4915b(a)(4) of this title. If the administrative reviewer accepts the
21 Department's substantiation, the notice shall advise the person of the right to

1 appeal the administrative reviewer’s decision to the human services board in
2 accordance with section 4916b of this title.

3 * * *

4 Sec. 7. 33 V.S.A. § 4916b is amended to read:

5 § 4916b. HUMAN SERVICES BOARD HEARING

6 (a) Within 30 days after the date on which the administrative reviewer
7 ~~mailed~~ sent notice of placement of a report on the Registry, the person who is
8 the subject of the substantiation may apply in writing to the Human Services
9 Board for relief. The Board shall hold a fair hearing pursuant to 3 V.S.A.
10 § 3091. When the Department receives notice of the appeal, it shall make note
11 in the Registry record that the substantiation has been appealed to the Board.

12 * * *

13 Sec. 8. 33 V.S.A. § 4916c is amended to read:

14 § 4916c. PETITION FOR EXPUNGEMENT FROM THE REGISTRY

15 (a)(1) ~~Except as provided in this subdivision~~ Pursuant to rules adopted in
16 accordance with subsection 4916(e) of this title, a person whose name has been
17 placed on the Registry ~~prior to July 1, 2009 and has been listed on the Registry~~
18 ~~for at least three years~~ may file a written request with the Commissioner,
19 seeking a review for the purpose of expunging an individual Registry record or
20 for the purpose of challenging the child protection level designation, or both. ~~A~~
21 ~~person whose name has been placed on the Registry on or after July 1, 2009~~

1 ~~and has been listed on the Registry for at least seven years may file a written~~
2 ~~request with the Commissioner seeking a review for the purpose of expunging~~
3 ~~an individual Registry record.~~ The Commissioner shall grant a review upon
4 request.

5 (2) A person who is required to register as a sex offender on the State's
6 Sex Offender Registry shall not be eligible to petition for expungement of ~~his~~
7 ~~or her~~ the person's Registry record until the person is no longer subject to Sex
8 Offender Registry requirements.

9 (b)(1) The person shall have the burden of proving that a reasonable person
10 would believe that ~~he or she~~ the person no longer presents a risk to the safety
11 or well-being of children.

12 (2) The Commissioner shall consider the following factors in making ~~his~~
13 ~~or her~~ a determination:

14 (A) the nature of the substantiation that resulted in the person's name
15 being placed on the Registry;

16 (B) the number of substantiations;

17 (C) the amount of time that has elapsed since the substantiation;

18 (D) the circumstances of the substantiation that would indicate
19 whether a similar incident would be likely to occur;

20 (E) any activities that would reflect upon the person's changed
21 behavior or circumstances, such as therapy, employment, or education;

1 (F) references that attest to the person’s good moral character; and

2 (G) any other information that the Commissioner deems relevant.

3 (3) The Commissioner may deny a petition for expungement based
4 solely on subdivision (2)(A) or (2)(B) of this subsection.

5 (c) At the review, the person who requested the review shall be provided
6 with the opportunity to present any evidence or other information, including
7 witnesses, that supports ~~his or her~~ the person’s request for expungement. Upon
8 the person’s request or during a declared state of emergency in Vermont, the
9 conference may be held ~~by teleconference~~ through a live, interactive, audio-
10 video connection or by telephone.

11 (d) A person may seek a review under this section ~~no~~ not more than once
12 every 36 months.

13 (e) Within 30 days ~~of~~ after the date on which the Commissioner ~~mailed~~
14 sent notice of the decision pursuant to this section, a person may appeal the
15 decision to the Human Services Board. The notice shall contain specific
16 instructions concerning the information necessary for the person to prepare any
17 future expungement request. The person shall be prohibited from challenging
18 ~~his or her~~ the substantiation at such hearing, and the sole ~~issue~~ issues before the
19 Board shall be whether the Commissioner abused ~~his or her~~ the
20 Commissioner’s discretion in ~~denial of~~ denying the petition for expungement
21 or the petition challenging the child protection level designation. The hearing

1 shall be on the record below, and determinations of credibility of witnesses
2 made by the Commissioner shall be given deference by the Board.

3 * * *

4 Sec. 9. 33 V.S.A. § 4916d is amended to read:

5 § 4916d. AUTOMATIC EXPUNGEMENT OF REGISTRY RECORDS

6 Registry entries concerning a person ~~who~~ whose conduct was substantiated
7 for behavior occurring before the person reached 10 years of age shall be
8 expunged when the person reaches ~~the age of 18~~ years of age, provided that the
9 person has had no additional substantiated Registry entries. ~~A person~~
10 ~~substantiated for behavior occurring before the person reached 18 years of age~~
11 ~~and whose name has been listed on the Registry for at least three years may file~~
12 ~~a written request with the Commissioner seeking a review for the purpose of~~
13 ~~expunging an individual Registry record in accordance with section 4916e of~~
14 ~~this title.~~

15 Sec. 10. 33 V.S.A. § 4922 is amended to read:

16 § 4922. RULEMAKING

17 (a) ~~The Commissioner shall develop rules to implement this subchapter. On~~
18 or before September 1, 2025, the Commissioner shall file proposed rules
19 pursuant to 3 V.S.A. chapter 25 implementing the provisions of this subchapter
20 to become effective on January 1, 2026. These shall include:

- 1 (1) rules setting forth criteria for determining whether to conduct an
2 assessment or an investigation;
- 3 (2) rules setting out procedures for assessment and service delivery;
- 4 (3) rules outlining procedures for investigations;
- 5 (4) rules for conducting the administrative review conference;
- 6 (5) rules regarding access to and maintenance of Department records of
7 investigations, assessments, reviews, and responses; ~~and~~
- 8 (6) rules regarding the tiered Registry as required by section 4916 of this
9 title;
- 10 (7) rules establishing substantiation categories that require entry onto the
11 Registry and alternatives to substantiation that do not require entry onto the
12 Registry;
- 13 (8) rules requiring notice and appeal procedures for alternatives to
14 substantiation;
- 15 (9) rules creating procedures for how substantiation recommendations
16 are made by the Department district offices and how substantiation
17 determinations are made by the Department central office; and
- 18 (10) rules implementing subsections 4916(c) and (e) of this title.

19 * * *

20 Sec. 11. CHILD ABUSE AND NEGLECT; INTERVIEWS; CAPABILITIES;
21 REPORT

